

# COST ADVANTAGES OF AN INTEGRATED DOCUMENTATION APPROACH

William O. Felsman *Litton Systems, Inc.* 

Interactive use of on-line computing terminals is a method of increasing importance in developing or updating programs. Two major advantages are realizable: the turnaround time is decreased by at least one order of magnitude, and the programmer learns to treat the computer not only as a computational device but also as a combination blackboard and library. All additions and updatings are consequently performed directly on disc storage, and the completed program is thus available only in the raw form in which it was developed.

Program cleanup is required before formal documentation. TIDY and SWAP are two programs that assist this function. Figure 1 shows a subroutine that is representative of the kind of source code that can result when using on-line, interactive programming techniques, particularly if full advantage is made of the on-line system by assigning several programmers to related portions of the same task.

The TIDY program reassigns statement numbers in ascending order, with the base number and number increment being defined by the operator. It also generates a standardized, closed-up source language format. Figure 2 shows the RAW subprogram after being processed by TIDY.

|      | SUBROUTINE SUB3( I)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |   |
|------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---|
|      | DIMENSION LARRY(32)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |   |
|      | IFMP1=I                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |   |
|      | 1FMP2= 1073741824                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |   |
|      | F(1)77.10.10                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |   |
| 77   | $l = 1 + 21 \pm 7 \pm 836 \pm 7 + 1$                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |   |
| • •  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |   |
|      | $c_0 = 11$                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |   |
| 10   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |   |
| 10   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |   |
| . 11 | DO 16 J=1,51                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |   |
|      | IF (I - IEMP2)12,88,88                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |   |
| 12   | ARRY(J+ 1)=0                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |   |
|      | GO TO 90                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |   |
| 88   | ARRY(J+1)  = 1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |   |
|      | 1=1-1EMP2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |   |
| 90   | 1 EMP2=1 EMP2/2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |   |
| 16   | CONTINUE                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |   |
|      | L# LEMP1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |   |
|      | UDITE(6 800) (1ADDY(41) 41=1.32                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | ١ |
| 000  | = CODMAT(1Y + (h) = 1 + (h) = 2Y + (h) = 2 | 1 |
| 000  | PURPARIAN, 44411, 10, 411 /20 //                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |   |
|      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |   |
|      | END                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |   |

Figure 1.-RAW subprogram.

Two further transformations are useful for improving the program legibility. First, the equal, plus, and minus operators can be set off by blanks and the variable names can be replaced by others of increased semantic content. Figure 3 shows the TIDY'ed program after being thus processed by SWAP. The format is more pleasing, and the variables now indicate the function they serve. For example, the name of the subroutine BISHOW shows some relation to its function of generating a bit-by-bit printout of the contents of the named variable, and so on.

## PREDOCUMENTED SUBROUTINES

The use of predocumented subroutines in the development of a new

157

FRECEDING PAGE BLANK NOT FILMED

| 12 IARRY(1)=0<br>14 D0 22 J=1,31<br>IF(1-IEMP2)16,18,18<br>16 IARRY(J+1)=0<br>G0 T0 20<br>18 IARRY(J+1)=1<br>I=1-IEMP2<br>20 IEMP2=IEMP2/2<br>22 CONTINUE<br>I=1EMP1<br>WRITE(6,24)(IARRY(J1),J1=1,32)<br>24 FORMAT(1X, 4(411, 1X, 411,2X))<br>DETURN | <pre>12 MEMBIT(1) = 0 14 D0 22 ICOUNT = 1,31 IF(NUMBER - NEXT)16,18,16 16 MEMBIT(ICOUNT + 1) = 0 G0 T0 20 18 MEMBIT(ICOUNT + 1) = 1 NUMBER = NUMBER - NEXT 20 NEXT = NEXT/2 22 CONTINUE NUMBER = NUMSAV VRITE(6,24)(MEMBIT(J1),J1 = 1,32) 24 FORMAT(1X,4(411,1X,411,2X)) DETURN</pre> |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 24 FORMAT(1X, 4(411, 1X, 411, 2X ))                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 24 FORMAT(1X,4(4)1,1X,4(1,2X))                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| RETURN                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | RETURN                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |

Figure 2.-TIDY'ed program.

Figure 3.-TIDY'ed and SWAP'ed program.

Table 1.-List of Common Subroutines

| Compiler | Assembler | LOG2 | SADL | SWAP | TIDY | Subroutine | Definition                                         |
|----------|-----------|------|------|------|------|------------|----------------------------------------------------|
| x        | x         |      |      | x    | x    | PAGE       | Page control                                       |
|          |           | x    | x    | x    | x    | INBUF      | Source language read control                       |
|          |           |      |      | ×    | х    | OUTBUF     | Source language standard out-<br>put format        |
| ×        | x         | x    | x    | X    | x    | MOVER      | Right adjust name                                  |
| x        | x         | x    |      |      |      | MOVEL      | Left adjust name                                   |
|          | x         |      |      | ×    |      | MVLEFT     | Left adjust name, return spaces shifted            |
|          | x         |      |      |      |      | MVRITE     | Right adjust name, return spaces shifted           |
|          | x         | ×    |      | x    | ×    | ILSHFT     | Shift name specified number of places to the left  |
|          | X         | ×    | x    | x    | x    | IRSHFT     | Shift name specified number of places to the right |
|          | х         |      |      | x    |      | IFXPT      | Alpha to integer conversion                        |
|          | х         | x    | x    | x    | x    | DLIMIT     | Delimit a source statement                         |
|          | x         | x    | x    | x    | x    | РАСКЗР     | Terse number equivalence to<br>variable name       |
|          | x         | x    | ×    | x    | X    | РАСКРЗ     | Reassemble names after delimiting                  |
|          | х         |      |      | x    | x    | UNPACQ     | A4 format to A1 format                             |
|          | x         |      |      |      |      | ORDER      | Indirect reference ordering of data                |

-

.

program is a well-known way to greatly reduce the attendant documentation effort at the same time that it reduces the program development time. Table 1 shows the extent to which predocumented subroutines were useful in the development of the operational programs discussed in this paper. The effect is similar to the use of a special higher order language, except that the more powerful operations are defined by subprograms rather than operators.

#### METAPROGRAM CONCEPT

Considerable additional advantage can be obtained if programs are written in a generic manner. For example, in an assembler program for an avionics computer, completion of the truncated operand addresses is normally a function of the attendant instruction. The alternatives might be to use the most significant bits of the instruction counter, to use a maximal length base address register, or to use a minimal base address register. If the usage for each instruction is written into the source code, then modification of the program to perform the assembly function for a second computer requires not only that the source code be redeveloped but also that the documentation be rewritten both at the program level and the user's manual level.

If, on the other hand, the basic program is written to provide for all of these potential choices and the branch chosen for a particular command is determined by a data set including the command mnemonic and a code defining the method of address completion, then this portion of the program needs no rewriting or redocumentation when the target computer is modified or a new target computer developed. Change of the data-set entry table is all that is required, together with the attendant minimal documentation.

This method of identifying significant parameters in a class of programs and then writing a generic program to accommodate these parameters in a defining data set is known as a "metaprogram" approach. That is, the data set is itself in effect a program, written in some very simple interpretive language and consequently has become known as the metaprogram.

Figures 4 and 5 show the metaprograms used for TIDY and SWAP.

The TIDY metaprogram is categorized by an identifying operator and several parameters. These define the start and finish locations within a FORTRAN statement of the series of places where statement numbers occur in that statement. The main program is thus

|       |     |    |   | GO=GO DELIMIT                                |
|-------|-----|----|---|----------------------------------------------|
|       |     |    |   | TO=TO DELIMIT                                |
|       |     |    |   | CALL=CALL DELIMIT                            |
|       |     |    |   | REAL=REAL DELIMIT                            |
|       |     |    |   | INTEGER=INTEGER DELIMIT                      |
|       |     |    |   | SUBROUTINE=SUBROUTINE DELIMIT                |
| DO    | 2   | 2  |   | DIMENSION=DIMENSION DELIMIT                  |
| GO    | 3   | 3  | 1 | DOUBLE=DOUBLE DELIMIT                        |
| GO    | 4   | -4 |   | PRECISION=PRECISION DELIMIT                  |
| GOTO  | 2   | 2  | 1 | DO=DO DELIMIT2                               |
| GOTO  | 3   | -4 |   | COMPLEX=COMPLEX DELIMIT                      |
| I F   | -1  | -1 | 1 | COMMON=COMMON DELIMIT                        |
| 1 F   | - 5 | -1 |   | CYCLE=CYCLE DELIMIT                          |
| CYCLE | 2   | 2  |   | GOTO=DELINITE GO DELIMIT TO DELIMIT DELIMITR |
| READ  | 5   | 5  |   | FOULVALENCE=EOULVALENCE DELIMIT              |
| RITE  | 5   | 5  |   | FUNCTION-FUNCTION DELIMIT                    |
|       |     |    |   |                                              |

Figure 4.-TIDY metaprogram. Figure 5.-SWAP metaprogram.

| STA1   | CLA 2 | 18001212 | 18001010 |
|--------|-------|----------|----------|
| STA1   |       | 18001010 |          |
| LDQ1   | STA2  | 24001212 | 24001010 |
| LDQ1   |       | 24001010 |          |
| CLA 2  | ADD1  | 25012121 | 28001010 |
| CLA2   | SUB1  | 29012121 | 28001010 |
| CLA1   | STA2  | 28001212 | 22001010 |
| CLAI   |       | 28001010 |          |
| CLA2   | MPY1  | 19012121 | 28001010 |
| INC1   | TRZ 2 | 14001515 | 14001010 |
| ST01   | STA2  | 16001212 | 16001010 |
| ST01   |       | 16001010 |          |
| ADD1   | STA2  | 26001212 | 26001010 |
| ADD1   |       | 26001010 |          |
| SUB1   | STA 2 | 27001212 | 27001010 |
| SUB1   |       | 27001010 |          |
| CLA2   | AN41  | 31012121 | 28001010 |
| ANA1   |       | 31001010 | 31001010 |
| CLA2   | ORA1  | 30012121 | 28001010 |
| ORA1   |       | 30001010 | 30001010 |
| CLA2   | DI V1 | 17012121 |          |
| D   V1 |       | 17001010 | 17001010 |
| CLA2   | TRA1  | 00012323 | 00003010 |
| TRA1   |       | 00003010 |          |
| TNZ1   | CLA2  | 01003232 | 01003010 |
| TNZ1   |       | 01003010 |          |
| TZA1   | CLA2  | 05003232 | 05003010 |
| TZA1   |       | 05003010 |          |
| TPA1   | CLA2  | 06003232 | 06003010 |
| TPA1   |       | 06003010 |          |

Figure 6.-Typical assembler metaprogram (partial). specifically directed to the locations where replacement is to occur. Additional statement types can be processed by adding to the metaprogram with no change in either the main program or the documentation associated with it.

The SWAP metaprogram is equally simple. The mnemonic to be replaced occurs to the left of the equal sign, and the replacing mnemonic sequence is to the right of the equal sign. Additional control parameters are included at the right. Thus, DELIMIT indicates a blank is to be inserted after each occurrence of a new variable in the output, and DELIMIT2 indicates that blanks are to be placed after both the replacing variable and the next succeeding variable. Additional control commands close up blocks, remove parentheses, and perform other functions.

This metaprogram is also open-ended, and additional statements in any of several higher order languages can be accommodated by appropriate descriptions in the metaprogram.

In fact, the data representing the desired mnemonic exchange is also treated as a simple continuation of the normal metaprogram.

Figure 6 shows a portion of a metaprogram for an assembler. It consists of a defining mnemonic or mnemonic pair, plus a series of numerals that define the transfers within the main program which control the development of the assembled code for that instruction mnemonic. The assembler program is very nearly invariant for a wide class of computers, consequently documentation of the main program can here, too, be unchanged with new applications. However, the interpretation of the metaprogram by the programmer requires a computer assist to documentation.

Figure 7 shows the metaprogram as processed for semantic clarity, and figure 8 shows a portion of the documentation that relates the metaprogram controls to the operation of the computer arithmetic unit. The matrix documentation shown in figure 8 has been developed to reduce the difficulty in the handling, updating, and correction of bulk data. The matrix documentation program accepts data as a sequential input stream and formats it in both vertical and horizontal directions, with text hyphenation where applicable. Program control cards direct the number and width of the columns. Thus, each entry in any column is separately modifiable, and the program adjusts the full updated data input to maintain the format.

#### INTEGRATED DOCUMENTATION SAVINGS

Two examples of the cost of documentation are shown in table 2.

In each case, the compiler and assembler documentation for a given computer required full page counts of 140 and 95, respectively. However, for all successive applications to

### COST ADVANTAGES OF AN INTEGRATED DOCUMENTATION APPROACH

|       |      |      | 11   | 011 | ZERO | SECO | IDAR'  | Y    |     |      |      | -ZE | RO SI | EC0110 | ARY- |     |            |
|-------|------|------|------|-----|------|------|--------|------|-----|------|------|-----|-------|--------|------|-----|------------|
|       |      |      |      |     | DIR  | ЕСТ  | 1 // D | IREC | т   |      |      |     | DIR   | ECT    | IND  | REC | Т          |
| PRI   | SEC  | NUMB | TYPE | 14  | PRI  | SEC  | PC I   | SEC  | SPR | NUMB | ĩΥΡĘ | В   | PRI   | SEC    | PRI  | SEC | S PR       |
| STA1  | CLA2 | 18   | U    | 0   | 1    | 2    | 1      | 2    | 0   | 18   | e    | C   | 1     | c      | 1    | э   | 0          |
| STA1  |      | 18   | 0    | 0   | 1    | 0    | 1      | , î  | C   | C    | 0    | 6   | С     | 0      | 0    | Э   | ij.        |
| LDQ1  | STA2 | 24   | 0    | 0   | 1    | 2    | 1      | 2    | 0   | 24   | 0    | 0   | 1     | 0      | 1    | C   | С          |
| LDQ1  |      | 24   | Ç    | 0   | 1    | 0    | 1      | 0    | е   | 0    | 0    | Û,  | С     | 0      | C    | 0   | 0          |
| CLA2  | ADD1 | 25   | 0    | 1   | 2    | 1    | 2      | 1    | 0   | 28   | 0    | 0   | 1     | C      | 1    | Q,  | 0          |
| CLA2  | SU81 | 29   | 0    | 1   | 2    | 1    | 2      | 1    | 0   | 28   | C    | 0   | 1     | 0      | 1    | ŋ   | 0          |
| CLA1  | STA2 | 28   | 0    | C   | 1    | 2    | 1      | 2    | 0   | 28   | 0    | 0   | 1     | 0      | 1    | 0   | 0          |
| CLA1  |      | 28   | ۵    | 0   | 1    | 0    | 1      | C    | C   | 0    | С    | 0   | 0     | 0      | 9    | 0   | C,         |
| CLA2  | MPY1 | 19   | 0    | 1   | 2    | 1    | 2      | 1    | 0   | 28   | C    | 0   | 1     | 0      | 1    | 0   | 0          |
| INC1  | TRZ2 | 14   | 0    | 0   | 1    | 5    | 1      | 5    | 0   | 14   | С    | 0   | 1     | 0      | 1    | 0   | 0          |
| STQ1  | STA2 | 16   | 0    | 0   | 1    | 2    | 1      | 2    | 0   | 16   | C    | 0   | 1     | n      | 1    | 0   | 9          |
| STQ1  |      | 16   | 0    | 0   | 1    | 0    | 1      | U    | 0   | 0    | 0    | 0   | C     | 0      | 0    | C   | G          |
| ADD1  | STA2 | 26   | Û٠   | С   | 1    | 2    | 1      | 2    | 0   | 26   | 0    | 0   | 1     | Ð      | 1    | 0   | 0          |
| ADD1  |      | 26   | 0    | 0   | 1    | 0    | 1      | 0    | ŋ   | G    | 0    | 0   | C     | 0      | 0    | 0   | 0          |
| SUB1  | STA2 | 27   | 0    | 0   | 1    | 2    | 1      | 2    | Û   | 27   | 0    | 0   | 1     | C      | 1    | 9   | 0          |
| SUB1  |      | 27   | ο    | 0   | 1    | C    | 1      | C    | 0   | Ű    | 0    | 0   | 0     | 6      | 6    | U   | 0          |
| CLA2  | ANAl | 31   | 0    | 1   | 2    | 1    | 2      | 1    | 0   | 28   | 0    | C   | 1     | e      | 1    | 0   | 0          |
| ANA1  |      | 31   | 0    | 0   | 1    | 0    | 1      | 0    | 0   | 31   | 0    | 0   | 1     | 0      | 1    | C   | 0          |
| CLA2  | ORA1 | 30   | U    | 1   | 2    | 1    | 2      | 1    | 0   | 28   | Э    | 0   | 1     | 0      | 1    | 0   | 0          |
| ORA1  |      | 30   | 0    | 0   | 1    | 0    | 1      | 0    | 0   | 30   | C    | Ð   | 1     | Û      | 1    | 0   | 0          |
| CLA2  | DIV1 | 17   | 0    | 1   | 2    | 1    | 2      | 1    | 0   | 0    | υ    | 0   | 0     | 0      | 0    | υ   | C          |
| DIV1  |      | 17   | 0    | G   | 1    | 0    | 1      | 0    | 0   | 17   | 0    | 0   | 1     | 0      | 1    | ΰ   | 0          |
| CLA2  | TRA1 | C    | 0    | 1   | 2    | 3    | 2      | 3    | 0   | 0    | 0    | 0   | 3     | 0      | 1    | С   | <i>'</i> , |
| TRA1  |      | 0    | 0    | 0   | 3    | 0    | 1      | 0    | 0   | 0    | 0    | 0   | IJ    | 0      | 0    | 0   | 0          |
| THZ 1 | CLA2 | 1    | 0    | 0   | 3    | 2    | 3      | 2    | 0   | 1    | 0    | 0   | 3     | 0      | 1    | 0   | 0          |
| TNZ 1 |      | 1    | 0    | 0   | 3    | 0    | 1      | 0    | 0   | 0    | 0    | 0   | 0     | 0      | 0    | 0   | 0          |
| TZA1  | CLA2 | 5    | 0    | 0   | 3    | 2    | 3      | 2    | 0   | 5    | 0    | 0   | 3     | 0      | 1    | 0   | 0          |
| TZA1  |      | 5    | 0    | 0   | 3    | 0    | 1      | 0    | 0   | 0    | 0    | 0   | 0     | 0      | C    | 0   | 0          |
| TPA1  | CLA2 | 6    | 0    | 0   | 3    | 2    | 3      | 2    | 0   | 6    | 0    | ٥   | 3     | 0      | 1    | C   | 0          |
| TPA1  |      | 6    | 0    | 0   | 3    | 0    | 1      | 0    | 0   | 0    | 0    | 0   | 0     | 0      | 0    | 0   | C          |

Figure 7.-Processed assembler metaprogram (partial).

| CUDE   | NREPONIC                     | INSTRUCTION CONDITIONS<br>ML AND M2 FIELC USED<br>NU INCIRECT AGLRESS                           | INSTRUCTION CUNDITIONS<br>A1 FIELD CNLY<br>NU INUIRECT ADDRESS                               | I INSTRUCTIUN CONDITIUNS<br>I MI AND M2 FIELD USED<br>I INDIRECT ADDRESSING                             | INSTRUCTION CONDITIONS<br>MIFIELD ONLY<br>INDIRECT ADDRESSING                        |
|--------|------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| CCC1   | <br>  TRA ML<br>  LLA M2<br> | (M2+dARL)> A<br>(M2+dARL)> A<br>PACK(PC, dAR(7))>UED<br>ML+PCS> PC<br>                          | <br>  PACKIPL,BAR(7) >DED<br>  ML+PCS> PC<br>  Q> Q<br>  BARL> BARL<br>  BARS> BARS          | <br>  [[M2+BARL]]> A<br>  PACKIPC.BARI7]]>DED<br>  M1+PCS> PC<br>  Q> Q<br>  BARL> BARL<br>  BARS> BARS | PACK(PC,BAR(71)>DED<br>(M1+BARS)> PC<br>Q> Q.<br>BARL> BARL<br>BARS> BARS            |
| 5633   | TNZ M1<br>CLA M2             | P1+PCS>PC (A AON O)<br>(P2+BAAL1> A<br>PACK(PC,BAR(7))>DED<br>O> U<br>BPRL> BARL<br>BARS> BARS  | MI+PCS>PC (A NCN 0)<br>PACK(PC,BAR(7))>DED<br>Q> Q<br>PARL> BARL<br>BARL> BARL<br>BARS> BARS | f M1+PCS>PC (A NON O)<br>(142+BARL}}> A<br>PACK(PC,BAR{7})>DED<br>Q> Q<br>BARL> BARL<br>BARS> BARS      | (M1+BARS)>PC(A NO O)<br>PACKIPC,BAR(73)>DED<br>Q> Q<br>BARL> BARL<br>BARS> BARS      |
| (CC3   | LBR M2<br>TRA ML             | M2> 8AN (7 dils)<br>ML+PCS(NEK)> PC<br>C -> 0<br>BARL(NEN)> BAFL<br>BARL(NEN)> BAHS<br>PC+L> PL | (M1+PCS(ULD))> PC<br>0> Q<br>BARL(ULD)> BARL<br>BARS(DLU)> BARS<br>PC+1> PC                  | (M2+BARL)> BAR(7)<br>ML+PCS(NEW)> PC<br>Q> Q<br>BARL(NEW)> BARL<br>BARS(NEW)> BARS                      | ({M1+8AR5(0L0)))>PC<br>0> 0<br>BARL(0L0)> BARL<br>RARS(0L0)> BARS                    |
| 1.324  | SPC M1<br>CLA M2             | (DED)> (A1+8AKS)<br>(M2+8AHL)> A<br>Q> ↓<br>BAKL> BARL<br>HARS> BARS<br>PC+L> PC                | (DED)> (M1+BARS)<br>G> U<br>BARL> BARL<br>EARS> BARS<br>PC+1> PC                             | (DED)> (ML+BARS)<br>((MZ+BARL))> A<br>Q> Q<br>BARL> BARL<br>BARS> BARS<br>PC+L> PC                      | (DED)> ((ML+BARS))<br>Q> Q<br>BARL> BARL<br>BARS> BARL<br>PC+1> PC                   |
| caes   | 586 M2<br>Tra M1             | (Δ)> («2+ξΔκς)<br>PAGK(PC,BAK(7))>DED<br>M1+PCS> PC<br>Ų> C<br>BARL> bARL<br>BARS> BARS         | PACK(PC,BAK(7))>DED<br>MIPCS> PC<br>Q> Q<br>PARL> BARL<br>BARS> BARS                         | (A1> ((M2+BAHL))<br>  PACK(PC,BAH(7))>DED<br>  M1+PCS> PC<br>  Q> Q<br>  BARL> BARL<br>  BARS> BARS     | PACK(PC+BAR{71}>DED<br>  M +BARS)> PC<br>  0> Q<br>  BARL> BARL  <br>  BARS> BARS    |
| (CC2)  | 12A M1<br>CLA M2             | (M2+3A6L)> A<br>PACK(PC,BAN(7))>UEU<br>M1+PCS>PL (A+U)<br>C> C<br>BARL> BARL<br>BARS> BARS      | PACK(PC,BAR(7))>DED<br>MI+PCS>PC (A=O)<br>U> C<br>PARL> BARL<br>BARS> BARS                   | (142+BARL1)> A<br>PACK(PC,BAR(7)1>OED<br>M1PPCS>PC (A=O)<br>U> Q<br>BARL> BARL<br>BARS> BARS            | PACKIPC,BAR17)]>DED  <br> N +BARS)>PC (A=O)  <br>U> Q<br>BARL> BARL  <br>BARS> BARS  |
| i ccc7 | TPA ML<br>CLA M2             | (M2+CARL)> A<br>PACKIPC,8AH(7})>DEC<br>M(4PCS>PC (A*+)<br>L> Q<br>BARL> BARL<br>BARS> BARS      | PACK1PC.BAN(7)]>DED<br>*14PC3>PC (A=+)<br>> C<br>BARL> BARL<br>BARS> BARS                    | (142+8ARL))> A<br>PACK(PC.8AR(7))>DED<br>M1+PCS>PC (A*+)<br>U> U<br>BARL> BARL<br>BARS> BARS            | PACKIPC.6AR [7]]>DED  <br>(N]+8ARS)>PC [A=+]  <br>Q> 0<br>BARL> BARL  <br>BARS> BARS |

Figure 8.-Matrix documentation of assembler metaprogram (partial).

-

ست... ـ سم

:

-

í

| Documentation stage     | Compiler | Assembler |
|-------------------------|----------|-----------|
| Theory of operation     | 70       | 40        |
| Flowcharts              | 30       | 30        |
| Description of charts   | 30       | 20        |
| Metaprogram description | 10       | 5         |
| Total                   | 140      | 95        |

Table 2.-Documentation Page Count

| NameBasic<br>program<br>length<br>(lines)Total<br>program<br>length<br>(lines)Development<br>time<br>(man-months)Separable<br>program-<br>program-<br>program-<br>programaData<br>program-<br>subroutinesa                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Predocumented<br>subroutines <sup>a</sup> |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------|
| TIDY (statement 229         686         0.75         0.334         0.052         0.015           number reorder)         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0         0 <t< td=""><td>0.599</td></t<> | 0.599                                     |
| SADL (reliability model)         475         816         1.5         .590         .025         .007                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | .378                                      |
| LOG2 (logic 515 857 1.5 .602 .000 .003 simulator)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | .395                                      |
| SWAP (mnemonic         210         637         .5         .330         .000         .024           exchange)         637         .5         .330         .000         .024                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | .646                                      |
| Memory allocator 587 887 3 .662 .025 .016                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | .298                                      |
| Assembler 829 2193 5.5 .378 .077 .063                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | .282                                      |
| Compiler         1216         1690         24         .720         .063         .200                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | .017                                      |

Table 3.-Program Organization Statistics, Source Code

<sup>a</sup>Proportions of total programs.

differing computers, the compiler required only a new description of the metaprogram, and the assembler, which was less completely organized into a generic program, required a new metaprogram description plus about 30 percent of the other page counts.

Some indication of the savings to be gained by the use of predocumented subroutine and metaprogram data-set techniques can be seen in table 3, which gives the relative usage of these methods for a variety of programs. Documentation savings run typically from 30 to 60 percent on the initial program development. However, the use of subprograms has a major effect upon the program cost itself. Table 3 tabulates the number of lines of source code for the programs investigated together with the development time for these programs. These programs were developed by a group of five people, of consistent skill level, working both individually and as members of small teams. A plot of these data is shown in figure 9.

The most significant aspect of the graph is that it shows an exponential growth of development time with the length of the basic program. The basic program consists of the main program plus such program-peculiar subroutines as are conceptually involved with the main program in a highly complex manner. Thus, implementation of an integrated



Figure 9.-Program development time.

documentation approach, which suggests the use of small, preferably predocumented, subprogram elements is not inconsistent with the program design cycle, which also shows greater efficiency in the time of program development when appropriate organization permits the size of the basic program to be reduced.

## **MODIFICATION**

Figure 10 shows the advantages resulting from the use of the integrated documentation approach when it was necessary to modify an existing assembler to accommodate a new computer. Two basic programs were available for modification, one with both subroutines and a metaprogram, the other being predominantly large program elements. Eighty-five percent of the source code from the integrated approach was applicable, whereas only 40 percent of the unitized code could be reused.

Figure 10 also shows the costs associated with the two modifications. The unitized code changeover was estimated at 15 man-months. The actual cost to update the program using an integrated documentation approach was 2 man-months.

Further cost savings are shown in table 4. Here, the effect of the metaprogram is detailed. The cost of modification from one target computer to another is compared to the



Figure 10.–Program modification comparison (assembler program).

| Program type | Data set proportion<br>in source code | Rate of cost of<br>modification to new<br>program design |
|--------------|---------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------|
| Compiler     | 0.20                                  | 0.1                                                      |

.3

Table 4.-Integrated Documentation Effects on Program Modification

cost of a new program design for the new target computer. Examples are given for a compiler and an assembler.

.06

The compiler, which makes extensive use of a metaprogram, can be modified to accommodate a new target computer at one-tenth the cost of writing a new compiler program. Modifications are almost entirely to the metaprogram. The assembler, which uses a less welldeveloped metaprogram but which does make extensive use of common subroutines, can be modified to accommodate a new target computer at about one-third the cost of developing a new assembler program.

### **RUNNING TIME**

Assembler

Run time of production programs developed using the integrated documentation approach would appear at first consideration to be somewhat higher than the run times of similar programs written in unitized code. This is because the use of prepackaged subroutines implies a close, but not exact, fit between the requirement and the package and because of the extra time required to execute the branch statements implied by metaprogram techniques.

However, the integrated documentation approach tends to segment a program into functionally consistent elements with minimal communication required between them and consequently parallels good programming practice. The result is that the total program size is somewhat reduced, values from 10 to 30 percent being typical. Smaller programs, using less core, generally are charged a lesser main frame usage rate. This lesser rate compensates for the longer execution time.

#### CONCLUSION

An integrated documentation approach using predocumented subroutines and metaprogram techniques is a very efficient means of not only generating the relevant documentation but also of reducing program development costs.

#### DISCUSSION

**MEMBER OF THE AUDIENCE:** Do you use this approach on all your programs? In other words, do you think that all programs are divisible into small metaprograms?

FELSMAN: Yes, they are divisible, but we do not always do it because occasionally you run into someone who wants something in a hurry. Then we simply write in a standard fashion as rapidly as we can. It is a one-of-a-kind thing, and we do not worry about documentation. But for big problems like compilers, assemblers, and memory allocators, we go through the process and do indeed break it out, use our regular subroutines, and always write data-set-wise or metaprogram-wise. It is much more convenient.

MEMBER OF THE AUDIENCE: I think your presentation answered the question raised by Gridley yesterday about whether we should put emphasis on subroutines or smaller parts. At that time we did not really respond to his question on the panel, and I think we should have because it is an asset not only in developing programs but in distributing programs to other people to use. If you are going to use an entire program without modifying it, fine. But when you develop programs, I think your point is valid that it takes less time to develop a new program from well-documented subroutines or metaprograms than it does to modify an existing program to make it work on a computer other than the one for which the program was written.

**MEMBER OF THE AUDIENCE**: You implied that this was for a given set of target computers.

FELSMAN: Yes. In this case they happen to be all airborne computers.

**MEMBER OF THE AUDIENCE:** Have you considered it for a general-purpose type of computer in a general-purpose environment?

FELSMAN: As far as I can tell, we have investigated other military computers like the AN/UYK-7, which is a very powerful floating-point machine very similar to some of our commercial machines, and we wrote a metaprogram for that using this compiler. I think the answer to your question is yes, although not unequivocally.

**MEMBER OF THE AUDIENCE:** Presume a manufacturer has provided this to us, but our problem is related to application programs. Can this be applied there?

**FELSMAN:** You have a more difficult task because you have to find the common parameters from application to application. If you can find any, you can do it. If they are not immediately evident, maybe you cannot do it.

1

166