Development of Thin Film Ceramic Thermocouples for High Temperature Environments

John D. Wrbanek, Gustave C. Fralick, and Serene C. Farmer
Glenn Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio

Ali Sayir
Case Western Reserve University, Cleveland, Ohio

Charles A. Blaha and José M. Gonzalez
Akima Corporation, Fairview Park, Ohio

August 2004
Since its founding, NASA has been dedicated to the advancement of aeronautics and space science. The NASA Scientific and Technical Information (STI) Program Office plays a key part in helping NASA maintain this important role.

The NASA STI Program Office is operated by Langley Research Center, the Lead Center for NASA's scientific and technical information. The NASA STI Program Office provides access to the NASA STI Database, the largest collection of aeronautical and space science STI in the world. The Program Office is also NASA's institutional mechanism for disseminating the results of its research and development activities. These results are published by NASA in the NASA STI Report Series, which includes the following report types:

- TECHNICAL PUBLICATION. Reports of completed research or a major significant phase of research that present the results of NASA programs and include extensive data or theoretical analysis. Includes compilations of significant scientific and technical data and information deemed to be of continuing reference value. NASA's counterpart of peer-reviewed formal professional papers but has less stringent limitations on manuscript length and extent of graphic presentations.

- TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM. Scientific and technical findings that are preliminary or of specialized interest, e.g., quick release reports, working papers, and bibliographies that contain minimal annotation. Does not contain extensive analysis.

- CONTRACTOR REPORT. Scientific and technical findings by NASA-sponsored contractors and grantees.

- CONFERENCE PUBLICATION. Collected papers from scientific and technical conferences, symposia, seminars, or other meetings sponsored or cosponsored by NASA.

- SPECIAL PUBLICATION. Scientific, technical, or historical information from NASA programs, projects, and missions, often concerned with subjects having substantial public interest.

- TECHNICAL TRANSLATION. English-language translations of foreign scientific and technical material pertinent to NASA's mission.

Specialized services that complement the STI Program Office’s diverse offerings include creating custom thesauri, building customized databases, organizing and publishing research results . . . even providing videos.

For more information about the NASA STI Program Office, see the following:

- Access the NASA STI Program Home Page at http://www.sti.nasa.gov
- E-mail your question via the Internet to help@sti.nasa.gov
- Fax your question to the NASA Access Help Desk at 301–621–0134
- Telephone the NASA Access Help Desk at 301–621–0390
- Write to:
  NASA Access Help Desk
  NASA Center for AeroSpace Information
  7121 Standard Drive
  Hanover, MD 21076
Development of Thin Film Ceramic Thermocouples for High Temperature Environments

John D. Wrbanek, Gustave C. Fralick, and Serene C. Farmer
Glenn Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio

Ali Sayir
Case Western Reserve University, Cleveland, Ohio

Charles A. Blaha and José M. Gonzalez
Akima Corporation, Fairview Park, Ohio

Prepared for the
40th Joint Propulsion Conference and Exhibit
cosponsored by the AIAA, ASME, SAE, and ASEE
Fort Lauderdale, Florida, July 11–14, 2004

National Aeronautics and Space Administration
Glenn Research Center

August 2004
Acknowledgments

This work was sponsored at the NASA Glenn Research Center by the Propulsion Research and Technology Project of the Next Generation Launch Technology Program and the Air Force Office of Scientific Research provided funding through grant F49620–01–1–0500 to develop multifunctional structural ceramics.

This report is a formal draft or working paper, intended to solicit comments and ideas from a technical peer group.

This report contains preliminary findings, subject to revision as analysis proceeds.

Available from

NASA Center for Aerospace Information
7121 Standard Drive
Hanover, MD 21076

National Technical Information Service
5285 Port Royal Road
Springfield, VA 22100

Available electronically at http://gltrs.grc.nasa.gov
Development of Thin Film Ceramic Thermocouples for High Temperature Environments

John D. Wrbanek, Gustave C. Fralick, and Serene C. Farmer
National Aeronautics and Space Administration
Glenn Research Center
Cleveland, Ohio 44135

Ali Sayir
Case Western Reserve University
Cleveland, Ohio 44106

Charles A. Blaha and José M. Gonzalez
Akima Corporation
Fairview Park, Ohio 44126

The maximum use temperature of noble metal thin film thermocouples of 1100 °C (2000 °F) may not be adequate for use on components in the increasingly harsh conditions of advanced aircraft and next generation launch technology. Ceramic-based thermocouples are known for their high stability and robustness at temperatures exceeding 1500 °C, but are typically found in the form of rods or probes. NASA Glenn Research Center is investigating the feasibility of ceramics as thin film thermocouples for extremely high temperature applications to take advantage of the stability and robustness of ceramics and the non-intrusiveness of thin films. This paper will discuss the current state of development in this effort.

I. Introduction

To create the capabilities for long duration, more distant human and robotic missions for the Vision for Space Exploration, instrumentation and material technologies are being developed by NASA in its mission to enable safer, lighter, quieter, and more fuel efficient vehicles for aeronautics and space transportation. The Sensors and Electronics Technology Branch of NASA Glenn Research Center has an effort to develop thin film sensors for surface measurement in propulsion system research. The sensors include those for strain, temperature, heat flux and surface flow.

The use of thin film sensors has several advantages over wire or foil sensors. Thin film sensors do not require special machining of the components on which they are mounted, and, with thicknesses less than 10 µm, they are considerably thinner than wire or foils. Thin film sensors are thus much less disturbing to the operating environment, and have a minimal impact on the physical characteristics of the supporting components.

Four areas in the state-of-the-art thin film sensor technology are targeted for improvement as part of NASA’s instrumentation research:

• Further development of electronics packaging and component testing of specialized sensors;
• Further development of fabrication techniques on curves and complex surfaces;
• Improved leadwire and film durability;
• Address needs for higher temperature applications exceeding 1000°C.

The Ceramics Branch at Glenn Research Center has an ongoing research effort to develop structural and functional ceramic technology for aero and space propulsion needs in conjunction with the Air Force Office of Scientific Research. The application of ceramics as thin film thermocouples can have the potential to meet the demands of advanced aerospace environments, as well as to the establishment of fundamental space operations capability.
The maximum temperature of noble metal thin film thermocouples of 1100 °C (2000 °F) may not be adequate for the increasingly harsh conditions of advanced aircraft and next generation launch technology. Ceramic-based thermocouples are known for their high stability and robustness at high temperatures, but are typically found in the form of rods or probes. This investigation studies the feasibility of ceramics as thin film thermocouples for extremely high temperature applications thus taking advantage of both the stability and robustness of ceramics and the non-intrusiveness of thin films.

II. Ceramic TFTC Elements

The need to consider ceramic sensing elements is brought about by the temperature limits of metal thin film sensors in propulsion system applications. Longer-term stability of thin film sensors made of noble metals has been demonstrated at 1100 °C for 25 hrs. Our previous experience indicates that noble metal thin films may be able to withstand 1500 °C for less than a minute in oxidizing environments. The capability for thin film sensors to operate in 1500 °C environments for 25 hours or more is considered critical for ceramic turbine engine development. For future space transportation vehicles, temperatures of propulsion system components of at least 1650 °C to 3000 °C are expected.

Ceramic materials can survive extreme temperatures. The borides, carbides, nitrides, and silicides of metals show high heat-resisting properties as well as metal-like electrical properties that make them attractive for use as sensing elements at high temperatures. An overview of these ceramics as thermocouples indicates that the silicides and carbides have the largest thermoelectric power. Silicides have the added benefits of forming a passivating oxide coating in air, and carbides are able to be used in extremely high temperatures in inert and reducing environments. The ability of a particular ceramic to survive in harsh environments will influence its usefulness as a sensor. Tables 1 and 2 outline some bulk properties of silicide and carbide thermocouple elements.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Carbide</th>
<th>Melting Point (°C)</th>
<th>Oxidation Temperature (°C)</th>
<th>Bulk Thermoelectric Power at 20 °C (µV/°C)</th>
<th>CTE (10⁻⁶ °C⁻¹)</th>
<th>Absorption Cross Section for Thermal Neutrons (barns/molecule)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WC</td>
<td>2720</td>
<td>800</td>
<td>–23</td>
<td>3.84</td>
<td>18.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VC</td>
<td>2810</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>–3.7</td>
<td>7.20</td>
<td>5.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TiC</td>
<td>3147</td>
<td>1200</td>
<td>–11.2</td>
<td>7.74</td>
<td>6.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZrC</td>
<td>3530</td>
<td>1200</td>
<td>–11.3</td>
<td>6.73</td>
<td>0.709</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TaC</td>
<td>3880</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>–5</td>
<td>8.30</td>
<td>20.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HfC</td>
<td>3890</td>
<td>1200</td>
<td>–11.8</td>
<td>5.60</td>
<td>104.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The three carbides with the highest melting points in table 1 are HfC, TaC, and ZrC, and ZrC has the added benefit of high radiation resistance. Previous investigations at Virginia Tech tested TaC films to 800 °C in vacuum and found them to have decreasing thermoelectric power with temperature. They also found good electrical and thermal stability when subjected to several thermal cycles.
From table 2, three silicides stand out. CrSi₂ has the highest thermoelectric power and good radiation resistance; TaSi₂ has the highest melting point; and MoSi₂ has the best oxidation and radiation resistance. An investigation at NIST demonstrated MoSi₂ and TiSi₂ as feasible thermocouple elements with protective overcoats to high temperatures in air. However, TaSi₂ and WSi₂ with protective overcoats and uncoated ReSi₂ failed before they reached 1000 °C due to oxidation effects.\(^{11}\)

### III. CrSi₂/TaC Sample Fabrication

In this investigation we report on the study to assess the higher temperature capability of TaC and CrSi₂ as thin film thermocouples in air. This decision was based on the high temperature potential of these systems in reducing environments where noble metal films are reactive.

The film depositions were conducted in the Class 1000 Microsystems Fabrication Cleanroom facility at Glenn Research Center using plasma sputtering PVD. The sputtered films are shown in figure 1. The deposition parameters are given in table 3. The thermocouple test sample was fabricated on a 127 mm × 38 mm × 1 mm alumina substrate, as shown in figure 2. Alumina substrates provide readily available test beds that remain intact for the severe heating required of these films, up to 1700 °C if necessary. After surfactant cleaning, the test shims were rinsed in acetone and methanol. The platinum was deposited first, followed by the platinum-rhodium alloy, the silicide, and ending with the carbide film. Platinum pads were added to connect leadwires to the sample.

![Figure 1.—The CrSi₂/TaC thermocouple test sample before the application of platinum connection pads.](image)

### Table 2.—Bulk Properties of High Temperature Silicide Thermocouple Elements.\(^{10}\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Silicide</th>
<th>Melting Point (°C)</th>
<th>Oxidation Temperature (°C)</th>
<th>Bulk Thermoelectric Power at 20°C (µV/°C)</th>
<th>CTE (10⁻⁶°C⁻¹)</th>
<th>Absorption Cross Section for Thermal Neutrons (barns/molecule)(^{8})</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TiSi₂</td>
<td>1510</td>
<td>1200</td>
<td>+9.4</td>
<td>12.42</td>
<td>6.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CrSi₂</td>
<td>1770</td>
<td>1371</td>
<td>+360</td>
<td>12.81</td>
<td>3.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ReSi₂</td>
<td>1980</td>
<td>1800</td>
<td>+313</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>145.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoSi₂</td>
<td>2049</td>
<td>1650+</td>
<td>−5.4</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>2.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WSi₂</td>
<td>2116</td>
<td>1650</td>
<td>−0.4</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>18.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TaSi₂</td>
<td>2371</td>
<td>1650</td>
<td>+25</td>
<td>8.82</td>
<td>20.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From table 2, three silicides stand out. CrSi₂ has the highest thermoelectric power and good radiation resistance; TaSi₂ has the highest melting point; and MoSi₂ has the best oxidation and radiation resistance. An investigation at NIST demonstrated MoSi₂ and TiSi₂ as feasible thermocouple elements with protective overcoats to high temperatures in air. However, TaSi₂ and WSi₂ with protective overcoats and uncoated ReSi₂ failed before they reached 1000 °C due to oxidation effects.\(^{11}\)
Table 3.—Deposition Parameters of Films for the CrSi$_2$/TaC sample.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Film Deposited</th>
<th>Pressure &amp; Gas</th>
<th>Power Density/Time</th>
<th>Film Thickness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pt</td>
<td>8 mTorr Argon 250 Watts RF /182cm$^2$ 110 min.</td>
<td>3.4 µm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pt-13%Rh</td>
<td>8 mTorr Argon 250 Watts RF /182cm$^2$ 120 min.</td>
<td>3.0 µm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CrSi$_2$</td>
<td>8 mTorr Argon 250 Watts DC /46cm$^2$ 462 min.</td>
<td>3.0 µm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TaC</td>
<td>8 mTorr Argon 250 Watts DC /46cm$^2$ 347 min.</td>
<td>3.0 µm</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2.—Diagram of TFTC test sample.

Figure 3.—SEM images of the as-deposited TaC film under (a) 2000× power, and (b) 15,000× power.
The deposited carbide and silicide films were extremely smooth, as shown by the SEM images of figures 3 and 4. Under XRD analysis, test films of TaC target material deposited on glass slides revealed that the deposited film was TaC, as shown in figure 5. No additional phases were observed. The deposited silicide film appeared to be amorphous. Different regions of the CrSi$_2$ target were analyzed by XRD to give insight of the deposited film phase and composition, as shown in figure 6. The main peak of CrSi$_2$ at $2\theta = 43^\circ$ is observable in the target spectrum, as well as a slight secondary “bump” observed in the deposited film spectrum. These microstructure characteristics suggest that the deposited film was amorphous CrSi$_2$. 

Figure 4.—SEM images of the as-deposited CrSi$_x$ film under (a) 2000× power, and (b) 15,000× power.

Figure 5.—X-Ray characterization of TaC as-deposited film.

Figure 6.—X-Ray characterization of CrSi$_x$ target and as-deposited film.
IV. CrSi\textsubscript{2}/TaC Sample Test

The sample was loaded into a clam-shell air furnace as shown in figure 7. The spatial heat distribution of the hot zone of the furnace formed a thermal gradient across the sample. A Type R thermocouple at the platinum common pad provided a signal to define the cold junction reference temperature. The signals were amplified and read on a computer acquisition system, which recorded the signal voltage in time. The furnace setting was set at 56 °C intervals starting with 93 °C. The resulting signals are shown in figure 8. This was done twice to determine repeatability.

The cold junction reference thermocouple signal and the thin film platinum-13% rhodium vs. platinum (Pt13Rh/Pt) thermocouple signals were converted to temperature using the ITS–90 inverse polynomials for Type R thermocouples after data acquisition was complete. Past studies of thin film Pt13Rh/Pt thermocouples fabricated at Glenn Research Center have shown them to be accurate to 3% of the temperature gradient for temperatures under 1200 °C.\textsuperscript{12} The room temperature was measured to be consistently 26 °C, and was included in those calculations.

The TaC film failed during the first ramp. The thin film Pt13Rh/Pt thermocouple on the sample indicated a sample temperature of 455 °C. This is shown on figure 8. With only the CrSi\textsubscript{2} element still active, the sample was also tested over a period of 180 hours at the 815 °C setting, the upper limit of the furnace, giving a temperature of 670 °C on the sample. The output is shown in figure 9. The sample did not return to a zero-millivolt output after the end of the run, and held a charge for several days before being discharged. The attempt to gain a higher temperature reading destroyed the sample substrate due to thermal shock (see fig. 10).

Figure 7.—Thermocouple sample in clamshell oven.

Figure 8.—CrSi\textsubscript{2}/TaC thermocouple test sample output over time.
V. CrSi₂ and TaC Thermoelectric Power

The signal output from a thermocouple is related to the Seebeck coefficient as:

\[ \varepsilon = \int_{T_1}^{T_2} S(T) \cdot dT \]

where \( \varepsilon \) is the thermoelectric voltage generated by the thermocouple, \( S(T) \) is the Seebeck coefficient, \( T_1 \) the low temperature of the gradient, \( T_2 \) the high temperature. Typically, the charts for the thermoelectric voltage are given with reference to a temperature of 0 °C or 20 °C so that as the Seebeck coefficient changes with temperature, the correct temperature can be calculated from knowing the actual \( T_1 \) of the gradient. In our case, \( T_1 \) is floating, not tied to a reference. The linearity of the Seebeck coefficient at lower temperatures is used to determine the thermoelectric voltage relative to a fixed reference temperature.

The resulting plot for CrSi₂ vs. Pt thermoelectric voltage vs. temperature referenced to 0 °C is shown in figure 11. The curve follows the cubic relation \( \varepsilon(T)_{T_1=0} = -6.494 \times 10^{-8} T^3 + 3.4205 \times 10^{-5} T^2 + 9.831 \times 10^{-2} T \) to within 1.4%, which is also shown in figure 11. For TaC vs. Pt, the thermoelectric voltage vs. temperature referenced to 0 °C is shown in figure 12. The resulting curve follows the cubic relation \( \varepsilon(T)_{T_1=0} = 3.3558 \times \)

Figure 9.—Long-term test of CrSi₂ thermocouple.

Figure 10.—Post-testing condition of CrSi₂/TaC thermocouple test sample.

V. CrSi₂ and TaC Thermoelectric Power

The signal output from a thermocouple is related to the Seebeck coefficient as:

\[ \varepsilon = \int_{T_1}^{T_2} S(T) \cdot dT \]

where \( \varepsilon \) is the thermoelectric voltage generated by the thermocouple, \( S(T) \) is the Seebeck coefficient, \( T_1 \) the low temperature of the gradient, \( T_2 \) the high temperature. Typically, the charts for the thermoelectric voltage are given with reference to a temperature of 0 °C or 20 °C so that as the Seebeck coefficient changes with temperature, the correct temperature can be calculated from knowing the actual \( T_1 \) of the gradient. In our case, \( T_1 \) is floating, not tied to a reference. The linearity of the Seebeck coefficient at lower temperatures is used to determine the thermoelectric voltage relative to a fixed reference temperature.

The resulting plot for CrSi₂ vs. Pt thermoelectric voltage vs. temperature referenced to 0 °C is shown in figure 11. The curve follows the cubic relation \( \varepsilon(T)_{T_1=0} = -6.494 \times 10^{-8} T^3 + 3.4205 \times 10^{-5} T^2 + 9.831 \times 10^{-2} T \) to within 1.4%, which is also shown in figure 11. For TaC vs. Pt, the thermoelectric voltage vs. temperature referenced to 0 °C is shown in figure 12. The resulting curve follows the cubic relation \( \varepsilon(T)_{T_1=0} = 3.3558 \times \)
$10^{-9}T^3 - 6.2915 \times 10^{-7}T^2 - 4.2835 \times 10^{-3}T$ to within 1%, which is also shown in figure 12. It should be noted that the deviation from linearity is seen to be 10% immediately before failure of the films. Based on the trends shown in figures 11 and 12, these thermocouple elements may be linear to at least 900 °C for CrSi$_2$ and 600 °C for TaC in non-oxidizing environments. The constant Seebeck coefficients relative to platinum are $+102 \, \mu V/°C$ for CrSi$_2$ and $-4.3 \, \mu V/°C$ for TaC, accurate to ±3% from the uncertainty of our temperature measurement.

![CrSi$_2$ vs. Pt Thin Film Thermocouple Voltage vs. Temperature (0°C Reference)](image1)

Figure 11.—Thermoelectric voltage output determined for CrSi$_2$ vs. Pt referenced to 0 °C.

![TaC vs. Pt Thin Film Thermocouple Voltage vs. Temperature (0°C Reference)](image2)

Figure 12.—Thermoelectric voltage output determined for TaC vs. Pt referenced to 0 °C.
VI. Conclusions and Future Work

Thermoelectric data on CrSi$_2$ and TaC was gathered for temperatures up to 650 °C for CrSi$_2$ and 450 °C for TaC. Extrapolating the data for environments where oxidation is not an issue, CrSi$_2$ vs. Pt appears to be linear to 900 °C and TaC vs. Pt linear to at least 600 °C. It is suspected that the oxidation contributed to the deviation from linearity for both cases. The quantitative amount of this contribution and therefore the upper use temperature for both of these systems under repeated use conditions could not be estimated from our study and requires further work. On the other hand, the present investigation showed significant promise of this class of materials as a ultra-high temperature thermocouple pairs provided that the oxidation challenge is addressed. The possibility exists to utilize these classes of materials at very high temperatures in reducing environments for next generation launch vehicles. The paradigm for the use temperature, time and the environmental conditions of application requires further study.

Based on the low oxidation temperatures of these thin film thermocouple elements, additional research needs to be conducted into protective overcoats for the films if they are to be practical in oxidizing environments. Also, testing of the thin film ceramic thermocouples in an inert atmosphere or vacuum will be necessary to gain an understanding of their performance and applicability in space relevant environments.

The merging of the high temperature capabilities of ceramics with the non-intrusiveness of thin films is ongoing. It appears that a new class of ceramic thin films can be used as high temperature thermocouples, and we intend to apply this technology to strain gauges as well. This research advances the effort to develop a complete sensor package to enable the use of ceramics as thin film sensors in environments where standard metal sensors would not survive.

References

Development of Thin Film Ceramic Thermocouples for High Temperature Environments

John D. Wrbanek, Gustave C. Fralick, Serene C. Farmer, Ali Sayir, Charles A. Blaha, and José M. Gonzalez

Ceramic-based thermocouples are known for their high stability and robustness at temperatures exceeding 1500 °C, but are typically found in the form of rods or probes. NASA Glenn Research Center is investigating the feasibility of ceramics as thin film thermocouples for extremely high temperature applications to take advantage of the stability and robustness of ceramics and the non-intrusiveness of thin films. This paper will discuss the current state of development in this effort.

The maximum use temperature of noble metal thin film thermocouples of 1100 °C (2000 °F) may not be adequate for use on components in the increasingly harsh conditions of advanced aircraft and next generation launch technology. Ceramic-based thermocouples are known for their high stability and robustness at temperatures exceeding 1500 °C, but are typically found in the form of rods or probes. NASA Glenn Research Center is investigating the feasibility of ceramics as thin film thermocouples for extremely high temperature applications to take advantage of the stability and robustness of ceramics and the non-intrusiveness of thin films. This paper will discuss the current state of development in this effort.