FATIGUE IN SHORT-HAUL OPERATIONS Regulations and Research

Cassie J. Hilditch, PhD

FAA AHFRD NEAT December 6, 2022 | Virtual



# Objectives

- Develop the scope of the proposed SH study
- Interview US commercial SH pilots to identify fatigue factors

• Systematic, qualitative approach to capture experiences

#### ICAO definition of fatigue

Fatigue is defined as a physiological state of reduced mental or physical performance capability resulting from sleep loss or extended wakefulness, circadian phase, or workload (mental and/or physical activity) that can impair a crew member's alertness and ability to safely operate an aircraft or perform safety-related duties.

Focus Groups

- Pilots recruited through emails
- Focus groups held online
- Anonymous participation
  - Letter code, no cameras
- Transcription and note-taking
- Standardized script and questions
- Each participant responded to

each question in random order

Questions

**Q1.** Are there any types of short-haul operations that you think lead to elevated fatigue?

**Q2.** Are there any types of shorthaul operations that you think are **not** fatiguing?

**Q3.** What types of short-haul operations do you think are the most important for us to study?

Analysis

- Cleaned transcripts
- Identified repeating ideas
- Developed code book
- Coded transcripts
- Reviewed and finalized codes
- Code frequencies counted
- Grouped codes into themes
- Themes ranked by frequency

Analysis



Participants



#### 4 airlines

# 14 focus groups

90 pilots



Word Cloud



Over-arching themes

Five broad fatigue categories identified:

Category

- Circadian disruption
- High workload
- Rest opportunity
- Schedule changes
- Long sits

Ranking themes

| Theme                   | Ν             | %                    |
|-------------------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Circadian switches      | 171           | 10.5                 |
| Rest duration (layover) | 153           | 9.4                  |
| High WL/ Hassle factors | 151           | 9.3                  |
| Number of legs          | 121           | 7.4                  |
| FAR 117 issues          | 93            | 5.7                  |
| Long sits               | 85            | 5.2                  |
| Redeyes                 | 83            | 5.1                  |
| Unpredictability        | 79            | 4.9                  |
| A/C & crew swaps        | 73            | 4.5                  |
| Rest timing             | 73            | 4.5                  |
| Out-of-hours            | 68            | 4.2                  |
| Earlies                 | 64            | 3.9                  |
| Short turn time         | 53            | 3.3                  |
| Length of duty          | 46            | 2.8                  |
| Rest quality            | 45            | 2.8                  |
| Schedule design         | 38            | 2.3                  |
| Trip length             | 37            | 2.3                  |
| Lates                   | 25            | 1.5                  |
| Fatigue calls           | 24            | 1.5                  |
| Length of legs          | 20            | 1.2                  |
| Rest - Circ disruption  | 20            | 1.2                  |
| Deadhead                | 14            | 0.9                  |
| Total                   | <b>1625</b> * | *incl. 'Other' theme |





Top 5 themes

#### **Circadian switches**

- Circadian swaps (34%)
- Inconsistent duty times (25%)
- Switching time zones (18%)

"There's a, you know, 9:00 AM show, and then a 2:00 PM show, and then a 5:00 AM show. That changing unwillingly is what I find to be most fatiguing because you just never catch up, like, your body doesn't know what it's doing."



Top 5 themes

#### **Rest duration (layover)**

Code

- Short rest (42%)
- Personal factors (30%)
  Time to eat, exercise
  Time to wind down

"You know when they factor in, like, [a] 10- or 11-hour overnight, that doesn't factor in the time it takes to get up, get ready get for the van... all that stuff is not factored into your duty day... They kind of expect you're narcoleptic and then as soon as you get to the hotel you can dive into bed and be asleep. But you need that decompression time where you can get something to eat and then just a little bit of time to decompress. But on those really short ones you're just not allowed it."



Top 5 themes

#### High workload / Hassle factors

- Weather (30%)
- Maintenance (19%)
- Ground Ops (18%)
- Busy airports (14%)

"You throw me an airplane with 4 MELs [minimum equipment list], one of which is done incorrectly, you throw in weather, de-icing - suddenly that one leg, 2-hour day becomes fatiguing."



Top 5 themes

#### Number of flights

- >4 flights (41%)
- >2 flights (36%)
- >1 flight (23%)

"Multiple leg days as opposed to a one leg day for a longhaul: you have to get acquainted with the airplane, you have to work through the MELs [minimum equipment list] every single time on every single different airplane ... the weather issues, the deicing, all these little factors, you have to do multiple times in a day versus once, if that, in longhaul. And then the recoup time from those factors in longhaul is, you know, cruise flight, the lowest workload portion of the flight ... but there just isn't very much of that [in short-haul] ..."

#### Code

#### FAR 117 issues

- FAR limits as goal (37%)
- FAR revisions (24%)
- Computer scheduler (15%)

"I think that the companies look at these restrictions in [FAR Part] 117 not so much as limits to stay away from, but scheduling goals to get close to."



### **Results**

Top 5 themes

Honorable mentions

#### • Long sits

#### Redeyes

- o General (49%)
- Tag leg (12%)
- o Mid trip (8%)

#### Unpredictability

- Schedule changes (43%)
- o Planned vs. ops (29%)
- Aircraft & crew swaps

#### Rest timing

- Redeye rest (44%)
- o Day rest (33%)
- Two FDPs in calendar day (23%)



## Next steps

Field data collection

#### Defining the scope of field study

- Circadian disruption
- High workload
- Rest opportunity
- Schedule changes
- Long sits





# Actigraphy

Objective sleep measure



Freely available app

| NASA                            | $\otimes$    |                    |           |               |                           |                 |     |   |  |
|---------------------------------|--------------|--------------------|-----------|---------------|---------------------------|-----------------|-----|---|--|
| Study: SHops22<br>Subject: Demo |              |                    |           |               |                           |                 |     |   |  |
|                                 |              | ncel 🔄 🗠 Di        | uty Day 🛬 |               |                           |                 |     |   |  |
| Study Enrollment                | SEL          | ECT THE TIME TO AD | D TO.     |               |                           |                 |     |   |  |
| Day Off                         | ۲            | Upon waking up     |           |               |                           |                 |     |   |  |
|                                 |              |                    |           |               |                           | 🛫 Work Ta       | sks |   |  |
| Duty Day                        | 🛫 Work Tasks |                    |           |               | TASKS TO COMPLETE AT WORK |                 |     |   |  |
|                                 |              | Refore cleaning    |           | COMF<br>1ST S | PLETE ONC<br>ECTOR).      |                 |     |   |  |
|                                 | •            | beiore sieeping.   |           | Pre-          | Duty                      |                 |     |   |  |
| _                               |              |                    |           | COMF<br>FLOW  | PLETE DUR<br>/N IN A DAY  | ING FLIGHT FOR  |     |   |  |
|                                 |              |                    |           | ≁ Re          | ecord at                  | top of descent  |     | > |  |
|                                 |              |                    |           | COMF          | PLETE AFTI                | ER EACH FLIGHT. |     |   |  |
|                                 |              |                    |           |               | Post-Fligh                | nt              |     | 2 |  |
|                                 |              |                    |           | OST           | PLETE ONC                 |                 |     | т |  |
|                                 |              |                    |           | Post          | -Duty                     |                 |     | > |  |
|                                 |              |                    |           |               |                           |                 |     |   |  |
|                                 |              |                    |           |               |                           |                 |     |   |  |
|                                 |              |                    |           |               |                           |                 |     |   |  |
|                                 |              |                    |           |               |                           |                 |     |   |  |
|                                 |              |                    |           |               |                           | _               |     |   |  |

Images: personal

Designed for field data collection

- Baseline questionnaires
- Guides pilots through each activity at the appropriate time
- Includes objective and subjective measures
- Sleep logs
- Self-report scales
- Fatigue countermeasures
- Hassle factors
- Workload ratings
- Rest opportunity
- Turn times
- Schedule changes
- Psychomotor vigilance task (PVT)



Reaction time test



Image: Arsintescu et al., 2019

App flowchart



### **Study Status**

Ongoing

- Recruitment and data collection underway
  - Going well!
  - Great pilot interest
  - Positive feedback
- Regular meetings with collaborators and stakeholders

# Thank you

cassie.j.hilditch@nasa.gov tom.nesthus@faa.gov

Erin Flynn-Evans, PhD MPH Hannah Baumgartner, PhD Nick Bathurst, MA Kevin Gregory, BSc Lucia Arsintescu, MA Amanda Lamp, PhD Laura Barger, PhD