

Halophytes, Algae, and Bacteria Food and Fuel Feedstocks

R.C. Hendricks Glenn Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio

D.M. Bushnell Langley Research Center, Hampton, Virginia

NASA STI Program . . . in Profile

Since its founding, NASA has been dedicated to the advancement of aeronautics and space science. The NASA Scientific and Technical Information (STI) program plays a key part in helping NASA maintain this important role.

The NASA STI Program operates under the auspices of the Agency Chief Information Officer. It collects, organizes, provides for archiving, and disseminates NASA's STI. The NASA STI program provides access to the NASA Aeronautics and Space Database and its public interface, the NASA Technical Reports Server, thus providing one of the largest collections of aeronautical and space science STI in the world. Results are published in both non-NASA channels and by NASA in the NASA STI Report Series, which includes the following report types:

- TECHNICAL PUBLICATION. Reports of completed research or a major significant phase of research that present the results of NASA programs and include extensive data or theoretical analysis. Includes compilations of significant scientific and technical data and information deemed to be of continuing reference value. NASA counterpart of peer-reviewed formal professional papers but has less stringent limitations on manuscript length and extent of graphic presentations.
- TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM. Scientific and technical findings that are preliminary or of specialized interest, e.g., quick release reports, working papers, and bibliographies that contain minimal annotation. Does not contain extensive analysis.
- CONTRACTOR REPORT. Scientific and technical findings by NASA-sponsored contractors and grantees.
- CONFERENCE PUBLICATION. Collected

papers from scientific and technical conferences, symposia, seminars, or other meetings sponsored or cosponsored by NASA.

- SPECIAL PUBLICATION. Scientific, technical, or historical information from NASA programs, projects, and missions, often concerned with subjects having substantial public interest.
- TECHNICAL TRANSLATION. Englishlanguage translations of foreign scientific and technical material pertinent to NASA's mission.

Specialized services also include creating custom thesauri, building customized databases, organizing and publishing research results.

For more information about the NASA STI program, see the following:

- Access the NASA STI program home page at http://www.sti.nasa.gov
- E-mail your question via the Internet to *help@* sti.nasa.gov
- Fax your question to the NASA STI Help Desk at 301–621–0134
- Telephone the NASA STI Help Desk at 301-621-0390
- Write to: NASA Center for AeroSpace Information (CASI) 7115 Standard Drive Hanover, MD 21076–1320



Halophytes, Algae, and Bacteria Food and Fuel Feedstocks

R.C. Hendricks Glenn Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio

D.M. Bushnell Langley Research Center, Hampton, Virginia

National Aeronautics and Space Administration

Glenn Research Center Cleveland, Ohio 44135

Trade names and trademarks are used in this report for identification only. Their usage does not constitute an official endorsement, either expressed or implied, by the National Aeronautics and Space Administration.

This work was sponsored by the Fundamental Aeronautics Program at the NASA Glenn Research Center.

Level of Review: This material has been technically reviewed by technical management.

Available from

NASA Center for Aerospace Information 7115 Standard Drive Hanover, MD 21076–1320 National Technical Information Service 5285 Port Royal Road Springfield, VA 22161

Available electronically at http://gltrs.grc.nasa.gov

Halophytes, Algae, and Bacteria Food and Fuel Feedstocks

R.C. Hendricks National Aeronautics and Space Administration Glenn Research Center Cleveland, Ohio 44135

D.M. Bushnell National Aeronautics and Space Administration Langley Research Center Hampton, Virginia 23681

Summary

The constant demand for increased energy, freshwater, and food stresses our ability to meet these demands within reasonable cost and impact on climate change while sustaining quality of life. This environmental Triangle of Conflicts between energy, food, and water, while provoked by anthropogenic monetary and power struggles, can also be resolved through an anthropogenic paradigm shift in how we produce and use energy, water, and food. With world population (6.6 billion) projected to increase 40 percent in 40 to 60 yr, proper development of saline agriculture and aquaculture is required, as 43 percent of the Earth's landmass is arid or semi-arid and 97 percent of the Earth's water is seawater. Using diverse arid areas with a total size equivalent to the Sahara desert, 8.6×10^8 hectare, it is shown that

(1) Developing biomass to its theoretical limits with 230 W/m² daily solar incident radiation could produce 6 kQ/yr (1 quad (Q) = 10^{15} Btu), or 13 times the world energy consumption (World Q) in 2004 of approximately 446.4 Q.

(2) State-of-the-art CO_2 -force-fed algae systems with 10 percent useful product (2g/m² per day) could produce 24 percent of the World Q (year 2004). In theory, these ponds or ponds co-located with flue gas desulphurization (FGD) CO_2 recovery system power plants could produce well over 10 times that, or over 2.4 times World Q (2004).

(3) Low-maintenance, low-capital-cost halophyte agriculture could produce 7.1 Q/yr seed-oil petroleum equivalent (assuming no processing losses).

(4) Converting half of the halophyte cellulosic biomass to an oil could produce an additional 90.5 Q/yr petroleum equivalent (no processing losses).

(5) Biomass oils having nutritional values are best suited as food feedstocks, and the cellulosic material as both fuel and food feedstocks.

(6) It is important to return proper residue proportions to the soil to help maintain soil carbon and fertility. A goal would be terra preta soils while mitigating risks associated with biomass containment.

Entire community life cycle saline agriculture and aquaculture is being developed. Such communities could free up freshwater and arable land for food with an abundance of energy, favorably impacting the environmental Triangle of Conflicts (energy, food, and water) and reducing harmful emissions including particulates.

The consequences of inaction in controlling the Triangle of Conflicts with attendant emissions peaking and levels are shown to have graphic similarities to those found in the Permian and dinosaur periods—each of which led to mass extinction. We are now dealing with existential issues.

Introduction

Humanity is locked into an environmental Triangle of Conflicts between energy, food, and water (ref. 1) that is in dire need of resolution. Almost daily there is news about ever-increasing demands, starving people, threatened freshwater resources, climate change, and catastrophic storms all in various states of crisis. What is happening? What is driving all these problems?

Anthropogenic global climatic changes are being driven by energy demands, depletion of freshwater resources as well as atmospheric, soil, freshwater, and seawater pollution. There is increasing desertification. Also, sea levels are rising faster than anticipated and oceans are warming, which are threatening the release of methane (20 times worse than CO_2 as a greenhouse gas) that is currently stranded in hydrate form both in the ocean and permafrost regions (ref. 2). Current CO_2 levels and rate of increase mimic those for the Permian and dinosaur periods of mass extinction. Humanity must respond to such an existential matter because the consequences of inaction can be devastating, as noted in the appendix.

We are a planet in transition:

(1) Our world population of 6.6 billion (B) (2007) is projected to increase 40 percent to over 9 B in 2050.

(2) Feeding these people with conventional agriculture will require a 40-percent increase in Earth's arable land or equivalent productivity increases.

(3) Developing countries are seeing major market growth, demanding unprecedented increases in energy, water, and food.

(4) Aviation petroleum-based fuel consumption alone is anticipated to grow 4 percent per yr and in 5 yr will require 116 B gal/yr to meet that demand (approx. 95B gal/yr, 2007).

(5) The world energy consumption (World Q) is projected to grow to 600 quad (Q).

The question humanity is asking or needs to be asking is, "is their a way, or ways, to provide for our food and energy needs, while conserving freshwater, and still have a positive benefit on global climate?" While it will require a paradigm shift in the way we use and invest in our natural resources, the short answer is, "Yes!"

Biomass¹ is one of the Earth's most abundant natural resources that directly addresses humanity's concerns over global resources for energy, food, and freshwater—the Triangle of Conflicts—and climatic changes.

Biomass and its processing involves multiple stages from planting to harvesting with competitive demands between the freshwater and agricultural resources used as food and those used for fuel. Some processed biomass is more suitable for human and animal foods and others for fuels such as biodiesel or alcohols. Nontoxic seed oils, for example, are more suitable as food, and the post-processing residuals as either animal foods or fuel feedstocks. Processed seed-oil residuals are often the more valuable of the products. Biomass not suitable for either human or animal food because of toxicity, high cellulose, or simply bad taste, are more suitable for fuels assuming toxicity and environmental issues are resolved. In either case, any unresolved issues regarding their toxicity and/or environmental harm—or that from products released either during their processing into fuel or combustion of the fuel—degrades economic value.

Adding to this competition are the stresses of climate change and demands upon our arable land areas that supply our food. These lands are at risk or are affected by salinity, which is caused by shallow or rising water tables, underground pumping, and other factors such as pollution by nondegradable materials. Considering that approximately 43 percent of the Earth's landmass is arid or semi-arid and 97 percent of the Earth's water is seawater, these vast natural resources should be properly utilized.

¹The term "biomass" is not restricted to mean plant matter converted to biofuels; rather, herein we will refer to biomass as the biological material produced from environmental carbon (e.g., CO₂), water, and nutrients via photosynthesis; that is, inorganic carbon is converted to organic carbon. Examples include sugarcane, soybeans, *Salicornia*, algae, and bacteria, where the primary product is juice, seed oils, or cellular oils; the secondary product, process residuals, can be cost-effective food or fuel sources; and the resultant cellulosic waste can be a fuel source or soil conditioner. Other biomass sources such as *Jatropha* (toxic) are nonfood sources, and the seed oils and cellulosic matter could be modified and be processed to fuel sources.

In light of this, we seek alternatives in plants that thrive in brackish and saltwater with the ability to survive in arid lands. The development and application of these plants (halophytes) become the primary focus. Herein we introduce some not-so-familiar halophytes and present a few of their benefits, cite a few research projects (including some on the alternatives algae and bacteria), and then set theoretical limits on biomass production followed by projections in terms of world energy demands. It is realized that the introduction of new biomass agriculture and aquaculture methods will entail control and containment risks (ref. 3). Based on diverse arid lands with a total size equivalent to the Sahara desert (8.6×10^8 ha, or 2.1×10^9 acres),² these projections show that halophyte agriculture³ and algae systems can provide for World Q.

It is also recognized there are costs required for a paradigm shift in the way mankind uses and invests in natural resources, and of course production does not come without cost. There are a multitude of cost metrics (ref. 5), however; thus the primary focus of this report will be biomass production, as it is considered bad form to emphasize cost over our planet's sick bed.

Halophytes

Halophytes are saltwater-tolerant plants. Among these many plants, three potential biomass candidates—an annual, a perennial, and a grass, respectively—include

(1) Salicornia bigelovii (fig. 1), a leafless annual salt-marsh plant with green jointed, succulent stems that is indigenous to the U.S. Southwest (ref. 6) and is cultivated along the Arabian Sea coasts of Pakistan and India on the margin of salt lakes and Sri Lanka (Celon) (ref. 7) and other parts of the world. Similar



Figure 1.—*Salicornia bigelovii* (glasswort species). From reference 6. Permission applied for, 1 Feb 2007.

²1 hectare (ha) = 2.471 acre, 1 ha = 10 000 m², and 1 km² = 100 ha.

³Many other saltwater-tolerant plant projects are supported through the International Center for Biosaline Agriculture (ref. 4).

	LIAKE	n nom iei. /a.j		
Fatty acids	Salicornia bigelovii	Safflower	Soybean ^{a,b}	
			Commercial	Refined
C16:0 palmitic	7.52±0.24	6.70±0.25	11	11.76
107	(7.00 to 8.50)	(6.03 to 7.81)		
C18:0 stearic	1.45±0.07	2.50±0.10	4.1	4.64
	(1.24 to 1.69)	(2.05 to 3.00)		
C18:1 oleic	13.42±0.56	12.30±0.70	22	24.98
	(12.33 to 16.83)	(9.50 to 15.70)		
C18:2 linoleic ω^6	75.50±2.04	78.00±3.50	54	55.41
	(74.66 to 79.49)	(73.60 to 80.04)		
C18:3 linolenic ω^3	1.98±0.09		7.5	3.8
	(1.50 to 2.30)			

TABLE I.—PERCENTAGE ACID CONTENT OF SEED OILS

^aReference 14, http://chinese-school.netfirms.com/soybean-composition.html, soybean commercial products.
^bReference 15, http://www.scielo.br/scielo.php?pid=S0103-90162005000300014&script=sci_arttext, soybean refined oil.



Figure 2.—Seashore mallow flowering and setting seed (see refs. 16 and 17).

varieties have been developed and are grown by Hodges (ref. 8), Glenn (ref. 6), and Yensen (refs. 9 to 11) (see also refs. 1, 12, and 13). Hodges (Seawater Foundation, ref. 13) has several hundred hectares under development. The "fatty" acid (nutritional) values of three oils are addressed in table I, which shows, for example, *Salicornia* oil comparable to safflower oil, which is known to benefit cardiovascular health. However, large field trials with subsequent processing for *Salicornia* oils are currently lacking.

(2) Seashore mallow, *Kosteletzkya virginica* (KV), a perennial among the many saltwater-tolerant plants that grow in the wilds of coastal marshlands or inland brackish lakes (fig. 2). With the rise of sea levels due to glacial melt imperiling seashores, halophytes and saltwater algae are being looked upon as major sources of food and fuel feedstocks (ref. 1).

Schill (ref. 18) reports that a 2.5-acre developing test plot of seashore mallow produced 13 bu/acre of seed in a very dry season (fig. 3). The oil content of seashore mallow is also similar to that of soybeans (about 18 percent) with a fatty acid composition more like cottonseed. Seliskar and Gallagher (ref. 16) have presented a one-page summary of this work. The concept is to establish a carefree crop: enter the field once to plant or apply fertilizer and/or pre-emergent and once to harvest.

(3) *Distichlis spicata*, a halophyte grass (fig. 4). Halophyte grasses are being planted in response to saline-affected lands. In the year 2000, Australia had an estimated 5.7 million saline-affected hectares with potential to reach 17 million ha $(170\ 000\ \text{km}^2)$ by 2050 (ref. 20).



Figure 3.—Seashore mallow seeds (ref. 18; see also ref. 16).



Figure 4.—Halophyte grass Distichlis spicata (from ref. 19).

Distichlis spicata is most suited to the high temperatures and high-radiation regimes during the warm summer months of southern Australia (M.R. Sargeant, 2008, Department of Agricultural Sciences, La Trobe University, Bundoora, VIC 3086, Australia, private communication (see also ref. 21)). This species not only has the ability to grow and spread in saline waterlogged soils, but also produces valuable green feed in moist saline discharge soils during the summer period. Such forage has real value for mixed-farming biomass systems.

Arid-area halophytes are being studied as potential sources of biofuels that do not compete with agricultural resources devoted to food production (ref. 22; Amram Eshel (http://www.tau.ac.il/~amram/) and Yoav Waisel (waisel@post.tau.ac.il), 2007, Tel Aviv University, Israel, communications on Israeli halophytes; and Moshe Silberbush, 2007, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, personal communication). In the deserts of the world, areas that are not currently under cultivation could become productive using saline or reclaimed water. Even the so-called second-generation plants—castor beans and Jathropha—will not grow well under arid conditions, yet over 50 t/ha/yr dry biomass has been achieved under desert conditions and reclaimed water irrigation. Until efficient methods for cellulose degradation are available, these could be used for earning Clean Development Mechanism (CDM) credits (ref. 23) by afforestation projects in developing countries and proper management of soil carbon and remediation practices (ref. 24). The low investment costs for halophyte production could mean that they would be ideal economically and agriculturally.

Algae Research

Realizing the availability of seawater and arid land, that "there is only 0.03 percent CO_2 in our (lower) atmosphere and on this thin thread hangs our very existence" (ref. 25), and that increasing that concentration also increases biomass productivity, we begin to force feed biomass to produce both food and fuel.

Mituya et al. (ref. 26) reported on a combustor gas generator pilot plant. The algae beds were CO_{2} -force-fed, covered-trough systems, citing 3.5 g/m²-day average biomass growth. In 1952, Arthur D. Little (ref. 27) reported on pilot plants and economics of biomass culture of algae systems where the algae were force fed bottled CO_2 mixed with air.

Force feeding usually requires co-location with a CO_2 source (e.g., a power plant, large-capacity CO_2 tanks, or pipelines). Further, whether open- or covered-pond or forced-fed systems, some algae are hardy, some are delicate, and some are better suited for food or specialized products. Delicate algae are not very tolerant to variations in their nutrient and CO_2 supply or their environment (e.g., temperature, salinity, density, mechanical stress, pH, etc.). Their yields and product quality can drop dramatically and are often wiped out by predators or other algal species. However, there are others that are hardy and can withstand these variations without much loss in yield and are more suitable for fuel production or that will permit more contaminates and less restraints in terms of food production.

Current algae issues are very nicely covered by Ben-Amotz (ref. 28, unpublished), who considered an operational algae plant and investigated processes and methods to reduce associated costs. Agreements between producers, processors, and marketers are plentiful; for example, Inventurechem.com has a collaboration with Seambiotic Ltd. and the Israel Electric Corp. AlgaTech in Israel (ref. 29) and Earthrise Nutritionals LLC in Calipatria, California, U.S.A. (ref. 30), are commercial food suppliers with a large industry in Indonesia supplying food supplements to Japan.

A nonfood algae production analysis presented at the San Francisco Algal Summit (ref. 28, unpublished) shows a 50:1 cost reduction using CO₂ stackgas from FGD⁴-Power Station, Ashkelon, Israel (431 mt/hr CO₂, or 10 344 mt/day CO₂), with average mid-large station at 4000 mt/hr CO₂; algae raceway ponds were co-located with the power plant. In round numbers, 2 kg biomass requires 1 kg water and 3 kg CO₂ plus maybe up to 1 kg nitrogen (N) nutrient fertilizers (questionable). For complete capture and stoichiometric conversion, a natural-gas-fired powerplant producing 4000 mt/hr CO₂ has the potential to

⁴Flue gas desulfurization.

produce 2660 mt/hr biomass while consuming 1330 mt/hr water; this is equivalent to 16 000 mt biomass produced, using 7980 mt water and about 8000 mt N nutrients each day, assuming 6 hr/day of production and the 18 hr of excess CO_2 produced would require sequestration. Here, the need for higher cost phosphorous (P) is reduced, and the use of seawater would provide up to 80 percent of the essential nutrients.

The VertiGro system (ref. 31) and those of Rodolfi et al. (ref. 32) essentially turn a flat-surface greenhouse into a greenhouse with a series of vertical surfaces for biomass production. Flat or vertical-surface greenhouse systems are similar to the more common uniformly spaced horizontal or vertical tubular bioreactors where specialized biomass such as algae are used for food supplements or additives. One still requires ample sunlight, nutrients, contaminant control, and CO₂ as discussed by Dimitrov (ref. 33) for a similar scaleable modular photobioreactor system. Nevertheless, overcoming the light saturation effects (LSE) are to some extent aided by vertical greenhouse systems (ref. 34). (See also other algae sources; e.g., http://www.algalbiomass.org/ and http://www.nationalalgaeassociation.com/.)

Bacteria Research

Cyanobacteria are some of the oldest bacterial forms known and are found in almost any habitat on Earth. The chloroplast, which enables plants and algae food production, facilitates an endosymbiotic relation between cyanobacteria living within plant or algae cells. The bacterial genomes are thus easier to modify than algae and higher plants. They can fix both nitrogen and carbon with energy obtained through photosynthesis (refs. 35 to 37).

Bacteria are prolific and reproduce rapidly. With proper conditioning in terms of nutrients, CO_2 , and so forth, they can be harvested daily. Their maturation cycle corresponds to the solar day; however, night and cloud cover need to be properly addressed. Natural or modified bacteria can be used to absorb solar energy at different wavelengths, and some can tolerate extremes in temperature such as those found in the hot springs at Yellowstone National Park. Bacterial biomass have significant potential to achieve the 100 g/m²-day theoretical biomass limits set by Weismann (ref. 38) and discussed in the next section. The yield is quite significant, yet very challenging in terms of daily harvesting operations, scale-up to larger facilities, and biomass containment risks (ref. 39).

Theoretical Biomass Limits

The question now becomes, "just how much energy do plants collect from the Sun, and at what efficiency do they convert inorganic carbon to organic carbon?"

Plants produce carbohydrates through the metabolic process of photosynthesis, in which radiant energy is used to convert inorganic carbon into organic carbon (ref. 40):

 $CO_2 + H_2O + nutrients + radiant energy (hv) \rightarrow C_m(H_2O)_n + O_2 + (H_2O)_x + ATP$

or

 $CO_2 + H_2O + NH_3 + Photons \rightarrow Biomass(CN_xH_yO_z) + O_2$

where ATP is the nucleotide adenosinetriphosphate and assuming plants take in required nutrients (e.g., NO_3 and NH_3).

Plant photosynthesis occurs primarily in the visible spectrum (400 to 700 nm, with a dip near 600 nm (green)), which is about 45 percent of the incident solar spectrum called photosynthetically active radiation (PAR) (ref. 41). The average energy of a mole of PAR photons is 217 kJ.

Plants require 8 to 12 photons to fix one molecule of CO_2 ; one mole of fixed- CO_2 -equivalent chemical biomass energy is 475 kJ. The theoretical photosynthetic efficiency (1) in terms of PAR is

22 percent or (2) in terms of total solar spectra, the photosynthetic efficiency is $22\% \times 45\% = 10\%$, with biomass production at 100 g/m²-day dry biomass (refs. 28 (unpublished) and 38).

Sugarcane is among the best solar energy-to-biomass converters with a photosynthetic efficiency of 2 percent producing up to 24 g/m²-day biomass compared with temperate-zone agriculture at 1/4 to 1 percent. Current halophyte efficiencies and production are similar to soybeans, and algae open-pond systems is 3.1 percent total solar at 20 g/m²-day dry biomass (see Table II).

AND CONVERSION EFFICIENCIES				
	Conversion efficiency ^a	Yield ^a		
Theoretical	PAR, 22 percent	100 g-dry-biomass/m ² -day		
	Total solar, 10 percent			
Current practice				
Agricultural crops	Best: 2 percent total solar			
-	Normal: 0.3 percent			
Halophytes		Similar to soybeans (see below)		
Algae (high solar zone)	3.1 percent total solar	20 g-dry-biomas/m ² -day		
Biomass food and fuel				
feedstocks ^b				
Palm oil production ^c		1187 gal/ha-yr = 3.25 gal/ha-day ^d		
Soybean oil production ^e		150 gal/ha-yr = 0.4 gal/ha-day		
Algae oil production ^f		4900 gal/ha-yr = 13.4 gal/ha-day		
Brazil ethanol		1604 gal/ha-yr = 4.4 gal-ethanol/ha-day		

TABLE II.—THEORETICAL AND CURRENT PRACTICE BIOMASS PRODUCTION AND CONVERSION EFFICIENCIES

^aUseful conversion factors: m²/ha = 10⁴, 10⁶ Btu = 293.1 kWhr, 1 kcal/day = 0.0484 W, Q = 10¹⁵ Btu, and Heat Content: biodiesel = 1.26×10⁵ (Btu/gal) and ethanol = 0.84×10⁵ (Btu/gal).
^bOther seed oils. For oilseeds statistics, see reference 42:

a. http://www.fas.usda.gov/oilseeds/circular/2005/05-11/table4.pdf

b. http://www.fas.usda.gov/oilseeds/circular/2005/05-11/table9.pdf

c. http://www.fas.usda.gov/oilseeds/circular/2005/05-11/table10.pdf

d. http://www.fas.usda.gov/oilseeds/circular/2005/05-11/table15.pdf

e. http://www.fas.usda.gov/oilseeds/circular/2005/05-11/table19.pdf

For tables of oilseed yields for variety of plants, see reference 43:

http://journeytoforever.org/biodiesel_yield.html.

For some fuel characteristics, see reference 44: http://www.eere.energy.gov/afdc/pdfs/fueltable.pdf.

^c4 ton/ha-yr (0.89 to 0.92 gm/cm³, 3.44 kg/gal). See reference 42 (above), reference 45

http://www.fas.usda.gov/pecad2/highlights/2004/08/maypalm/index.htm, and reference 46

http://www.chempro.in/palmoilproperties.htm.

^dNot all available for biodiesel; for example, extract beta-carotene.

^eSee reference 47: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Biodiesel and reference 48

http://www.fapri.missouri.edu/outreach/publications/2006/biofuelconversions.pdf.

^f23 percent conversion 20g/m²-day biomass (ref. 28, unpublished).

Halophyte Agriculture and Algae Systems

Irrigating large tracts of desert land with saltwater can have one unintended anthropomorphic effect: namely, turning adjacent desert into farmland. The evaporating water from these planted tracts will change the local weather pattern, resulting in condensation, and change dry climates to wetter climates. This is the exact reverse of what is happening in large tracts of land next to the Sahara desert, where the desert soaks up the moisture and expands into the adjacent farmlands. Such an event has been a critical issue in Beijing for the last few decades. Because of rampant deforestation, the Gobi desert has been creeping towards Beijing for the last few decades, and persons returning after several decades have noted it is now much drier and sandier than it used to be. Putting large amounts of water into the desert for the water to vaporize can potentially make places like Beijing a little wetter and promote vegetation growth, which will in turn put more water in the atmosphere. Ultimately, it has the possibility of halting or outright reversing the desert expansion.

Fuel Versus Food: Adversary Feedstocks

The major issue is choosing between producing food or oil because there is a limited amount of arable land. That is why saline agriculture—an undeveloped source of both food and fuel—is so interesting. Saline agriculture, when combined with aquaculture, as accomplished in the Manzanar Project (ref. 49), Seawater Farms Eritrea, and Mexico Project (see refs. 12 and 13), provides food, fuel feedstocks, habitat, and redistribution of freshwater resources. Seawater irrigation requires a lot of water, around 4 ft/yr for each acre.

Yet seawater irrigation also provides about 80 percent of the nutrients needed for plant growth and requires only additions of phosphorous, iron, and nitrogen, suggesting the need for genetically modified nitrogen-fixing halophytes (ref. 50). Soybeans and alfalfa are good arable-crop (glycophyte) nitrogen-fixing food and fuel feedstocks; if those same characteristics can be developed in halophytes and combined with aquaculture, as in tilapia farming, we are on the road to both food and feedstocks for oil independence. However it is important to combine these efforts with meteorology and global climate modeling to ensure that redistribution of seawater to arid and semi-arid regions (terra forming) provides a favorable climate balance and avoids adverse and unintentional consequences, such as anthropogenic global warming (ref. 50).

The point is that through research in diverse plant development and processing, engineered to produce higher yields and more efficient use of these oils,⁵ biofuel feedstocks could provide a larger and larger portion of the transportation fuel demand. For food production, for example, Bushnell (ref. 50) cites cases of genomic-derived halophyte tomatoes, eggplant, rice, wheat, and rapeseed, which appear to be quite successful. Also, irrigation agriculture is diverse, and has produced a large portion of fruits, nuts, and vegetables and also contributing to forage, fiber, industrial (paper, rubber, resins, solvents, and others), medicine, and ornamental products (ref. 51). When it is combined with aquaculture, such as fish or shrimp farming, there are benefits to both in terms of long-term sustained production (refs. 17, 52, and 53).

Fuel-Food Feedstock and Freshwater Possibilities

Consider the possibilities of producing food and fuel feedstocks while conserving freshwater:⁶ Since 43 to 44 percent of the Earth landmass is arid or semi-arid, there is the potential for developing a multiplicity of seawater-irrigated regions to produce halophyte crops and combine them with aquaculture. Now suppose that the size of these diverse, multiple regions is that of the Sahara desert (ref. 56), 8.6×10^8 ha, and these diverse regions produce 100 bbl/ha-yr of bio-oil (bbl is barrel): The total equivalent energy produced would be 421.4 Q, or 94 percent of the 2004 World Q (ref. 55).

Developing biomass to its theoretical limits with total solar incident radiation at 230 W/m² daily on various arid areas with a total size of the Sahara desert (8.6×10^8 ha, 13.6 percent of world arid or semiarid lands) could produce 5.92 kQ/yr, or 13 times the World Q (2004).⁷

For this same arid (desert) area, current state-of-the-art, CO_2 -force-fed open-pond algae systems with 10 percent usefuel biomass (2 g/m²-day) product can produce 106 Q/yr of petroleum equivalent, which is 24 percent of the World Q (2004). This production volume is also equivalent to 37 percent of the world liquid fuel consumption (2004), two-thirds (approx. 24 percent) of which is considered to be

⁵For cost effectiveness, the nontoxic byproducts (e.g., nutrients used as ruminant animal food) can be significantly more important than the seed oils.

⁶Earth land size 148.9×10⁶ km² (148.9×10⁸ ha), 29.2 percent of its surface (ref. 54). The size of the Sahara desert is 8.6×10^{6} km² (8.6×10^{8} ha), envelopes nearly all of Northern Africa, and is about the same size as the total U.S. landmass (9.2×10^{6} km², or 9.2×10^{8} ha). A barrel (bbl) of oil equivalent to a barrel of bio-oil, corrected for energy content to No. 2 diesel, is 5.4×10^{6} Btu/bbl × 0.91 (bio-oil to oil equivalent conversion) = 4.9×10^{6} Btu/bbl of bio-oil. If bio-oil production were 100 bbl/ha-yr, then total energy produced would be ($8.6 \times 100 \times 4.9$)×10¹⁴ = 42.14×10^{16} Btu = 421.4×10^{15} Btu = 422.4×10^{15} Btu = 42.4×10^{15} Bt

⁷Average high-incident solar radiation is 230 W/m² daily. At 10 percent maximum photosynthetic conversion, this becomes 0.552 kWhr daily and 6.88×10⁹ Btu/ha-yr or 6.88×10⁻⁶ Q/ha-yr. Thus, 8.6×10⁸ diverse assorted hectares could produce 5.92 kQ/yr or 13 times the World Q (2004).



Figure 5.—Model of seawater ecological community (ref. 8).

transportation fueling (ref. 57). In 2004, the world transportation industry used 20 to 25 percent of the World Q (ref. 58), in good agreement with the (approx. 24 percent) cited prior (assumes no processing losses). In laboratory and pilot experiments, CO_2 -force-fed algae ponds produce 10 times that much biomass (20 g/m²-day), or 2.4 times the World Q (2004); whether, laboratory, pilot, or scale-up, each requires co-location with sustainable sources of CO_2 , water, nutrients, and sunlight.

Again using this same arid area, low-maintenance and low-capital-cost halophyte agriculture could produce 7.1 Q/yr of seed-oil petroleum equivalent. Converting half of the cellulosic biomass to an oil would produce an additional 90.5 Q/yr petroleum equivalent (assumes no processing losses). The oils having nutritional value are best suited as food, and the cellulosic material as both fuel and food feedstocks.⁵

It is important to return a proper proportion of the processing residuals to the soil to help maintain soil carbon (see terra preta soils, ref. 24), as long as any potential pathogens are monitored and controlled.

Halophyte agriculture is low maintenance and a low-capital investment. Entire community halophyte agriculture/aquaculture, as proposed for example by Hodges et al. (ref. 8) (fig. 5)⁸ could free up freshwater supply and arable lands for food production while reducing ocean rise ingress onto arable land. Freeing up freshwater with its abundance of energy and food dramatically impacts the Triangle of Conflicts—energy, water, and food—which are the resources that spawn conflicts (even fighting) among people and nations.

Supposing that the production, logistics, and political issues could be overcome, the total energy from such arid land sources scattered over the Earth would be sufficient to meet the world's energy demands (refs. 60 and 61). As such, if humanity chose, and if we became committed, it could be accomplished.

⁸An enhanced picture of saline agriculture/energy production. Currently the majority of the world's energy production comes from a few countries. However, the move to energy production from halophytes, algae, bacteria, and solar photovoltaic, solar thermal, drilled geothermal, and wind has the potential to distribute energy production more evenly over diverse areas throughout the world. It could also play a big role in the Green Revolution that is currently occurring in Africa and other parts of the world. Imagine the impacts on communities within Africa alone; if they had the potential to produce and export energy for the world. This would provide many regions with the means to feed themselves and raise their standard of living. It also provides future investment for the Middle-East countries, as well as the Americas and others, that currently produce a lot of our petroleum-based energy—providing them with a future income stream when the current reserves of fossil fuels diminish and eventually run out. These countries have large tracts of desert and arid lands with access to plentiful saline water (both groundwater and ocean water). Another aspect is that there are other benefits such as environmental (e.g., effects of sea level rise), which are delineated for example by Sargeant (ref. 59) and Hodges (ref. 8). Also re-vegetating areas would provide new habitat for wildlife. There would be so many spinoffs, including social and environmental ones that would also be brought along if we were to move in the direction of saline energy production (ref. 8 and M.R. Sargeant, 2008, Department of Agricultural Sciences, La Trobe University, Bundoora, VIC 3086, Australia, private communication.).

Conclusions

The stresses of climate change and the demands upon arable land areas that supply our food and freshwater resources are incompatible with our demands for transportation fueling. These lands are at risk or affected by salinity, which is caused by shallow or rising water tables, underground pumping, and other factors such as pollution by nondegradable materials.

1. Humanity is locked into an environmental Triangle of Conflicts between energy, food, and water provoked by anthropogenic global climatic changes and is questioning if there is a resolution. While it will require a paradigm shift in the way we use and invest in our natural resources, the short answer is, Yes!

2. The world population, 6.6 billion (B) is projected to increase 40 percent in 40 to 60 years and will demand energy, freshwater, and food. Within the next 5 years, aviation fueling alone will increase from an estimated 95 B gal/yr (2007) to 116 B gal/yr while world energy consumption (World Q, 1 quad (Q) = 10^{15} Btu) demand grows to 600 Q. With such increases in energy, food, and freshwater demands, how are we to meet them?

3. These demands can be met by properly using the Earth's vast resources for saline agriculture and aquaculture; 43 percent of the Earth's landmass is arid or semi-arid, and 97 percent of the Earth's water is seawater. To illustrate the use of saline agriculture, an arid area comprising diverse, multiple regions totaling the size of the Sahara desert, 8.6×10^8 ha, is used:

a. Developing biomass to its theoretical limits with average solar incidence at 230 W/m^2 daily could produce 5.92 kQ/yr, or 13 times World Q (year 2004).

b. State-of-the-art algae systems with 10 percent useful product $(2 \text{ g/m}^2\text{-}day)$ could produce 106 Q/yr petroleum equivalent, which is 24 percent of the World Q. This production volume is also equivalent to 37 percent of the world liquid fuel consumption (2004), two-thirds of which is considered to be transportation fueling. In 2004, the world transportation industry used 20 to 25 percent of the World Q (assuming no processing losses).

In theory, both algae ponds force fed with CO_2 from tanks and those co-located with power plants (e.g., coal fired) equipped with flue gas desulphurization (FGD) CO_2 -recovery systems can each produce over 10 times that much (>20 g/m²-day), or nearly 2.4 times the World Q (2004).

c. Low maintenance, low-capital-cost halophyte agriculture could produce 7.1 Q/yr seed-oil petroleum equivalent. Converting half of the cellulosic biomass to an oil would produce an additional 90.5 Q/yr petroleum equivalent (assuming no processing losses).

d. The oil nutritional values are best suited as food and the cellulosic material as fuel and food feedstocks. The potential for any residuals to be animal or fish feedstocks depend on their nutrient value and toxicity.

e. It is important to return proper proportions of residue to the soil to help maintain soil carbon and fertility with pathogen control; a goal would be terra preta soils with very low biomass containment risk.

4. Entire community saline agriculture and aquaculture as being developed presently could free up freshwater and arable lands for food with an abundance of energy, which drastically impacts the environmental Triangle of Conflicts (energy, water, and food), which are the resources that spawn conflicts (even fighting) among people and nations.

5. Emissions peaking and levels have graphic similarities to those found in the Permian and dinosaur periods—each of which led to mass extinction. We are now dealing with existential issues, and the consequences of inaction in controlling the environmental Triangle of Conflicts can be severe.

Appendix—Consequences of Inaction (Elements of Mass Extinction)

Humanity is locked into an environmental Triangle of Conflicts between energy, food, and freshwater (ref. 1) that is crying out for resolution, and we must deal with its associated problems (including harmful emissions CO_2 , NOx, ultrafines, etc.). Almost daily we hear about ever-increasing energy costs, desertification, starving people, threatened freshwater resources, climate change, uncontrolled emissions, and catastrophic storms all in various states of crisis. What is happening? What is driving all these problems?

As of 2008, and in the near future, it appears that the power-generation and transportation industries will be heavily dependent on hydrocarbon-based fuels, with transportation based heavily on petroleum fueling. These industries, while the keys to economic strength, have engendered a multiplicity of problems centered on the environmental Triangle of Conflicts between energy, food, and water that requires resolution for survival of humanity. Industrial and transportation combustion cycle heat engines generate CO_2 , particulates (ultrafines), and of course heat. Ultrafines present serious pulmonary (ref. 62) and vascular (ref. 63) human health hazards and are likely to also affect living matter in general. One action being taken to reduce the production of ultrafines is through the use of dimethylether (DME) as a fuel or fuel-blend (ref. 64) since DME fueling diminishes both NOx and ultrafines (particulates). Excessive anthropogenic CO_2 and the rate at which CO_2 is being generated has been implemented in climate change models and found to be largely responsible for current climate changes and those yet to be felt. The introduction and blending of biomass industrial and transportation fueling will reduce both the level and the rate of CO_2 release yet still support combustion cycle heat engines.

We now want to investigate the consequences of inaction in decreasing our reliance on conventional hydrocarbon-based fueling.

Recent uncontrolled anthropogenic CO_2 levels and peaking rates are shown to be similar to those found in the Permian and dinosaur periods each of which led to mass extinction. The latter were natural events, and the former stem from abuses within the environmental Triangle of Conflicts. We are now dealing with existential issues.

While theories and popular notions abound as to how dinosaurs vanished 65 million years ago (Mya), their pursuit incubated searches that have enabled construction of an increasingly refined timeline of the Earth spanning over 400 000 yr. The two largest Earth mass extinctions are dated to the Paleozic era (Old life) beginning 530 Mya and ending with mass extinction 250 Mya (Permian period), followed by Mesozioc era (Middle life) ending with mass extinction 65 Mya (when the dinosaurs became extinct), followed by Cenozoic era (New life) to present day and the potential of an impending anthropogenic-engendered mass extinction.

To explain such an event as mass extinction, the Alvarez group (see ref. 65) and most of the scientific community settled upon asteroid/meteorite/comet impact displacing large amounts of debris into the atmosphere obliterating incident solar radiation, plunging the planet into darkness and a near lifeless, cold prolonged winter. Still, a few others pursued an unpopular, often belittled, position that changes in thermochemical balances of the Earth's oceans and atmosphere trigger such events. Similar theories are applied to the great extinction at the end of the Permian period, where 90 percent of the life on Earth is believed to have vanished.

Resolving these polarized positions has required timeline refinements, massive amounts of geological data, and a significant boost from computational modeling. The emerging timeline shows many extinction events with a general increase in diversification of species (ref. 65).

To construct the timeline, isotope techniques applied to core and rock samples provided initial metrics to characterize the climate at specific times. The photosynthesis-based meter relied on the ¹²C:¹³C ratio, providing evidence exploited by both groups. The isotope ¹²C is the isotope of choice of plant photosynthesis, leaving ¹³C in the atmospheric CO₂ reservoir; some marine species, such as shell-forming clams, use either isotope, and rapid decay of isotope ¹⁴C dates events to 80 000 yr. The geothermal-based meter relies on the ¹⁶O:¹⁸O ratio, noting that less ¹⁸O is taken up in mineral trappings during warmer periods. Chromatographic techniques have refined and sharpened the Earth's climatic timeline.

Geological data reveal changes in the Earth's magnum spilling out over large regions forming basalts, such as the Siberian Traps (see ref. 65) with massive CO_2 release. Other data show changes in ocean thermal- and salt-concentration-driven currents with changes in the thermocline (and halocline) and oxygen stratification, leading to deep-water anoxia that supports sulfur-loving bacteria; these changes are also affected by the Earth's plates and orbit and of course, the Sun.

Life forms are held in a delicate balanced coupling between incident solar flux involving van Alan belts, ozone and atmospheric layer shields, magnum, the core, and the Earth's oceans, which constitute nearly 71 percent (ref. 66) of its surface, providing heat, mass, and chemical exchange. Data show that changes in Earth's ocean currents, shift of plates, and volcanic and basalt formations altered this delicate balance. It is to these changes caused by global warming—with ocean O_2 loss due to CO_2 acidification and anoxic oceans spawning H_2S and CH_4 releases coupled with massive basalt and volcanic CO_2 release (Siberian Traps)—that we attribute the 90 percent extinction rate of the Permian period 250 Mya and the dinosaurs 65 Mya with an estimated 60 percent extinction rate.

As such, it is to these data (including that of the Permian period) and past extinction events that we draw the parallels with current natural and anthropogenic effects on our planet and our own existence (see table III). The key factors seem to be BOTH the level (now nearing 400 ppm) and the rate of change of CO_2 in the atmosphere.

Permian period, approximately 60 million years ago	Current		
(CO ₂ from Permian Siberian volcanoes)	(Human activities generate over 100 times that CO_2)		
Fossil data indicates CO ₂ warming.	GREATLY accelerating and amplifying warming. Balanced cooling		
	effects from volcanic debris and SO ₂ .		
Fossil methane released.	22 times worse than CO_2 for warming, coming from tundra and		
	oceans (immense amounts sequestered).		
Fossil CO ₂ released.	Fossil CO ₂ release and release from anthropogenic activities.		
Warming oceans and increased ocean acidification reduces	Global ocean warming and increased ocean acidification reduce CO ₂		
algae growth and promotes O_2 decline and anoxia.	uptake, resulting in O_2 decline and anoxia (e.g., Black Sea bottom).		
Ice melting due to albedo changes and warming.	Faster ice melting, resulting in albedo changes.		
Atmospheric water (assumed) leads to increased	Water evaporates and is THE warming gas, leading to increased		
atmospheric temperatures.	atmospheric temperatures (some 12 to 14 °C by 2100).		
	At these temperatures, ALL the ice melts (beyond 2100): oceans rise		
	80 m, destroying homes of 2.5 billion people and engendering plate		
	movements and volcanic activities.		
Ocean circulators stop.	Temperature and saline differences drive ocean circulators, which		
	largely disappear; circulation slows, changes directions, or stops.		
Oceans go anoxic, promoting anoxic bacteria that love	Happening NOW, losing a chunk of ocean equal in size to state of		
sulfur and produce H_2S .	Texas each year to anoxic conditions. Anoxic bacteria produce H ₂ S;		
	warmth causes sporadic release of CH ₄ hydrates.		
CH ₄ and H ₂ S releases destroy ozone layer and make	CH ₄ and H ₂ S releases destroy ozone layer and make atmosphere toxic.		
atmosphere toxic. Estimated 90 percent extinction.	Acid rain destroys plant, animal, and human life as now known.		
	Potential 95 percent species extinction.		
	IF all of the methane and CO ₂ are released from the oceans, then we		
	become VENUS: Harsh climate of Venus is a result of greenhouse		
	effect from volcanic activity with CO ₂ release.		

TABLE III.—EFFECTS OF CO2 ON EARTH DURING PERMIAN PERIOD COMPARED WITH CURRENT TRENDS

Volcanic CO₂ and SO₂

Estimates place volcanic CO₂ release at 130 to180 B (billion) kg/yr (ref. 67), but anthropogenic CO₂ emissions are on the order of 150 times larger. Other estimates place volcanism at 500 B kg/yr, which when combined with natural biomass cycles, places the atmospheric CO₂ reservoir near 2.2×10^{15} kg. Our current land use and fossil fuel consumption produce a net of 17.6×10^{12} kg/yr that has progressively increased that CO₂ reservoir estimate to 2.69×10^{15} kg (refs. 68 to 70).

The 1970 to 1977 time-averaged subaerial volcanic SO₂ emissions flux is 13 B kg/yr (13×10^{12} g/yr); 4 B kg from eruptions and 9 B kg from passive degassing (ref. 71). Total natural sulfur release is about 24 B kg/yr with anthropogenic contribution at 79 B kg/yr mostly in the Northern Hemisphere (ref. 71).

Warming Problems

The consequences of present-day warming climatic changes and rapid rise of CO_2 as occurred in the Permian extinction affect human health and result in an increase in tropical diseases (e.g., malaria), the loss of birds with an increase of insects, storm mortality, sea-level rises, starvation, a decline in grain production and increase in tropical fruit and starches among many others, and serious rapid population growth with threats of warfare (nuclear) and outright colonization. Over 2000 years ago the Sahara was the breadbasket of the Roman Empire; now it is a desert as a result of climate change. Based on informed predictions, it becomes imperative that CO_2 plateau at 450 ppm for survival as we know it (ref. 65), but most likely will level off near 800 ppm with massive destruction before humanity will do anything about it. Battisti (ref. 72 and cited pp. 194 to 199 in ref. 65) thinks it will be worse and peak at 1100 ppm, and he provides a ghostly description of the new world. In addition, Battisti feels that climate models based on the Eocene epoch (warming period beginning 60 Mya and ending 33 Mya with no ice left at the poles, see extinction map, ref. 73) are inadequate to apply to this century—the extent of extinction of living species cannot be surmised. Ward adds his own three scenarios (pp. 200 to 204, ref. 65), which parallel the scenarios of Battisti and those of Hansen (2005, 2006, and fig. 6).

Hanson's model (refs. 74 and 75) shows "business as usual" (upper locus, fig. 6), which according to Ward (ref. 65) and Battisti (ref. 72) leads to mass extinction. Hansen's alternative scenario leads to





A1B: represents improved but balanced utilization of fossil and nonfossil energy sources.

B1: represents world population peaks midcentury then declines with rapid change toward a service and information economy with clean, efficient technologies.

Alternative scenarios represents additional CO₂ forcing of \sim 1.5 W/m² by 2100.

Figure 6.—Twenty-first century global warming outcomes from Hansen's model (ref. 74).

benign-warming at less than 1 °C (lower locus, fig. 6). Hendricks (ref. 2), considering methane fuels and methane release from methane hydrates, also warns if that climate thermal changes follow Hansen's upper locus in figure 6, it is questionable if humanity or other living matter can survive, as none can convert methane gas to oxygen. Planetary life is headed for extinction; meanwhile we continue to argue legality of our planet's fragile state even to the Supreme Court (ref. 76). The Battisti et al. Supreme Court Brief also cites the detrimental effects of unabated greenhouse gas release (primarily CO₂, CH₄, N₂O, and fluorocarbons) and notes that time is critical in acting upon their reduction.

Climate Control

Seawater and CO_2 levels are rising as occurred in the Permian and other periods, but this time it is due to anthropogenic effects. Engineering approaches to anthropogenically control the climate have been suggested to reverse these risings.

Crutzen (ref. 77) proposed to alter Earth albedo by burning S_2 or H_2S in the stratosphere that converts to SO_2 sub-micrometer sulfate particles. As our planetary ecological system is in such a delicate balance, these types of climate control measures appear too dangerous to implement.

There are too many unknowns, given that small changes can have large irreversible effects on that balance. This is also acknowledged by Crutzen who states that albedo enhancement should only be used when proven advantageous and when humanity commits, with all diligence, to support the reduction of greenhouse gases; he is not optimistic the support will be there, however, noting that global military expenditures, for example, are approaching US\$1000 billion (nearly half by the United Sates alone).

The Seawater Foundation approach to climate control is the use of arid and marginal lands and seawater rivers, in a complete life cycle, producing food-fuel feedstocks while conserving freshwater—an approach not considered by Crutzen. The approach is also anthropogenic but offers an effective countermeasure to the Permian scenario of general warming with rapid CO_2 rise and impending mass extinction. It also affords an enhancement in biodiversity in contrast to recent trends toward specialized food sources, which virtually eliminate biodiversity.

A continuation of discussions and a summary of climate change problems is provided by Meinshausen et al. (ref. 78).

References

- Hendricks, R.C.; and Bushnell, D.M.: Halophytes Energy Feedstocks: Back to Our Roots. ISROMAC12–2008–20241 (NASA/TM—2009-205208), The 12th International Symposium on Transport Phenomena and Dynamics of Rotating Machinery, Honolulu, HI, 2008. See also preliminary summary provided to Atlantic Green Fuels Inc. Workshop, Twinsburg OH, 2007. http://atlanticgreenfuels.com/html/sources.html
- 2. Hendricks, R.C.: Methane Hydrates: More Than a Viable Aviation Fuel Feedstock Option. AIAA-2007-4757 (NASA/TM-2007-214816), 2007.
- 3a. Farrell, A.E.; and Brandt, A.R.: Risks of the Oil Transition. Environ. Res. Lett., vol. 1, 2006. http://www.iop.org/EJ/article/1748-9326/1/1/014004/erl6_1_014004.pdf?requestid=erkBTeO73BGPZJuz2wi7Kg Accessed Sept. 30, 2008.
- 3b. Farrell, Alex: The Race for 21st Century Fuels. University of California, Berkeley, Oct. 2006. http://icte.umsl.edu/assets/pdfs/forum/Farrell%20-%20Harris%20Conservation%20Forum%20St%20Louis%20v4a-p.pdf
- 4. International Center for Biosaline Agriculture, Dubai, United Arab Emirates. http://www.biosaline.org/ Accessed Jan. 14, 2009.
- Bezdek, Roger H.: Aviation and Peak Oil—Why the Conventional Wisdom is Wrong. Presented at the ASPO USA 2007 World Oil Conference, Houston TX, 2007. www.misi-net.com Accessed Sept. 25, 2008.
- Glenn, Edward P.; Brown, J. Jed; and O'Leary, James W.: Irrigating Crops with Seawater. Sci. Amer., vol. 279, issue 2, 1998, pp. 76–81. http://www.miracosta.edu/home/kmeldahl/articles/crops.pdf Accessed Sept. 30, 2008.
- 7a. Anwar, Farooq, et al.: Analytical Characterization of Salicornia Bigelovii Seed Oil Cultivated in Pakistan. J. Agric. Food Chem., vol. 50, 2002, pp. 4210–4214. http://pubs.acs.org/cgibin/article.cgi/jafcau/2002/50/i15/pdf/jf0114132.pdf Accessed Sept. 25, 2008.
- 7b. Soxhlet Condensers. EW-99037-30. Cole-Parmer, Vernon Hills, IL. http://www.coleparmer.com/catalog/product_view.asp?sku=9903730 Accessed Jan. 14, 2009.
- 8. Hodges, Carl N., et al.: Reversing the Flow: Water and Nutrients from the Sea to the Land. Ambio, vol. XXII, no. 7, 1993.

See also http://www.atlanticgreenfuels.com/html/backgroundsources.html

- Yensen, N.P.; and Bedell, J.L.: Considerations for the Selection, Adaptation, and Application of Halophyte Crops to Highly Saline Environments as Exemplified by the Long-Term Development of Cereal and Forage Cultivars of Distichlis spp. (Poaceae). Towards the Rational Use of High Salinity Tolerant Plants. Helmut Leith and Ahmed A. Al Masoom, eds., Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 1993, pp. 305–313.
- 10. Yensen, N.P.; Bedell, J.L.; and Yensen, S.B.: Domestication of Distichlis as a Grain and Forage. Biology of Salt Tolerant Plants, M. Ajmal Khan and Irwin A. Ungar, eds., University of Karachi, Karachi, 1995.
- 11. Yensen, Nicholas P.: Halophyte Uses for the Twenty-First Century. Tasks for Vegetation Science Book Series, Vol. 40, 2006, pp. 367–396.
- 12a. Salicornia, Oil-Yielding Plant for Coastal Belts. The Hindu, Sept. 5, 2003. http://www.hindu.com/seta/2003/09/05/stories/2003090500300300.htm Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 12b. Salicornia Bigelovii. Plants for a Future. http://www.ibiblio.org/pfaf/cgi-bin/arr html?Salicornia+bigelovii Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 13. The Seawater Foundation. http://www.seawaterfoundation.org/ Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 14. Soybean Composition and Nutrients. Los Angeles Chinese Learning Center. http://chineseschool.netfirms.com/soybean-composition.html Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.

- 15. Ap. Ferrari, Roseli; da Silva Oliveira, Vanessa; and Scabio, Ardalla: Oxidative Stability of Biodiesel From Soybean Oil Fatty Acid Ethyl Esters. Sci. Agric. (Piracicaba, Braz.), vol. 62, no. 3, 2005. http://www.scielo.br/scielo.php?pid=S0103-90162005000300014&script=sci_arttext Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 16a. Seliskar, Denise M.; and Gallagher, John L.: An Oil-Seed Biofuel Multi-Use Crop Grown With Saltwater. Atlantic Green Fuels Halophyte Summit, Atlantic Green Fuels Inc., Twinsburg, OH, 2007. http://www.atlanticgreenfuels.com/html/backgroundsources.html Accessed Jan. 14, 2009.
- 16b. Gallagher, J.S.; and Seliskar, D.M.: Growing Biodiesel Fuel and Animal Feed With Saline Irrigation, Halophyte Biotechnology Center College of Marine and Earth Studies, University of Delaware, jackg@udel.edu. http://www.ocean.udel.edu/CMS/jgallagher/Halophyte/biofuelparagraph.doc Accessed Jan. 14, 2009.
- 16c. Ruan, C-J., et al.: Kosteletzkya Virginica, an Agroecoengineering Halophytic Species for Alternative Agricultural Production in China's East Coast: Ecological Adaptation and Benefits, Seed Yield, Oil Content, Fatty Acid and Biodiesel Properties. Ecological Engineering, vol. 32, no. 4, 2008, pp. 320–328.

http://www.sciencedirect.com/science?_ob=PublicationURL&_cdi=6006&_pubType=J&_acct=C00 0011798&_version=1&_urlVersion=0&_userid=141925&md5=de432c281b51a7e2fa66f82b525ab3 46&jchunk=32#32 Accessed Jan. 14, 2009.

- 17. Hendricks, R.C.: Alternate-Fueled Flight: Halophytes, Algae, Bio-, and Synthetic Fuels. Paper presented at the Workshop on Alternate Fueling Sustainable Supply (NASA/TM—2009-215222, to be published), Twinsburg, OH, 2007. http://atlanticgreenfuels.com/html/agenda-aprilmay2008.html Accessed Oct. 31, 2008.
- 18. Schill, Susanne Retka: The Saltwater Soybean. Biodiesel Magazine, November 2007, pp. 58-64.
- 19. Distichlis Spicata Spicata. http://www.laspilitas.com/plants/248.htm Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 20. Dryland Salinity in Australia. A summary of the National Land and Water Resources Audit's Australian Dryland Salinity Assessment 2000, Commonwealth of Australia 2001, Canberra, 2001.
- Sargeant, M.R.; Tang, C.; and Sale, P.W.G.: The Ability of Distichlis Spicata to Grow Sustainably Within a Saline Discharge Zone While Improving the Soil Chemical and Physical Properties. Aust. J. Soil Res., vol. 46, no. 1, 2008, pp. 37–44.
- 22. The Energy Forum—Energy From Bio Fuels. Samuel Neaman Institute, Israel. http://www.neaman.org.il/Neaman/news/event_item.asp?fid=836 Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 23. Clean Development Mechanism. Wikipedia. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Clean_Development_Mechanism Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 24. Hendricks, R.C.: Potential Carbon Negative Commercial Aviation Through Land Management. ISROMAC12-2008-20242, 2008. http://atlanticgreenfuels.com/html/agenda-aprilmay2008.html Accessed Oct. 31, 2008.
- Spoehr, H.A.: The Need for a New Source of Food. Algal Culture from Laboratory to Pilot Plant, John S. Burlew, ed., ch. 2, Carnegie Institution of Washington Publication 600, Washington DC, 1953, pp. 24–30.
- 26. Mituya, A.; Nyunoya, T.; and Tamiya, H.: Pre-Pilot-Plant Experiments on Algal Mass Culture. Algal Culture, From Laboratory to Pilot Plant, Burlew, John, S., ch. 18, Carnegie Institution of Washington Publication 600, Washington, DC, 1953, pp. 273–281.
- 27. Pilot-Plant Studies in the Production of Chlorella. Based on Report by Arthur D. Little, Inc., John S. Burlew, ed., Algal Culture, From Laboratory to Pilot Plant. Carnegie Institution of Washington Publication 600, ch. 17, Washington, DC, 1953, pp. 235–272.
- 28. Ben-Amotz, Ami: Production of Marine Unicellular Algae by Commercial Power Plant Wastes: From Black Coal to Green Bio-Fuel. Algae Biomass Summit, San Francisco, CA, Nov. 2007. Also, http://www.wsgr.com/WSGR/Display.aspx?SectionName=news/emailer/Event141/info.htm Accessed Jan. 14, 2009.

- 29. Alga Technologies. Business overview. http://www.algatech.com/overview.htm Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 30. Earthrise Nutritionals. http://www.earthrise.com/home.asp Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 31a Valcent Products. http://www.valcent.net/s/Home.asp Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 31b. AlgaeLink® Photo-Bioreactors http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eSBZa88fy64&feature=related Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- Rodolfi, Liliana, et al.: Microalgae for Oil: Strain Selection, Induction of Lipid Synthesis and Outdoor Mass Cultivation in Low-Cost Photobioreactor, Biotech. Bio., 2008, pp. 100–112. http://www3.interscience.wiley.com/cgi-bin/fulltext/119881659/PDFSTART Accessed Jan. 14, 2009.
- 33a. Dimitrov, Krassen: GreenFuel Technologies: A Case Study for Industrial Photosynthetic Energy Capture. 2007. http://www.nanostring.net/Algae/CaseStudy.pdf Accessed Sept. 30, 2008.
- 33b. Photosynthetically Active Radiation (PAR) as Observed From Satellites. University of Maryland, College Park, MD, 2002. http://www.atmos.umd.edu/~srb/par/ Accessed Jan. 14, 2009.
- 33c. Center for Coastal Physical Oceanography. http://www.ccpo.odu.edu/SEES/veget/vg_class.htm Accessed Jan. 14, 2009
- 33d. Photosynthetically Active Radiation (With Chlorophyll-A, Chlorophyll-B, and Carotenoids Spectra Humps). http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Photosynthetically_active_radiation Accessed Jan. 14, 2009.
- Tredici, M.R.: Photobioreactors: Designs and Strategies to Achieve 10% Solar Energy Conversion Efficiency Through Microalgae Cultivation. AQUA 2006 Meeting Abstract, no. 402, World Aquaculture Society, Florence Italy, 2006.
 https://www.was.org/Meetings/AbstractDate.egp?AbstractId=10700 Accessed Jan. 14, 2009
 - https://www.was.org/Meetings/AbstractData.asp?AbstractId=10700 Accessed Jan. 14, 2009.
- 35. Photosynthesis. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Photosynthesis Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 36. Cyanophyta. Wikipedia. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Cyanophyta Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 37. Mitchell, B. Gregg: Are Microalgae a Viable Option for Biofuels? The Role of Universities in the Quest for Answers. Algae Biomass Summit, San Francisco, CA, 2007.
- Weissman, Joseph C.: From Laboratory to Pilot Plant—Lessons Learned from a Microalgae Biofuels Project. Algae Biomass Summit, San Francisco, CA, 2007. http://www.wsgr.com/WSGR/Display.aspx?SectionName=news/emailer/Event141/info.htm Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 39. Bauer, Alan J.: Bacteria Specialist, personal communication, 2008.
- 40a. Botany Global Issues Map. McGraw Hill. http://www.mhhe.com/biosci/pae/botany/botany_map/articles/article_37.html Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 40b. Photosynthesis. Wikipedia. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Photosynthesis Accessed March 12, 2009.
- 41. Photosynthetically Active Radiation (PAR) as Observed from Satellites. University of Maryland, College Park, Maryland. http://www.atmos.umd.edu/~srb/par/04status.htm Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 42a. Major Oilseeds. Counselor and Attache Reports Foreign Agricultural Service Official Statistics, USDA Estimates, Foreign Agricultural Service. http://www.fas.usda.gov/oilseeds/circular/2005/05-11/table4.pdf Accessed Jan. 15, 2009.
- 42b. Vegetable Oil Production, Consumption and Imports for Top 10 Consuming Markets. Counselor and Attache Reports Foreign Agricultural Service Official Statistics, USDA Estimates, Foreign Agricultural Service. http://www.fas.usda.gov/oilseeds/circular/2005/05-11/table9.pdf Accessed Jan. 15, 2009.
- 42c. United States: Oilseeds and Products Supply and Distribution. Counselor and Attache Reports Foreign Agricultural Service Official Statistics, USDA Estimates, Foreign Agricultural Service. http://www.fas.usda.gov/oilseeds/circular/2005/05-11/table10.pdf Accessed Jan. 15, 2009.

- 42d. European Union Oilseeds and Products Supply and Distribution. Counselor and Attache Reports Foreign Agricultural Service Official Statistics, USDA Estimates, Foreign Agricultural Service. http://www.fas.usda.gov/oilseeds/circular/2005/05-11/table15.pdf Accessed Jan. 15, 2009.
- 42e. Malaysia Palm Oil Supply and Distribution. Counselor and Attache Reports Foreign Agricultural Service Official Statistics, USDA Estimates, Foreign Agricultural Service. http://www.fas.usda.gov/oilseeds/circular/2005/05-11/table19.pdf Accessed Jan. 15, 2009.
- 43. Oil Yields and Characteristics. http://journeytoforever.org/biodiesel_yield.html Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 44. Characteristic Property of Several Fuels. http://www.eere.energy.gov/afdc/pdfs/fueltable.pdf Accessed Jan. 14, 2009.
- 45. Malaysia: Below-Normal Rainfall May Limit Palm Oil Yields Late 2004–Early 2005. http://www.fas.usda.gov/pecad2/highlights/2004/08/maypalm/index.htm Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 46. Palm Oil Properties. Chempro Technovation Pvt. Ltd. http://www.chempro.in/palmoilproperties.htm Accessed Jan. 15, 2009.
- 47. Biodiesel. Wikipedia. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Biodiesel Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 48. Biofuel Conversion Factors. http://www.fapri.missouri.edu/outreach/publications/2006/biofuelconversions.pdf Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 49. Manzanar Project. http://www.tamu.edu/ccbn/dewitt/manzanar/default.htm Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 50. Bushnell, D.M.: Seawater Agriculture for Energy, Warming, Food, Land, and Water. Large-Scale Disasters: Prediction, Control, and Mitigation, Mohamed Gad-el-Hak, ed. Cambridge University Press, New York, NY, 2008.
- 51. Basic Research on the Chemistry, Physics, and Biology of Salt-Affected Soil-Plant-Water Systems. http://www.ars.usda.gov/main/site_main.htm?modecode=53-10-20-00 Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 52a. Tapping a Desert Aquifer. New York Times, Jan. 1, 2007. http://www.nytimes.com/imagepages/2007/01/01/science/20060102_FISH_GRAPHIC.html Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 52b. Global Seawater, Inc. http://www.globalseawater.com/ Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 53. Community Seawater Aquiculture and Agriculture Development. The Seawater Foundation. http://www.seawaterfoundation.org/ Accessed Jan. 15, 2009.
- 54. Earth. Wikipedia. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Earth Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 55. Energy Information Administration. http://www.eia.doe.gov/pub/international/iealf/table18.xls Accessed Oct. 8, 2008.
- 56. Sahara. Looklex Encyclopaedia. http://lexicorient.com/e.o/sahara.htm Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 57. Energy Information Administration. http://www.eia.doe.gov/oiaf/ieo/oil.html Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 58. World Energy Resources and Consumption. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/World_energy_resources_and_consumption Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 59. Sargeant, M.; Sale, P.; and Tang C.: Salt Priming Improves Establishment of Distichlis Spicata Under Saline Conditions. Aust. J. Agric. Res., vol. 57, no. 12, pp. 1259–1265. http://www.publish.csiro.au/nid/40/paper/AR06103.htm (http://www.regional.org.au/au/asa/2006/poster/agronomy/4624_sargeantm.htm and http://atlanticgreenfuels.com/AR06103.pdf) Accessed Jan. 15, 2009.
- 60a. Hsu, Y.Y.: Clean Fuels From Biomass; Feasibility of Converting Plant Systems to Fuels. NASA-TM-X-71538, 1974.
- 60b. Graham, R.W.; Reynolds, T.W.; and Hsu, Y.Y.: Preliminary Assessment of Systems for Deriving Liquid and Gaseous Fuels From Waste or Grown Organics. NASA TN D-8165, 1976.
- 61. Bushnell, Dennis: 2006 Green[er]-to-Green Aircraft/Aeronautical Possibilities. Presented at Royal Aeronautical Society Meeting, London, UK, 2006.

- 62. Schwartz, J.: Particulate Air Pollution and Chronic Respiratory Disease, Environmental Research, vol. 62, 1993, pp. 7–13.
- Simkhovich, B.Z.; Kleinman, M.T.; and Kloner, R.A.: Air Pollution and Cardiovascular Injury Epidemiology, Toxicology, and Mechanisms, Journal American College of Cardiology, 2008; vol. 52, pp. 719–726. doi:10.1016/j.jacc.2008.05.029 (Published online 13 August 2008). http://content.onlinejacc.org/cgi/content/short/52/9/719
- 64. Health Hazards and Particulate and NOx Reductions and US-Regulations Using Dimethylether Fueling (CH₃-O-CH₃) DME. Conference on the Development and Promotion of Environmentally Friendly Heavy Duty Vehicles Such as DME Trucks. Ronald Reagan Building and International Trade Center, Mar. 2006. http://www.iapantrapsport.com/conferences/2006/03/dme_detailed_information.pdf

http://www.japantransport.com/conferences/2006/03/dme_detailed_information.pdf Accessed Jan. 15, 2009.

- 65. Ward, Peter Douglas: Under a Green Sky: Global Warming, the Mass Extinctions of the Past, and What They Mean for Our Future. Smithsonian Books, Harper Collins, New York, NY, 2007.
- 66. PhysicalGeography.net. http://www.physicalgeography.net/fundamentals/80.html Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 67. Gerlach, Terrence M.: Etna's Greenhouse Pump. Nature, vol. 351, 1991, pp. 352–353.
- Atmospheric CO₂ Emissions From Volcanoes, Mt. St. Helens. http://gcmd.nasa.gov/records/GCMD_OFR_94-212.html Accessed Jan. 15, 2009.
- 69. Adam Stein: Stop the Volcanoes Before They Destroy Us All. Terrapass Blog, March 25, 2006. http://www.terrapass.com/blog/posts/stop-the-volcan Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 70. Morse, J.W.; and Mackenzie, F.T.: Geochemistry of Sedimentary Carbonates. Elsevier Science Publishing Co., New York, NY, 1990.
- 71. Andres, R.J.; and Kasgnoc, A.D.: Time-Averaged Inventory of Volcanic Sulfur Emissions From the Global Emissions Inventory Activity (GEIA), IGBP/IGAC. Global Emissions Inventory Activity, 1997.
- 72. David S. Battisti Home Page. http://www.atmos.washington.edu/~david/ Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 73. Eocene. Wikipedia. http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Eocene#Grande_Coupure Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.
- 74. Hansen, James E.: Is There Still Time to Avoid "Dangerous Anthropogenic Interference" With Global Climate? A Tribute to Charles David Keeling, Presented at the American Geophysical Union, San Francisco, 2005. http://www.columbia.edu/~jeh1/2005/Keeling_20051206.pdf Accessed Oct. 24, 2008.
- 75. Environmental Defense: The Ticking Clock.... Solutions, vol. 37, no. 3, 2006, p. 11.
- 76. Battisti, D. et al.: In the Supreme Court of the United States, Commonwealth of Massachusetts, et al., Petitioners v. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, et al., Respondents, No. 05–1120, 2006. http://www.atmos.washington.edu/~david/supreme.html Accessed Sept. 25, 2008.
- 77. Crutzen, P.J.: Albedo Enhancement by Stratospheric Sulfur Injections: A Contribution to Resolve a Policy Dilemma? Climatic Change, vol. 77, nos. 3–4, 2006, pp. 211–219.
- 78. RealClimate. http://realclimate.org/ Accessed Oct. 2, 2008.

	REPOR		TION PAGE	Form Approved OMB No. 0704-0188			
The public reporting burden for this collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instructions, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing the collection of information. Send comments regarding this burden estimate or any other aspect of this collection of information, including suggestions for reducing this burden, to Department of Defense, Washington Headquarters Services, Directorate for Information Reports (0704-0188), 1215 Jefferson Davis Highway, Suite 1204, Artington, VA 22202-4302. Respondents should be aware that notwithstanding any other provision of law, no person shall be subject to any penalty for failing to comply with a collection of information if it does not display a currently valid OMB control number. PLEASE DO NOT RETURN YOUR FORM TO THE ABOVE ADDRESS.							
1. REPORT DATE 01-05-2009	(DD-MM-YYYY)	2. REPORT TY Technical Me	PE emorandum		3. DATES COVERED (From - To)		
4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE Halophytes, Algae, and Bacteria Food and Fuel Fee			edstocks		5a. CONTRACT NUMBER		
					5b. GRANT NUMBER		
					5c. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER		
6. AUTHOR(S) Hendricks, R., C	C.; Bushnell, D., M.				5d. PROJECT NUMBER		
					5e. TASK NUMBER		
					5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER WBS 561581.02.08.03.16.03		
7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDF National Aeronautics and Space Administration John H. Glenn Research Center at Lewis Field Cleveland, Ohio 44135-3191			RESS(ES)		8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER E-16577-1		
9. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND National Aeronautics and Space Administration Washington, DC 20546-0001			D ADDRESS(ES)		10. SPONSORING/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) NASA		
					11. SPONSORING/MONITORING REPORT NUMBER NASA/TM-2009-215294		
12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Unclassified-Unlimited Subject Categories: 28 and 07 Available electronically at http://gltrs.grc.nasa.gov This publication is available from the NASA Center for AeroSpace Information, 301-621-0390							
13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES							
14. ABSTRACT The constant, in impact on clima provoked by ant use energy, wate saline agricultur is seawater. In hi The developmen halophytes and j set theoretical hi total size equiva can provide for	creasing demand for te while sustaining of hropogenic monetar er, and food. With w e and aquaculture is ight of this, we seek at and application of present a few of thei mits on biomass pro lent to the Sahara D the projected world	r energy, freshy quality of life. 7 y and power st orld population required, as 43 fuel alternative these plants (h r benefits, cite duction follow esert (8.6'108 energy demand	water, and food stresses on This environmental Triang rugglescan be resolved to a (6.6 billion) projected to be percent of the Earth's land is in plants that thrive in be alophytes) become the pri- a few research projects (in ed by projections in terms ha, or 2.1'109 acres), thes l.	ar ability to meet the gle of Conflicts betw hrough an anthrope increase 40 percer ndmass is arid or se rackish and saltwa imary focus. Herein neluding some on the of world energy de e projections show	ese demands within reasonable cost and ween energy, food, and waterwhile ogenic paradigm shift in how we produce and at in 40 to 60 yr, proper development of emi-arid and 97 percent of the Earth's water ter with the ability to survive in arid lands. In we introduce some not-so-familiar the alternatives algae and bacteria), and then emands. Based on diverse arid lands with a that halophyte agriculture and algae systems		
15. SUBJECT TERMS Biofuels; Halophytes; Algae; Renewable fuels; Alternate fuels; Aviation; Emissions							
16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF:		17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT	18. NUMBER OF	19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON STI Help Desk (email help@sti nasa gov)			
a. REPORT U	b. ABSTRACT U	C. THIS PAGE		PAGES 27	19b. TELEPHONE NUMBER (include area code) 301-621-0390		

Standard Form 298 (Rev. 8-98)
Brookland by ANEL Ctd. 720-46

Prescribed by ANSI Std. Z39-18