General Disclaimer

One or more of the Following Statements may affect this Document

- This document has been reproduced from the best copy furnished by the organizational source. It is being released in the interest of making available as much information as possible.

- This document may contain data, which exceeds the sheet parameters. It was furnished in this condition by the organizational source and is the best copy available.

- This document may contain tone-on-tone or color graphs, charts and/or pictures, which have been reproduced in black and white.

- This document is paginated as submitted by the original source.

- Portions of this document are not fully legible due to the historical nature of some of the material. However, it is the best reproduction available from the original submission.

Produced by the NASA Center for Aerospace Information (CASI)
Replacing Critical and Strategic Refractory Metal Elements in Nickel-Base Superalloys

Joseph R. Stephens, Robert L. Dreshfield, and Michael W. Nathal

Lewis Research Center
Cleveland, Ohio

Prepared for the
First USA-Brazil Superalloy Conference
sponsored by the American Society for Metals
Araxa, Brazil, April 6-13, 1984
Replacing Critical and Strategic Refractory Metal Elements in Nickel-Base Superalloys

Jospeh R. Stephens, Robert L. Dreshfield, and Michael V. Nathal
National Aeronautics and Space Administration
Lewis Research Center
Cleveland, Ohio 44135

ABSTRACT

The United States imports over 90 percent of the cobalt, chromium, tantalum, and niobium that is required for domestic consumption. Nickel-base superalloys that contain these metals as alloying elements are essential in high performance gas turbine engines required for today's civilian and military aircraft. These four alloying elements have been identified as strategic and critical in the aerospace industry. NASA has undertaken a fundamental program called COSAM - Conservation of Strategic Aerospace Materials aimed at reducing the need for strategic materials in gas turbine engines. Technological thrusts in two major areas are under way and include strategic element substitution and alternative material identification. This paper will provide a summary of the adoption of refractory metals in nickel-base superalloys including their roles in mechanical strengthening and environmental resistance; present the current research activities under way in the COSAM Program; and summarize the research findings to date.

The purposes of this paper are to review the use of refractory metals in nickel-base superalloys and to describe NASA's research activities in replacing those refractory metals that are considered to be critical and strategic to the aerospace industry.

As a working definition of critical and strategic metals, we use the following: those predominantly or wholly imported elements contained in the metallic alloys used in aerospace components which are essential to the strategic economic health of the U.S. aerospace industry. As a result of meetings with the ASME Gas Turbine Panel in 1979 and a survey of aerospace companies in 1980, we have focused primarily on the aircraft engine industry's needs. Based on these and further discussions with several aircraft engine manufacturers, four elements emerged that were of particular concern. The alloys used to build the critical high temperature components for aircraft propulsion systems require the use of the three refractory metals Cr, Ta, and Nb plus Co. These metals are contained in superalloys, steels, and stainless steels that are used in engine manufacturing. The location of these metals in aircraft engine compressors, turbines, and combustors is illustrated in Fig. 1. Typical requirements by weight are shown in Fig. for the F-100 engines. The need for such materials has increased as the demands have grown for higher durability, higher performance, fuel efficient aircraft turbine engines. Because of the essential nature of these metals and in order for the U.S. aircraft industry to maintain its competitive position, it is necessary that supplies be readily available at a reasonably stable cost. To achieve these requirements, domestic sources of key metals are desirable. However, the United States has never been self-sufficient in these metals. Today, we are almost totally dependent on foreign sources for these metals (ref. 1). Therefore, the U.S. aircraft engine industry can be seen to be highly vulnerable to supply instabilities of the essential metals for engine manufacturing. Accompanying supply disruptions or increased demand are price changes of several hundred percent as shown in Fig. 3 (after ref. 2). These rapid price increases illustrate the vulnerability of the U.S. aircraft engine industry to cost fluctuations. The essential nature of Cr, Ta, Nb, and Co, along with their vulnerability to supply instabilities and cost fluctuations, combine to cause these metals to be classified as critical and strategic aerospace metals. Their sensitivity to total disruption during a time of worldwide crisis is, of course, readily recognizable.

This reliance on the importance of the strategic metals used in today's military and commercial aircraft engines poses a threat to the national security of the United States. This view has been expressed by many sectors of the materials industry. For example, E. F. Andrews, Vice President of Allegheny International said, "The national security and economic survival of the..."
United States depend upon the nation's capability to secure an uninterrupted flow of critical minerals from politically unstable third world nations (ref. 3). Former Secretary of Interior James Watt was quoted as saying, "I considered energy to be the extreme problem of the '70's; minerals are going to be the problem of the '80's" (ref. 1).

The metals discussed herein also are vital to the welfare of the nation's economy since aerospace sales are a major positive contributor to our balance of payments (ref. 4). Thus, the continued availability of critical elements at a reasonable cost is a national issue which requires cooperative action between industry and appropriate government agencies. In order to offset or minimize possible future disruptions in supply, efforts to develop viable options must be pursued aggressively since a new material can take from 6 to 9 years of research and development efforts before qualifying for such aerospace service. Thus, a long term commitment to the introduction of a sound technology based upon which to respond to interruptions or price fluctuations is in the best national interest.

NASA Lewis Research Center has undertaken a long-range program in support of the aerospace industry aimed at reducing the need of critical and strategic materials used in gas turbine engines (refs. 5 to 8). The program is called COSAM - Conservation of Strategic Aerospace Materials. This program has three general objectives. These are to (1) contribute basic scientific understanding to the turbine engine "technology bank" so as to maintain our national security in possible times of constriction or interruption of our strategic material supply lines; (2) help reduce the dependence of United States military and civilian gas turbine engines on disruptive worldwide supply/price fluctuations in regard to strategic materials; and by these research contributions (3) help minimize the acquisition costs as well as optimize the performance of such engines so as to contribute to the United States position of preeminence in world gas turbine engine markets.

We will present a brief history of the introduction of refractory metals in nickel-base superalloys, describe the specific research activities under way with the COSAM Program aimed at reducing the use of the critical and strategic refractory metals, and discuss research results available to date.

**HISTORY OF REFRATORY METAL ALLOYING**

**INTRODUCTION INTO SUPERALLOYS -** Later in this conference we will hear three sessions solely devoted to the physical and mechanical metallurgy of the refractory metals in superalloys. At this point we feel it would be of interest to briefly review chronologically the history of refractory metal additions to the nickel-base superalloys. We will restrict our definition of refractory metals to Groups V, VI, and VII elements (fig. 4) and accept that the Ni-base superalloys were "born" with 20 wt% Cr in an 80 wt% Ni alloy for electrical heating elements at around the beginning of this century. In 1926, Heraeus Vacuumschmelze A. G. received a patent for a nickel-chromium alloy which may contain up to 15 wt% W and 12 wt% Mo. The purpose of the refractory metal additions was to raise the yield point (ref. 9). As late as 1930, however, Campbell (ref. 10) failed to show either W or Mo as major alloying elements either for resistance alloys or for heat-resisting alloys. Inspection of his "resistance alloy" list reveals one resistance alloy containing 1 to 2 wt% W.

His nickel-base "heat resisting alloys" list has one "nichrome" containing 1.33 wt% Mo and an alloy designated "Pyros" containing 5 wt% W. There are also two Fe-base "heat-resisting alloys" containing either W or Mo additions. Campbell's list also shows that by 1930, the use of Mo and W was widely accepted in Co-base alloys.

The principal impetus for superalloy development has been the aircraft gas turbine engine (refs. 9 and 11). The first age-hardenable Ni-base superalloy to be commercially produced was Nimonic 80A, an age-hardening Ni - 20 wt% Cr alloy. In 1940 a British patent was filed by Pfeil (ref. 9) for a heat treatable alloy of at least 20 wt% Mo and/or W. In the late 1940's Gresham et al., in Great Britain showed that Mo additions benefitted Ni-base superalloys, but commercial exploitation of Mo additions waited until 1955 - the introduction of Nimonic 100 (ref. 11). In the early 50's, the alloys being introduced in the United States, such as Waspaloy**, were alloys containing about 5 wt% Mo (ref. 11). The only commercially significant alloy to use V is IN-100, which became available in about 1960. In the early 60's, W and Ta were widely accepted for alloys in Ni-base alloys. On the other hand, Inconel 713C (a casting alloy) containing 2 wt% Nb was available before the end of the 50's. Demonstration of the effectiveness of Re addition to Ni-base alloys occurred in the late 60's (ref. 12).

The increasing use trend for refractory metals is shown in Fig. 5 and table 1. It is apparent that, on a weight basis, the refractory metal content of Ni-base superalloys tended to steadily increase from the mid-60's to about 1980. The maximum content was in alloy TRW-NASA VIA, which was developed in the mid-60's. If the trend is viewed on an atom base, Fig. 5(b) shows the use of refractory metals increased from 1 to about 6 at.% in less than one decade. Except for René 150, which contains nearly 8 at.% refractory metals, it appears that TRW-NASA VIA represents a maximum of 6.6 at.% and proficient alloys have, in fact, used slightly lower amounts of refractory metals. A reason for the slight decrease from 6.6 at.% will be offered in brief discussions of the physical metallurgy of re-

*Nimonic is a tradename of the International Nickel Company.

**Waspaloy is a tradename of United Technologies Corporation.

Stephens, Dreshfield, Nathal
refractory metal additions to nickel-base superalloys which follows.

REFRACTORY METALS AND PROPERTIES - In the early years of superalloy development, the goal was clearly to advance operating temperatures. This of course also increased the strength level at constant temperatures. The early use of virtually all the refractory metals was in fact intended to improve creep-rupture and other high temperature mechanical properties. Because the alloy improvements were made by combinations of increasing γ’ content, the principal strengtheners in Ni-base superalloys, and refractory metal content, the improvements due to each are confounded.

The work of Freche (ref. 13) and his co-workers in the early 60’s did demonstrate that additions of V and Ta were beneficial to the tensile strength and stress-rupture life of Ni-base superalloys at 980° C. During the development of alloy TRW-NASA VIA (ref. 14), it was shown that W and Ta could improve stress-rupture life at 1095° C. Subsequently, the benefit to stress-rupture life of small Re additions was established by Collins (ref. 15) for the same alloy. More recently, Lin (ref. 16) has shown that Re additions could also improve creep-rupture life of an alloy similar to MAR-M 200.1

As the operating temperature of gas turbines increased, the Cr level of the advanced alloys decreased. This can be seen in table I by comparing the 20 wt % Cr of Nimonic 80A to the 5 to 10 wt % Cr of alloys such as René 150 or PWA 454. The reason for this combination was that the turbine blade life became limited by surface stability rather than mechanical failure. The first alloy to encounter the problem was Nimonic 100 (ref. 9), which was quickly replaced by Nimonic 105 having about 5 wt% more Cr. In the new alloys Ta and Nb are reported to be beneficial to surface stability (refs. 17 and 18); however, Cr and Al are the primary elements to control oxidation and corrosion resistance of the alloys.

It should therefore be recognized that, while the prime motive in refractory metal additions to Ni-base superalloys has been to increase strength levels, both Ta and Nb additions can also be beneficial to the alloy’s surface stability.

PHYSICAL METALLURGY OF REFRACTORY METAL ADDITIONS - The modern Ni-base superalloys are composed of a face-centered-cubic (FCC) Ni-rich solid solution called γ; 20 to 65 wt% of Ni3Al, Ti—an ordered-FCC phase called γ'; and a small amount of a variety of carbides; in the higher B-containing alloys, some borides may also be present. After prolonged exposure to elevated temperature, γ, γ', Laves, and body-centered-cubic (BCC) phases such as a-W may also be observed. The amount, size, and distribution of the γ' together with its lattice mismatch relative to the γ phase are generally accepted as being the principal parameters governing the mechanical behavior of the alloys. In addition, the amount and morphology of the minor phases can have a profound influence on some mechanical properties. For detailed reviews of the physical and mechanical metallurgy of Ni-base superalloys, readers are referred to Refs. 9, 11, and 19.

During the period 1940 to date, the use temperature has increased at a rate of about 9° C per year as shown in Fig. 6. This has been accomplished through the combined effects of improved chemistry and innovative processing. While the principal chemical changes increased the amount of γ', the greater than 50 wt% (by Al and Ti additions) in the most advanced blade and disk alloys, the importance of the refractory metals cannot be overlooked. Mo, W, and Nb are regarded as effective solid solution strengtheners which act to principally strengthen the γ phase (refs. 9 and 13). The maximum solubility of the refractory elements in Ni (ref. 19) is shown in table II. It can be seen that these metals have high solubility in the γ, although in γ-saturated γ the levels are significantly reduced. For example, in a series of experimental superalloys, only 8.7 at.% Mo and 5 at.% W were found to be soluble in γ at 850° C (ref. 22). These levels are significantly below the maximum solubility shown in table II (refs. 23 and 24). Either Mo- or W-rich solid solution phases were observed to precipitate in some of the experimental superalloys. It was suggested that if the alloy contained less than 67 at.% Ni (+ Co) and the γ contained Cr, Mo, and W such that Cr + 1.75 (Mo + W) is greater than 33 at.% Cr, then minor phases such as γ'/γ', Mo23C6 rather than M23C6 or M6C rather than M23C6 (ref. 28). V, Ta, and Nb, on the other hand, tend to form monocarbides — MC phases.

Niobium is known also to form Ni3Nb, an orthorhombic or metastable tetragonal phase, which can be an effective strengthening element. The metallurgy of Ni3Nb which forms the strengthening basis for the alloy Inconel 718, the most widely used of all the superalloys in gas turbine engines, Mr. Romesh will describe this alloy in much greater detail later in this meeting.

The influence of the refractory metals is also seen in carbide stabilization. Alloys which are low in Cr and high in Mo and W tend to form MC rather than M3C6 (ref. 28). V, Ta, and Nb, on the other hand, tend to form monocarbides — MC phases.

REFERENCES - The discussions presented here are far from complete. Since most descriptions be applied with caution. Since most

Stephens, Dreshfield, Nathal

1MAR-M is a tradename of Martin Metals Company.
of the phases have significant solubility for a variety of metals, simple additions of elements can cause a variety of complex results. For example, consider the relative solubilities of Mo, W, Ta, and Nb in both the $\gamma$ and $\gamma'$ phases. Typical partitioning ratios for several refractory metals are shown in Table III. One might also use these data to differentiate $\gamma'$ formers from $\gamma$ formers. If the ratio is less than unity (i.e., 1:1), the element tends to stabilize $\gamma$ (i.e., Cr, Mo). The converse is true of $\gamma'$ stabilizers. While the refractory metals Nb, Ta, and V are strong $\gamma$ stabilizers, W has no significant tendency toward either phase. The partitioning of Re has not been definitely established, although its increase in strengthening effect relative to W is consistent with a solvus temperature and the amount of $\gamma'$ phase, as well as reduced dependence on strategic metals, will be achieved in the area of strategic element substitution by systematically examining the effects of replacing tantalum and niobium with less strategic elements in current, high-use engine alloys. This will help guide future material specifications if one or more of these metals becomes in short supply, and will create a powerful base of understanding that will benefit all future advanced alloy development.

Thus, when considering the alloying effect of the refractory elements, one must recall the complex nature of the Ni-base superalloys. The alloy addition will alter the carbides, change the amount of $\gamma'$ and the misfit between the $\gamma'$ and $\gamma$ and thus affect properties. Further, if excessive amounts of the refractory elements are used, additional phases such as the BCC solid solutions, $\alpha$, or $\gamma$ may form.

COSAM PROGRAM

The rationale for undertaking the COSAM Program was given in the introduction section of this paper while the history of refractory metal alloying brought out the importance of these metals in today's superalloys used in the aerospace industry. Programs have not been initiated to replace Re in Ni-base superalloys. However, because of its limited use to date in the aerospace industry, programs have not been initiated to replace Re in Ni-base superalloys.

NASA plans to accomplish the general objectives of the COSAM Program outlined in the introduction by creating the understanding needed to minimize the use of strategic metals in advanced aerospace systems. This program is being undertaken via two major research thrusts: strategic element substitution and alternative material identification. A smaller effort also is underway involving advanced processing concepts. Results from the research and any required supporting technology will help create the materials technology options needed to allow industry to make trade-offs in material properties for critical components versus the cost and availability of their strategic metal content. Conservation, as well as reduced dependence on strategic metals, will be achieved in the area of strategic element substitution by systematically examining the effects of replacing tantalum and niobium with less strategic elements in current, high-use engine alloys. This will help guide future material specifications if one or more of these metals becomes in short supply, and will create a powerful base of understanding that will benefit all future advanced alloy development.

And in the longer term, the development (higher risk) of alternative materials that can replace most strategic metals with others readily available in the U.S. could lead to a dramatic reduction in the U.S. dependence on foreign sources. This later technology area will help conserve all four strategic metals: Cr, Ta, Nb, and Co.

The various efforts are being conducted under the overall programmatic management of the NASA Lewis Research Center. Some of this work is being conducted in-house at Lewis. In addition, cooperative programs involving Lewis working together with both industry and universities in tripartite projects are underway to optimize the utilization of the expertise at each of the various organizations and to seek synergistic results from these combined efforts. In the following section, COSAM Program research efforts will be presented and initial results discussed.

PRESENT COSAM EFFORTS ON REFRACTORY METALS IN SUPERALLOYS

STRATEGIC ELEMENT SUBSTITUTION - As part of NASA's COSAM Program, the influence of strategic refractory metals on the properties and microstructure of Ni-base superalloys is presently being examined. The goals of this research are to provide a basic understanding of the mechanisms by which the refractory metals strengthen the superalloys and to provide effective substitutes for alloying additions that may become limited in supply. Currently, programs examining the roles of Ta and Nb in several alloys are in various stages of progress.

The influence of Ta on the creep resistance of single crystal superalloys is currently being investigated by Nathal and Ebert (Ref. 30). The alloy NASAIR 100 is a modification of MAR-M 247 designed for single crystal applications and contains 3.0 wt% Ta and 1.0 wt% W among other alloying additions (Ref. 31). Alloys were prepared with the Ta content removed (i.e., with Ni substituted for Ta or with Ta substituted for Nb).

Nathal and Ebert's results showed that the removal of Ta caused large decreases in the $\gamma'$ solvus temperature and the amount of $\gamma'$ phase, which is consistent with the known tendency of Ta to partition strongly to the $\gamma'$ phase. Substituting Nb for Ta resulted in a dramatic decrease in the $\gamma'$ solvus temperature and a large decrease in $\gamma'$ phase volume fraction. These results suggest that Nb is a strong $\gamma'$ stabilizer and that it is possible to replace Ta in Ni-base superalloys with Nb.
The substitution of $\text{W}$ for $\text{Ta}$ caused a small decrease in the percentage of $\gamma'$ and the $\gamma'$ solvus, evidently because $\text{W}$ does not partition strongly to the $\gamma'$ phase. The decrease in $\gamma'$ volume fraction from 51 to 45 vol% can be seen in the scanning electron micrograph in Fig. 8. The substitution of $\text{Ni}$ for $\text{Ta}$ also caused large decreases in yield strength, ultimate tensile strength, and creep life, as indicated in Fig. 9. Substitution of $\text{W}$ for $\text{Ta}$ caused slight reductions in tensile properties but actually improved the creep life compared to the standard 3 wt% $\text{Ta}$ alloy. These higher strength alloys had lower tensile ductilities, but the lowest ductility of 20 percent elongation appears to be adequate. The strengthening effect of $\text{Ta}$ and $\text{W}$ appears to be at least partially caused by the increase in the amount of $\gamma'$ precipitate, which results from the high $\text{Ta}$ and $\text{W}$ levels. It is apparent that high refractory $\gamma'$ tail levels are essential for high temperature strength of superalloy single crystals. However, further work is necessary to determine the relative effectiveness of the different elemental additions.

The role of $\text{Ta}$ in other alloys is also being studied. In $\text{Inconel 718}$, substitution of $\text{Ta}$ at the standard 4.3 wt% level actually increased creep life (ref. 32). However, extensive testing is necessary to clarify these results. Other studies are under way by Heckel et al. (ref. 33) on the role of $\text{Ta}$ in the mechanical properties of $\text{FeCrMn}$-C and $\text{FeCrMnSiC}$. They are examining the influence of $\text{Ta}$ on equiaxed polycrystal, directionally solidified polycrystal, and single crystal versions of the alloy. Because $\text{Ta}$ is known to be a strong carbide former, different carbide levels will also be investigated in the single crystal alloys. Since this investigation was started only recently, much of the work remains to be reported. However, preliminary results have shown that $\text{Ta}$'s impact on carbide and $\gamma'$ lattice parameters and on the $\gamma'$-$\gamma'$ lattice mismatch. $\text{Ta}$ additions also appear to be beneficial for reducing the reaction zone between the substrate alloy and its protective coating, as illustrated in Fig. 10.

Finally, the influence of $\text{Nb}$ on the superalloy $\text{Inconel 718}$ is also being examined. This study by Ziegler and Wallace (ref. 34) is also in its early stages and few results are presently available. The basic outline of the study is to investigate whether various combinations of the nonstrategic refractory metals $\text{W}$, $\text{Mo}$, and $\text{V}$ could be substituted for all or part of the $\text{Nb}$ in this alloy. Initial mechanical property results indicate that reductions in $\text{Nb}$ content may not be feasible unless sacrifices in strength are tolerable.

**ALTERNATIVE MATERIALS IDENTIFICATION** - A second major thrust of the COSAM Program is research on alternative materials such as intermetallic compounds and advanced Fe-base alloys. Research is under way on $\text{Fe}$ aluminides and Ni/Aluminides as potential structural materials of the future. Although the risk is high because of the lack of near-room-temperature ductility in these materials, their high melting points offer a high payoff. Efforts are focused on understanding the high temperature deformation mechanisms of the binary aluminides; alloying to improve high temperature creep properties; and improving low temperature ductility via processing to achieve grain refinement.

Results of grain size effects on creep of $\text{FeAl}$ by Whittenberger (ref. 35) are shown in Fig. 11 and on low temperature ductility of $\text{NiAl}$ by Schulson (ref. 36) in Fig. 12. The ordered $\text{FeAl}$ intermetallic exhibited the unusual behavior of improved creep resistance with decreasing grain size at temperatures up to 0.75 $\text{Tm}$ grain refinement through thermomechanical processing was shown to lower the ductile-brittle transition temperature of $\text{NiAl}$ (fig. 12).

Research on $\text{Fe}$-base alloys includes SiC fiber strengthening of a nonstrategic-metal-content matrix (ref. 37) and alloy development in the $\text{Fe-Cr-Mn-C}$ system (ref. 38). In regard to the latter, results by Lemkey suggest that the relative effectiveness of the different elements is necessary to clarify these results. Other studies are under way by Heckel et al. (ref. 33) on the role of $\text{Ta}$ in the mechanical properties of $\text{FeCrMn}$-C. They are examining the influence of $\text{Ta}$ on equiaxed polycrystal, directionally solidified polycrystal, and single crystal versions of the alloy. Because $\text{Ta}$ is known to be a strong carbide former, different carbide levels will also be investigated in the single crystal alloys. Since this investigation was started only recently, much of the work remains to be reported. However, preliminary results have shown that $\text{Ta}$'s impact on carbide and $\gamma'$ lattice parameters and on the $\gamma'$-$\gamma'$ lattice mismatch. $\text{Ta}$ additions also appear to be beneficial for reducing the reaction zone between the substrate alloy and its protective coating, as illustrated in Fig. 10.

Finally, the influence of $\text{Nb}$ on the superalloy $\text{Inconel 718}$ is also being examined. This study by Ziegler and Wallace (ref. 34) is also in its early stages and few results are presently available. The basic outline of the study is to investigate whether various combinations of the nonstrategic refractory metals $\text{W}$, $\text{Mo}$, and $\text{V}$ could be substituted for all or part of the $\text{Nb}$ in this alloy. Initial mechanical property results indicate that reductions in $\text{Nb}$ content may not be feasible unless sacrifices in strength are tolerable.

**Research on $\text{Fe}$-base alloys includes SiC fiber strengthening of a nonstrategic-metal-content matrix (ref. 37) and alloy development in the $\text{Fe-Cr-Mn-C}$ system (ref. 38). In regard to the latter, results by Lemkey suggest that the relative effectiveness of the different elements is necessary to clarify these results. Other studies are under way by Heckel et al. (ref. 33) on the role of $\text{Ta}$ in the mechanical properties of $\text{FeCrMn}$-C. They are examining the influence of $\text{Ta}$ on equiaxed polycrystal, directionally solidified polycrystal, and single crystal versions of the alloy. Because $\text{Ta}$ is known to be a strong carbide former, different carbide levels will also be investigated in the single crystal alloys. Since this investigation was started only recently, much of the work remains to be reported. However, preliminary results have shown that $\text{Ta}$'s impact on carbide and $\gamma'$ lattice parameters and on the $\gamma'$-$\gamma'$ lattice mismatch. $\text{Ta}$ additions also appear to be beneficial for reducing the reaction zone between the substrate alloy and its protective coating, as illustrated in Fig. 10.

Finally, the influence of $\text{Nb}$ on the superalloy $\text{Inconel 718}$ is also being examined. This study by Ziegler and Wallace (ref. 34) is also in its early stages and few results are presently available. The basic outline of the study is to investigate whether various combinations of the nonstrategic refractory metals $\text{W}$, $\text{Mo}$, and $\text{V}$ could be substituted for all or part of the $\text{Nb}$ in this alloy. Initial mechanical property results indicate that reductions in $\text{Nb}$ content may not be feasible unless sacrifices in strength are tolerable.

**ALTERNATIVE MATERIALS IDENTIFICATION** - A second major thrust of the COSAM Program is research on alternative materials such as intermetallic compounds and advanced Fe-base alloys. Research is under way on $\text{Fe}$ aluminides and Ni/Aluminides as potential structural materials of the future. Although the risk is high because of the lack of near-room-temperature ductility in these materials, their high melting points offer a high payoff. Efforts are focused on understanding the high temperature deformation mechanisms of the binary aluminides; alloying to improve high temperature creep properties; and improving low temperature ductility via processing to achieve grain refinement.

Results of grain size effects on creep of $\text{FeAl}$ by Whittenberger (ref. 35) are shown in Fig. 11 and on low temperature ductility of $\text{NiAl}$ by Schulson (ref. 36) in Fig. 12. The ordered $\text{FeAl}$ intermetallic exhibited the unusual behavior of improved creep resistance with decreasing grain size at temperatures up to 0.75 $\text{Tm}$ grain refinement through thermomechanical processing was shown to lower the ductile-brittle transition temperature of $\text{NiAl}$ (fig. 12).

Research on $\text{Fe}$-base alloys includes SiC fiber strengthening of a nonstrategic-metal-content matrix (ref. 37) and alloy development in the $\text{Fe-Cr-Mn-C}$ system (ref. 38). In regard to the latter, results by Lemkey suggest that the relative effectiveness of the different elements is necessary to clarify these results. Other studies are under way by Heckel et al. (ref. 33) on the role of $\text{Ta}$ in the mechanical properties of $\text{FeCrMn}$-C. They are examining the influence of $\text{Ta}$ on equiaxed polycrystal, directionally solidified polycrystal, and single crystal versions of the alloy. Because $\text{Ta}$ is known to be a strong carbide former, different carbide levels will also be investigated in the single crystal alloys. Since this investigation was started only recently, much of the work remains to be reported. However, preliminary results have shown that $\text{Ta}$'s impact on carbide and $\gamma'$ lattice parameters and on the $\gamma'$-$\gamma'$ lattice mismatch. $\text{Ta}$ additions also appear to be beneficial for reducing the reaction zone between the substrate alloy and its protective coating, as illustrated in Fig. 10.

Finally, the influence of $\text{Nb}$ on the superalloy $\text{Inconel 718}$ is also being examined. This study by Ziegler and Wallace (ref. 34) is also in its early stages and few results are presently available. The basic outline of the study is to investigate whether various combinations of the nonstrategic refractory metals $\text{W}$, $\text{Mo}$, and $\text{V}$ could be substituted for all or part of the $\text{Nb}$ in this alloy. Initial mechanical property results indicate that reductions in $\text{Nb}$ content may not be feasible unless sacrifices in strength are tolerable.

**ALTERNATIVE MATERIALS IDENTIFICATION** - A second major thrust of the COSAM Program is research on alternative materials such as intermetallic compounds and advanced Fe-base alloys. Research is under way on $\text{Fe}$ aluminides and Ni/Aluminides as potential structural materials of the future. Although the risk is high because of the lack of near-room-temperature ductility...
CONCLUDING REMARKS

We have presented in this paper the U.S. import position with regard to several critical and strategic aerospace materials. It was further shown through tracing the history of the use of refractory metals and their role in Ni-base superalloys that they play a key role in the high temperature strength and environmental resistance of Ni-base superalloys. The COSAM Program is so constituted that its primary purpose is to understand the roles of critical and strategic elements in superalloys through basic research efforts within NASA Lewis Research Center, universities, and industry. By gaining this understanding and identifying alternative materials or utilizing advanced processing concepts, technology will be available to circumvent possible future shortages of materials or price escalations that may occur. This "on the shelf" technology may further help reduce the normal 6 to 9 years required to introduce a new metal into gas turbine engines (refs. 42 and 43). The refractory metals Cr, Ta, and Nb are currently a part of the COSAM Program emphasis primarily because of the near 100 percent import reliance of the United States on these metals and the key roles they play in the aerospace industry. We believe that their use will continue at their current levels of concentration in superalloys as long as the foreign sources for each of them remains stable. However, if a critical and strategic material supply crisis does occur in these three refractory metals, the COSAM Program will provide technological alternatives.

REFERENCES


Stephens, Dreshfield, Nathal
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alloy</th>
<th>Nominal refractory metal content, wt%</th>
<th>Year*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cr</td>
<td>Mo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nimonic 80A</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waspaloy</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nimonic 100</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M-252</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inconel 713C</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inconel 718</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRW-NASA VIA</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>René 150</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P&amp;W 454</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Approximate year of availability.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Maximum solubility</th>
<th>Temperature at maximum solubility, °C</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>43 at.% 39.6 wt%</td>
<td>1200</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nb</td>
<td>14 at.% 20.5 wt%</td>
<td>1270</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ta</td>
<td>15.4 at.% 35.9 wt%</td>
<td>1360</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cr</td>
<td>50 at.% 47 wt%</td>
<td>1345</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mo</td>
<td>27 at.% 37.5 wt%</td>
<td>1315</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W</td>
<td>17.5 at.% 40 wt%</td>
<td>1500</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Re</td>
<td>29.8 at.% 55 wt%</td>
<td>1600</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table III. - Average Gamma Prime Partitioning Ratios for the Refractory Metals Plus Aluminum and Titanium

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Partitioning ratio*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>&lt; 0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nb</td>
<td>&lt; 0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ta</td>
<td>&lt; 0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cr</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mo</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al</td>
<td>0.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ti</td>
<td>0.10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Weight fraction in γ'/ weight fraction in γ.
Figure 1. - Dependence of gas turbine engines on strategic materials.

CHROMIUM, 675 kg  
COBALT, 400 kg  
NIOBium, 65 kg  
TANTALUM, 2 kg

Figure 2. - F100 engine strategic material input requirements.
Figure 3 - Strategic material prices are volatile and unpredictable.

Figure 4 - Refractory metals used in nickel-base superalloys.
Figure 5. - Increased use of refractory metals in nickel-base superalloys.
Figure 6. - Progress in turbine blade materials.

Figure 7. - U.S. import dependence of the refractory metals (ref. 1).
Figure 8. - Microstructure of superalloy single crystals with (a) 3 w/o Ta and (b) 0 w/o Ta. (ref. 30).
Figure 9. - Effects of substituting Ni and W for Ta in MAR-M247 single crystals tested at 1000°C. (Ref. 30.)
Ni-13w/o Al 14w/o Cr (0.13w/o Zr) | Mar M 247

(a) Typical microstructure, 1150°C - 200 hr.

(b) Effect of Ta on the depth of reaction zone. (ref 33).

Figure 10: Influence of Ta levels in MARM 247 on the application of a protective coating.
Figure 11. - Flow stress-strain rate behavior for several Fe-40Al materials at 925°C.

Figure 12. - Tensile elongation of binary NiAl deformed at various temperatures and strain rates.
Figure 13. Stress-rupture strength of experimental iron-base alloy NASAUT 4G-AI compared to commercial iron- and cobalt-base alloys.

Figure 14. Dual-alloy joining technology for turbine disks.
Figure 15. Effect of tin content on rupture life of Inconel 718.