NASA Technical Paper 1658

Steady-State Wear and Friction in Boundary Lubrication Studies

William R. Loomis and William R. Jones, Jr.

MAY 1980
Steady-State Wear and Friction in Boundary Lubrication Studies

William R. Loomis and William R. Jones, Jr.
Lewis Research Center
Cleveland, Ohio
Summary

A friction and wear study was made at 20° C to establish some test operating limits and procedures to insure good reproducibility in the boundary lubrication regime. Ester base and C-ether base fluids were used to lubricate a pure iron rider in sliding contact with a rotating M-50 steel disk in a friction and wear apparatus. Conditions included ½- and 1-kilogram loads, 3.6 to 18.2 meter-per-minute sliding velocities, a dry air test atmosphere (<100 ppm H2O), and step-wise time interval sequences from 1 to 250 minutes. Wear rate results were determined and compared with those from previous studies where only a single test duration of 25 minutes was used.

Satisfactory test conditions for studying the friction and wear characteristics with a sliding friction and wear apparatus in the boundary lubrication regime for C-ethers and esters were found to include a 1-kilogram load, 50-rpm disk speed (7.1 to 9.1 m/min sliding contact velocities), and use of a time stepwise procedure for measuring wear to establish reliable linear wear rates.

Under the above experimental conditions, highly reproducible “steady-state wear rates” and “steady-state friction coefficients” were determined for C-ether base ($\sim 8.5 \times 10^{-15} \text{ m}^3/\text{m wear rate}$) and ester base ($\sim 2.3 \times 10^{-13} \text{ m}^3/\text{m wear rate}$) at room temperature. These wear-distance (or time) relationships were found to be highly linear after an initial 20- to 40-minute run-in period of high wear rates and friction coefficients. Wear rates determined from one 25-minute wear measurement, where run-in wear predominates, were more than one order of magnitude higher and less reproducible.

Introduction

A number of boundary lubrication studies have been made of candidate hydraulic fluids and lubricants for use in advanced aircraft and re-entry vehicles (refs. 1 to 4). Friction and wear measurements were made with various fluids using a sliding friction and wear apparatus as a screening device. Generally, the experimental conditions for these earlier tests were standardized as follows: Both test components (i.e., rider and disk) were hardened CVM M-50 steel (Rockwell C62 to 64), a normal load of 1 kilogram was applied with a deadweight, and a 17-meter-per-minute (100 rpm) disk surface speed was maintained for the 25-minute test duration. Test run variables included comparative runs in dry air (<100 ppm H2O) and moist air (relative humidity of 50 percent at 25° C and runs at various disk temperatures between room temperature and 300° C (572° F).

Results of these earlier lubrication studies indicated very low wear rates with the operating mode applied. C-ether base and formulated fluids at a temperature of 25° C (77° F) in a dry air atmosphere gave wear rates in the range of $3.0 \times 10^{-15}$ to $4.5 \times 10^{-15}$ cubic meter per meter of sliding distance. Contributing to these low wear rates were (1) the fact that both rubbing components are of the same wear-resistant tool steel, and (2) the probability that operating conditions resulted in “mixed” lubrication (especially at the lower temperatures), as described by Dowson in reference 5, where lower wear would be expected. Variations in test parameters from test to test and their effect on wear rate are accentuated in low-wear situations and thereby lessen the chances of obtaining reproducible results. Furthermore, the unpredictability of higher run-in wear during the first 10 to 20 minutes of these test runs also adversely affected reproducibility. With all previous testing having been done over a single, fixed test duration, the so-called rider wear rates reported were simply wear volume measurements. Equilibrium or “steady-state” wear rates and friction were not determined. The idea of a run-in, high initial wear period, followed by a fairly constant wear rate period is common and is cited frequently in text books as well as papers on wear (refs. 6 to 9). However, quantification of these wear rates has been needed, especially in the practice of using steady-state values for repetitive evaluation of lubricating fluids.

Another significant result of these previous lubrication studies was that in general, lower wear rates were observed when fluids were tested in moist air as compared with a dry air atmosphere. In selecting the test atmosphere to use for future studies of this type it would seem appropriate to consider dry air, which is the more severe condition (ref. 1).

The objectives of this investigation were (1) to establish operating test parameters and procedures for obtaining more reproducible wear rates and friction coefficients for boundary lubrication studies using liquid lubricants and (2) to determine wear rate and friction coefficient for “steady-state” operation.
Pure annealed iron (99.99 percent iron) riders were used instead of M-50 tool steel to achieve larger and more easily measured wear scars, the iron being much softer than M-50 tool steel disks. Surface sliding velocities and loads were selected which avoided elastohydrodynamic and "mixed" lubrication regions.

Other experimental conditions were \( \frac{1}{2} \) - and 1-kilogram loads (initial Hertz stresses of \( 0.8 \times 10^9 \) and \( 1 \times 10^9 \) N/m\(^2\), respectively); sliding velocities of 3.6- to 18.2-meter per minute; time sequences for each test run of 1 to 250 minutes; and use of an ester-base fluid (Specification MIL-L-27502 candidate base) and a C-ether-base fluid as experimental lubricants.

**Apparatus**

The sliding friction and wear apparatus used in this study is shown in figure 1. The test specimens were contained inside a stainless-steel chamber, and the chamber atmosphere was controlled with respect to moisture content. A stationary 0.476-centimeter-radius, hemispherically tipped rider was placed in sliding contact with a rotating 6.35-centimeter-diameter disk. Rider holders of three different lengths were used to permit three parallel (or concentric) wear tracks to be run on a single disk, thereby eliminating the need to refinish disk surfaces after each run. Sliding velocities ranged from about 3.6 to 18.2 meters per minute as disk rotational speeds were maintained at 25, 50, 75, and 100 rpm when using each of the three rider holders. Table I contains the calculated sliding contact velocities for each rider holder-rotational speed combination.

A normal load of \( \frac{1}{2} \) or 1 kilogram was applied with a deadweight. Disks were made of CVM M-50 tool steel and heat treated to a hardness of Rockwell C 62 to 64. Riders were made of pure iron (99.99 percent iron) and were annealed to a DPH (diamond pyramid hardness number) hardness of 70 to 92 kilograms per square millimeter as measured on an Eberbach microhardness tester at a 150-gram load.

The disk was partially submerged in a polyimide cup containing the test lubricant, and bulk lubricant temperature was measured with a thermocouple. Frictional force was measured with a strain gage and was recorded on an X-Y chart recorder.

The test chamber atmosphere used in this study was dry air (<100 ppm H\(_2\)O) obtained by drying and filtering service air. The moisture concentration was monitored by a moisture analyzer with an accuracy of \( \pm 10 \) parts per million.

**Procedure**

Disks were ground and lapped to a surface finish of \( 10 \times 10^{-8} \) to \( 20 \times 10^{-8} \) meter (4 to 8 \( \mu \)m.), rms. Rider tips were machined and polished to a surface finish of \( 5 \times 10^{-8} \) to \( 10 \times 10^{-8} \) meter (2 to 4 \( \mu \)m.), rms. Specimens were scrubbed with a paste of levigated alumina and water, rinsed with tap and distilled water, then placed in a desicator.

Test lubricants were degassed at approximately 150° C (302° F) at \( 2.7 \times 10^2 \)-newton-per-square meter pressure for 1 hour. Measurements using the Karl Fisher technique indicate that this degassing procedure reduces dissolved water content in the test fluids to less than 20 ppm.

The specimens were assembled, and approximately \( 3 \times 10^{-5} \) cubic meter (30 ml) of lubricant were placed in the lubricant cup. The test chamber (\( 3.7 \times 10^{-3} \) m\(^3\) volume) was purged with the dry air test atmosphere for 10 minutes at a flow rate in excess of \( 5 \times 10^{-2} \)
cubic meter per hour. The rider was then loaded against the disk with the deadweight, and the test run period was started at that time. Dry air atmosphere flow rate was reduced to $3.5 \times 10^{-2}$ cubic meter per hour, and a $6.9 \times 10^3$-newton-per-square meter (1 psig) pressure was maintained in the test chamber.

Rider wear scar diameters were measured and recorded after sliding experiment intervals that varied from 1 to 250 minutes. Most wear measurements were made after 1, 3, 10, 20, 40, 70, and 130 minutes. Disk wear with pure iron riders was so small that it was immeasurable. Operating times were selected for each disk speed so that total sliding distance for all runs was in the range of about 900 to 1200 meters. Frictional force was continuously recorded during the experiments.

### Experimental Lubricants

The experimental fluids used in this study were an ester-base fluid and a C-ether-base fluid. Some typical properties of the test fluids appear in table II. The ester fluid is a special synthesized unformulated mixture of the following: Hindered polyol esters of straight chain fatty acids (C₅ to C₁₀), a polyester, and dipentaerythritol esters. This ester blend has been used as a base stock for a specification MIL-L-27502 candidate lubricant (-40° to 465° F) and is described in references 10 and 11. The C-ether base fluid used in this study was originally described in reference 12 and more recently in reference 13. This fluid is a blend of three-ring and four-ring components, which are structurally similar to the polyphenyl ethers, and contains an antifoam additive.

### Results and Discussion

#### Lubrication Regime

A series of wear tests at 20° C was run with the ester base fluid at four disk speeds from 25 to 100 rpm and at loads of $\frac{1}{2}$ and 1 kilogram. The 25 rpm rate is about the lowest controllable speed for this test rig, and the 100 rpm rate is the speed used in previous studies (refs. 1 to 4) with this apparatus. Although generally a 1 kilogram load had been employed previously, the $\frac{1}{2}$-kilogram load was used to determine the effects of a lower load and lower speeds. Since practically all bearing failures (regardless of type) involve boundary lubrication to some degree (ref. 14), it is important that the test conditions be chosen for that regime.

Results of those wear tests, plotted in figure 2, show consistent linear relations with sliding distances in the range of 150 to 1200 meters at constant loads and disk speeds. Wear rates were calculated as the slopes of these lines using the linear regression fit formula (least squares estimates) as described in references 15 and 16. High wear rate values were observed during these wear tests before the inception of the constant rates shown in figure 2. A discussion

### Table II. Typical Properties of the Experimental Fluids

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Properties</th>
<th>Ester-base fluid</th>
<th>C-ether-base fluid</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kinematic viscosity, m²/sec (cS):</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At 38° C (100° F)</td>
<td>$3.96 \times 10^5$ (39.6)</td>
<td>$2.5 \times 10^5$ (25)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At 99° C (210° F)</td>
<td>$7.02 \times 10^6$ (7.02)</td>
<td>$4.1 \times 10^6$ (4.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At 150° C (302° F)</td>
<td>$2.80 \times 10^6$ (2.80)</td>
<td>$1.9 \times 10^6$ (1.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At 260° C (500° F)</td>
<td>$1.06 \times 10^6$ (1.06)</td>
<td>$7.6 \times 10^5$ (0.76)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At 300° C (572° F)</td>
<td>$8.6 \times 10^7$ (0.86)</td>
<td>$6.9 \times 10^7$ (0.69)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pour point, °C (°F)</td>
<td>51 (-60)</td>
<td>29 (-20)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flash point, °C (°F)</td>
<td>274 (525)</td>
<td>239 (445)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire point, °C (°F)</td>
<td>298 (536)</td>
<td>390 (734)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Density at 38° C (100° F), kg/m³ (g/ml)</td>
<td>0.994</td>
<td>1.19 $\times 10^3$ (1.19)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thermal decomposition (isotensicope), °C (°F)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vapor pressure, N/m²</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At 220° C (428° F)</td>
<td>$1.33 \times 10^2$</td>
<td>$1.86 \times 10^4$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At 371° C (600° F)</td>
<td></td>
<td>$4.48 \times 10^4$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surface tension at 23° C (73° F), N/cm (dynes/cm)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Manufacturer’s data.

*Base stock for formulating a MIL-L-27502 candidate lubricant.

*Extrapolated.

*Specific gravity, 15.6° C/15.6° C (60° F/60° F).

*Measured in authors’ laboratory.
2.00 \times 10^{-12}

\begin{align*}
0 & \quad 20 \quad 40 \quad 60 \quad 80 \quad 100 \quad 120 \quad 140 \\
\text{Rider wear, m}^3
\end{align*}

(b) 1-Kilogram load.

Figure 2. - Rider wear as function of sliding distance for an ester-base lubricant. Atmosphere, dry air; disk temperature, 20°C.

of this initial, run-in wear phenomenon will be given in a later section of this report.

A presentation of these computed wear data is given in table III along with the correlation coefficients \( R \) for each set of operating conditions. The correlation coefficient is the approximate measure of the degree of fit for a linear relation of the two variables (ref. 15). Thus, the consistently high absolute values of \( R \) for the reported variables indicate a high degree of association between them.

The square of the correlation coefficient \( R^2 \) is an even more significant parameter for determining these variable relations. It measures the proportion of the total variation between the two parameters accounted for by the regression equation (ref. 17). Thus, the data given in figure 2 and table III indicate that between 98.9 and 99.8 percent of the relation between rider wear and sliding distance can be shown as a straight line function.

Good reproducibility of these wear rate results is shown in two sets of five test runs where the operating conditions were the same (1-kg load, 20°C disk temperature), while the disk speeds were held at 50 and 100 rpm, respectively. Standard deviations from their mean values indicate a variance of less than 9 percent.

A presentation of these wear rates as a function of disk speed (rubbing surface velocity) at the two loads is given in figure 3. We conclude from these data that wear tests were being performed in the boundary lubrication regime in the lower disk speed range of 25 to 50 rpm and at the higher load value of 1 kilogram since the wear rates at these speeds are essentially at a constant value \(-23.5 \times 10^{-14} \text{m}^3/\text{m}\). This conclusion is based on an earlier determination (ref. 5) that for practical purposes wear rate in the region of boundary lubrication is independent of the rubbing speed, which is the case here. For all other operating conditions shown in figure 3, wear rates decreased as surface velocities increased. These would be the cases where film thicknesses would increase with speed increases as in the mixed lubrication regime (ref. 18).

The effect of load on wear rate is further evidence that operating conditions are within the boundary lubricating regime where higher loads resulted in increased wear rates. Although the data were limited to only the two loads under study, the results plotted in figure 3 do show that the greatest effect of load on wear rate occurred at a disk speed of 50 rpm. Previous boundary lubrication studies (refs. 5, 9, and 19) had shown an increase in wear rate with increa-
ing loads, although there does not seem to be any simple general functional relation.

Results of this parametric study are much as expected, in that lower speeds and higher loads tend to drive most systems towards boundary lubrication (ref. 14). All studies with this apparatus using the C-ether base fluid were at a load of 1 kilogram and at a disk speed of 50 rpm to insure that boundary lubrication conditions are realized.

Steady-State Wear Rate

A series of wear tests at 20°C was run with the C-ether base fluid at 1-kilogram load and 50 rpm disk speed. Time intervals for measuring rider wear scars were at 10, 50, 90, and 130 minutes. Plots of rider wear volume versus sliding distance and time are shown in figure 4 for each of the rider holders, which resulted in sliding speeds of 7.1, 8.1, and 9.1 meters per minute. These wear-time curves are characteristic of the type first described by Hirst and Lancaster (ref. 9) for relatively soft metals in contact with a hard metal where the essential feature is that the wear rate is initially high but later decreases to a lower constant value. The slopes of the linear relations of figure 4 in the range of 50 to 130 minutes are herein defined as the “steady-state wear rates” for these studies. These calculated wear rates were determined to be very constant and reproducible values of 8.3 × 10^{-15}, 8.6 × 10^{-15}, and 8.5 × 10^{-15} cubic meter per meter of sliding distance. These give a mean value of 8.45 × 10^{-15} and a standard deviation of ±0.021 × 10^{-15} cubic meter per meter, a variance of only ±2.5 percent. This is considered high reproducibility for sliding wear tests under these conditions. Using $R^2$ values, these variables have an estimated 98 percent straight-line relation. As shown in figure 4, if wear rates were calculated from one 25-minute wear measurement (as in refs. 1 and 2), their values of 116 × 10^{-15}, 106 × 10^{-15}, and 83 × 10^{-15} cubic meter per meter (mean, 101.7 × 10^{-15}, standard deviation of ±16.9 × 10^{-15}, and variance of ±17 percent) would be over an order of magnitude higher than the steady-state rates, and less reproducible.

Steady-State Coefficient of Friction

Figure 5 shows plots of the friction coefficients measured during the stepwise wear tests for C-ether base fluids described in the previous section. All
Run-In Period

As shown from rider wear results of figure 4, a run-in period of 20 to 30 minutes was needed before constant or steady-state wear rates were established. Rider wear volume measurements at three run times (50, 90, and 130 min) were sufficient to establish a reliable linear wear-time (wear rate) relation.

Likewise, friction coefficient results of figure 5 from the same test runs showed the ability to predict run-in times independently of wear results. The determination of run-in periods from the two methods were in good agreement with each other.

Another reliable method for determining run-in periods and for enhancing the predictability of the wear phenomenon involves the plotting of unit contact stresses over the time period studied. An example of this is shown in figure 6 where unit contact stress data (normal load per wear-scar area) are plotted as a function of sliding distance and time for several ester-base fluid test runs at ½ and 1 kilogram loads and a disk speed of 50 rpm. Contact stresses begin to taper off to levels of $3.0 \times 10^6$ to $2.5 \times 10^6 \text{ N/m}^2$ (435 to 362 psi) at sliding distances of greater than 300 meters. This corresponds to an elapsed run-in time of about 35 minutes after initially high stress values were experienced ($>30 \times 10^6 \text{ N/m}^2$ after 1 minute and $8 \times 10^6 \text{ N/m}^2$ after 10 min). Of course contact stresses should continue to decrease at an ever decreasing rate throughout the operating life of the sliding components as wear progresses.

Run-In Wear

Run-in wear is the initial high-rate wear that is experienced before the onset of the usually lower and linear "steady-state wear rate" phenomenon. Run-in wear behavior of some liquid lubricants in the
TABLE IV. - TYPICAL RUN-IN AND STEADY-STATE WEAR VALUES FOR C-ETHER- AND ESTER-BASE FLUIDS

[Disk temperature, 20° C; load, 1 kilogram; disk speed, 50 rpm.]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Test fluid</th>
<th>Run-in period</th>
<th>Steady-state period</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Duration, min</td>
<td>Wear, m$^3$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-ether base</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2.1×10$^{-11}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ester base</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4.0×10$^{-11}$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Extrapolated values.

boundary lubrication regime could be important if it is a significant fraction of the total wear that occurs during “lifetime” or prolonged operating times. Table IV shows typical run-in wear and steady-state wear values for both test fluids. The sum of these two wear values is the total wear for the test run. This tabulation indicates that run-in wear during the 130-minute test period was significant for the C-ether base fluid (76 percent of the total wear) but was less significant for the ester-base fluid (only 16 percent of total wear). Furthermore, it is shown that for more prolonged runs of 300 and 600 minutes, where the steady-state wear is extrapolated to more realistic running times, run-in wear becomes less significant (37 percent for C-ethers and only 3.4 percent for esters).

The most reproducible comparisons of wear behavior appear to be of steady-state wear rate determinations where run-in wear is not the dominant factor. As a further refinement in defining the lubricating ability of a fluid, consideration could be given to including run-in wear, run-in wear rate, or total wear.

Summary of Results

A friction and wear study was made at 20° C to establish some test operating limits and procedures to insure better reproducibility in the boundary lubrication regime. Ester-base and C-ether-base fluids were used in a sliding friction and wear apparatus (pure iron on CVM M-50 steel) in a dry air (<100 ppm H$_2$O) test atmosphere. Other conditions were 1/4- and 1-kilogram loads (initial Hertz stresses of 0.8×10$^9$ and 1×10$^9$ N/m$^2$), sliding velocities of 3.6 to 18.2 meters per minute, and test times from 1 to 250 minutes. Wear rate results were calculated from wear measurements by the linear regression formula and compared with those obtained in previous studies where a single, fixed test duration (25 min) was used. The major results were the following:

1. Satisfactory test conditions for studying boundary lubrication friction and wear characteristics of C-ether and ester fluids in the apparatus used in this study were found to be pure iron rider on M-50 steel disk; dry test atmosphere (<100 ppm H$_2$O); 1-kilogram normal load; 50 rpm disk speed; and use of a time stepwise procedure for measuring wear with as few as three time intervals to establish reliable linear wear rates up to about 130 minutes (~1000 m of sliding distance). Higher speeds or lower load produced mixed lubrication.

2. Steady-state wear rates appear to be the best single parameter for determining comparative lubrication behavior among fluids. Highly reproducible steady-state or equilibrium wear rates were determined for C-ether base (~8.5×10$^{-15}$ m$^3$/m) and ester base (~2.3×10$^{-13}$ m$^3$/m) fluids under boundary lubrication conditions. These wear-distance (or time) relations were found to have 98 to 99.8 percent linearity following an initial 20 to 40 minute run-in period during which higher wear rates, friction coefficients, and unit contact stress levels prevailed. Run-in wear rates were more than an order of magnitude higher and less reproducible than the “steady state” values.

3. Reproducible steady-state or equilibrium coefficients of friction were measured during the same experimental time periods as corresponding steady-state wear rates. Constant values of about 0.09 were recorded after the run-in period.

Lewis Research Center,
National Aeronautics and Space Administration,
Cleveland, Ohio, December 13, 1979,
505-04.
References