Hybrid Gear Preliminary Results—Application of Composites to Dynamic Mechanical Components

Robert F. Handschuh, Gary D. Roberts, and Ryan R. Sinnamon
Glenn Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio

David B. Stringer
U.S. Army Research Laboratory, Glenn Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio

Brian D. Dykas
U.S. Army Research Laboratory, Aberdeen Proving Grounds, Maryland

Lee W. Kohlman
Glenn Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio

July 2012
Since its founding, NASA has been dedicated to the advancement of aeronautics and space science. The NASA Scientific and Technical Information (STI) program plays a key part in helping NASA maintain this important role.

The NASA STI Program operates under the auspices of the Agency Chief Information Officer. It collects, organizes, provides for archiving, and disseminates NASA's STI. The NASA STI program provides access to the NASA Aeronautics and Space Database and its public interface, the NASA Technical Reports Server, thus providing one of the largest collections of aeronautical and space science STI in the world. Results are published in both non-NASA channels and by NASA in the NASA STI Report Series, which includes the following report types:

- **TECHNICAL PUBLICATION.** Reports of completed research or a major significant phase of research that present the results of NASA programs and include extensive data or theoretical analysis. Includes compilations of significant scientific and technical data and information deemed to be of continuing reference value. NASA counterpart of peer-reviewed formal professional papers but has less stringent limitations on manuscript length and extent of graphic presentations.

- **TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM.** Scientific and technical findings that are preliminary or of specialized interest, e.g., quick release reports, working papers, and bibliographies that contain minimal annotation. Does not contain extensive analysis.

- **CONTRACTOR REPORT.** Scientific and technical findings by NASA-sponsored contractors and grantees.

- **CONFERENCE PUBLICATION.** Collected papers from scientific and technical conferences, symposia, seminars, or other meetings sponsored or cosponsored by NASA.

- **SPECIAL PUBLICATION.** Scientific, technical, or historical information from NASA programs, projects, and missions, often concerned with subjects having substantial public interest.

- **TECHNICAL TRANSLATION.** English-language translations of foreign scientific and technical material pertinent to NASA's mission.

Specialized services also include creating custom thesauri, building customized databases, organizing and publishing research results.

For more information about the NASA STI program, see the following:

- Access the NASA STI program home page at [http://www.sti.nasa.gov](http://www.sti.nasa.gov)

- E-mail your question to help@sti.nasa.gov

- Fax your question to the NASA STI Information Desk at 443–757–5803

- Phone the NASA STI Information Desk at 443–757–5802

- Write to:
  STI Information Desk
  NASA Center for AeroSpace Information
  7115 Standard Drive
  Hanover, MD 21076–1320
Hybrid Gear Preliminary Results—Application of Composites to Dynamic Mechanical Components

Robert F. Handschuh, Gary D. Roberts, and Ryan R. Sinnamon
Glenn Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio

David B. Stringer
U.S. Army Research Laboratory, Glenn Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio

Brian D. Dykas
U.S. Army Research Laboratory, Aberdeen Proving Grounds, Maryland

Lee W. Kohlman
Glenn Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio

Prepared for the
68th Annual Forum and Technology Display (Forum 67)
sponsored by the American Helicopter Society (AHS)
Fort Worth, Texas, May 1–3, 2012

National Aeronautics and Space Administration
Glenn Research Center
Cleveland, Ohio 44135

July 2012
Level of Review: This material has been technically reviewed by technical management.

Available from
NASA Center for Aerospace Information
7115 Standard Drive
Hanover, MD 21076–1320

Available electronically at http://www.sti.nasa.gov
Abstract

Composite spur gears were fabricated and then tested at NASA Glenn Research Center. The composite material served as the web of the gear between the gear teeth and a metallic hub for mounting to the torque-applying shaft. The composite web was bonded only to the inner and outer hexagonal features that were machined from an initially all-metallic aerospace quality spur gear. The Hybrid Gear was tested against an all-steel gear and against a mating Hybrid Gear. As a result of the composite to metal fabrication process used, the concentricity of the gears were reduce from their initial high-precision value. Regardless of the concentricity error, the hybrid gears operated successfully for over 300 million cycles at 10000 rpm and 553 in.*lb torque. Although the design was not optimized for weight, the composite gears were found to be 20 percent lighter than the all-steel gears. Free vibration modes and vibration/noise tests were also conduct to compare the vibration and damping characteristic of the Hybrid Gear to all-steel gears. The initial results indicate that this type of hybrid design may have a dramatic effect on drive system weight without sacrificing strength.

Introduction

The components used in rotorcraft applications are designed such that the minimum weight is attained without sacrificing reliability or safety. Since the drive system is an appreciable percentage of the overall rotorcraft vehicle weight (~10 percent), many approaches have been applied to improve the power to weight ratio of these components. Past and current government-funded efforts for drive system technology (Refs. 1 and 2) has used power to weight ratio as the most critical performance metric. Through clever design modifications, configuration arrangements, and advanced materials, great progress has been made.

Material properties of composites make them very desirable. Having a very low density and high strength are two important properties that directly impact power to weight ratio. Therefore application of these materials to rotorcraft transmission static and dynamic components can have a drastic effect on overall drive system weight (Refs. 3 and 4).

The use of composites has been mostly limited in drive systems to housings and shafts (Ref. 5). A number of critical issues were identified and addressed in these applications. These issues include metal—composite attachment, corrosion, strength, etc. The objective of this research reported herein is to expand the use of composite materials to gears and to identify critical issues that may result in this application. Several tests were performed on the composite gears to identify the issues that need to be addressed to allow this technology to be suitable for rotorcraft drive systems.

Composite Material—Metallic Gear Hybrid

Components that are lightweight and high-strength are very important for aerospace drive systems. The composite portion of the hybrid gear was fabricated using a triaxial braid prepreg material made with T700SC 12K carbon fiber tows and a 350 °F epoxy matrix material. A 0/±60 braid architecture was
used so that in-plane stiffness properties would be nearly equal in all directions. Representative composite material properties are compared to that of the typical gear material AISI 9310, and are shown in Table 1. Materials with these characteristics have the potential to produce a design with a very high power to weight ratio.

There are other reasons for using a hybrid of composite and metallic elements in a gear. For example, gear meshing vibration and noise should benefit from this configuration by altering the acoustic path between the gear-mesh generating the noise and the housing that re-radiates the vibration and noise.

In theory it may be possible to produce a hybrid gear at reduced cost, as a portion of the machining required to reduce component weight would be eliminated. The manufacture process would have to be altered when making a hybrid gear to attain aerospace precision of the components.

Unfortunately for all the positive implications of using this technology for dynamic drive system components, there are also some negative aspects. Some of these include: (i) attachment to the metallic features to produce a hybrid gear (gear teeth to web, web to shaft, and bearings to shaft), (ii) heat conduction issues—composite material through thickness conductivity, and (iii) operation during extreme thermal events such as loss-of-lubrication. In current drive system component design, the gears and shafts are one-piece and the bearing inner raceway is typically part of the gear-shaft component. Use of a hybrid gear would require attachment in some manner from the composite material web-shaft to the gear teeth.

Hybrid Gear Design and Manufacturing

The basic gear design used for this study is summarized in Table 2. These gears have been used in the past for loss-of-lubrication testing and other experimental work within NASA (Refs. 6 to 8). Gears used were representative of aerospace precision prior to modification to a hybrid configuration.

Turning the gears into a hybrid configuration started with a portion of the web being machined away. The metallic teeth and attachment regions were kept. A hexagonal region was removed. This arrangement was chosen due to the number of teeth (42) on the gear to be modified. By using a six-sided feature, no sharp edge was located near a tooth fillet—root region where the highest bending stress is reached.

Two unique ply stacks were used for this configuration. The first ply stack was larger than the metallic portion that was machined away and had a circular outside geometry. This created an overlap onto the surface of the outer rim. This overlap created a bonding surface that was critical for proper composite to metal adhesion. The second ply stack configuration was cut to match the hexagonal region that was machined away from the metal gear. This tight fit provided a load path from the outer rim to the metallic inner hub.

An epoxy prepreg in conjunction with a quasi-isotropic braided fabric was chosen as the composite material. The fabric provides nearly in-plane isotropic properties that react similarly to that of the metallic features.

Prior to molding, any portion of the metallic features that were to come in contact with the composite were sandblasted and surface primed to promote good adhesion and increase bond-line strength.
A special fixture was then designed and fabricated to locate the gear rim and the gear hub prior to composite material lay-up. The gear teeth outer rim was located using the “measurement over pins” (Ref. 9). The inner metallic hub was located via its inner bore.

The first step in the lay-up process was to place the inner metallic hub by locating it around the feature in the mold center. During the assembly process, the larger ply stack was created by 12 layers of the prepreg. Each layer was rotated 60° in one direction to encourage the best isotropic behavior. With the first ply stack positioned and debulked, a film adhesive was added and the outer metallic ring was placed on top. The second ply stack was created in the void between the two metal features. The same “clocking” procedure was performed on these plies. Another layer of film adhesive was added and the final ply stack was added in the same fashion as the first.

The composite material lay-up process is shown in Figure 1. This figure shows the assembly procedure used prior to curing the finished part.

The gear mold assembly was placed into a press and subjected to a 100 psi load. The press was then heated at a ramp rate of 4 °F per minute to a temperature of 250 °F. A 1-hr dwell was held at 250 °F to allow time for the metal and composite to reach a consistent temperature. The temperature was then increased to 350 °F using the same ramp rate. The temperature was held at 350 °F to fully cure the composite prepreg. After the cure cycle was complete the part was removed from the mold and any excess resin flashing was removed.

The finished hybrid gear is shown in Figure 2 and Figure 3. There was no optimization of the arrangement at this point, but the gear produced was still on the order of 20 percent lighter than the all-metal one.
Free—Free Vibration Modes

A series of experiments using a modal impact hammer was conducted on a standard AISI 9310 steel spur gear and a hybrid spur gear specimen. The objective was to experimentally determine the modal properties of the hybrid spur gear and compare them to those of its conventional steel counterpart. Additionally, a model of the conventional spur gear was generated using finite element software and subsequently compared with experimental data obtained from the test specimen. A further effort is underway to include hybrid material parameters into the model and correlate with modal data acquired from these experiments.

A series of modal experiments was conducted on a baseline steel gear and the hybrid gear to identify natural frequencies and calculate modal damping. An electric impact hammer was used to impact the gears in multiple orientations, with an accelerometer at the tip of hammer providing a trigger for the acquisition of acceleration data from the gear. In all cases, the single accelerometer was placed on the metal hub of the test gear with the accelerometer axis parallel to the rotational axis of the gear. This placement was chosen for convenience because it was accessible on both test specimens. Finite Element Analysis (FEA) demonstrated that most displacement would be in the axial direction for the modes of interest.

Figure 4 shows the experimental configurations in which the impact experiments were performed. The test gear was suspended on rubber bands hanging on a rubber cord, with this soft support at the twelve o’clock position. The accelerometer was mounted on the metal hub in the six o’clock position. Both the steel gear and the composite gear were subjected to a series of impacts in the radial direction and a series of impacts in the axial direction. Axial impacts were concentrated at approximately the seven o’clock position on the gear at a radius just inboard of the teeth. For the composite gear, this location was at the edge of the composite portion of the gear. For radial impacts, a tooth near the ten o’clock position was impacted at the tip. A nylon bolt on either side of the tip was used to more effectively set the standoff distance between the tip and the gear, enabling more consistent impacts between tests. A total of ten impacts were performed in each of these four configurations.

Impact Study

The time-domain data signal was imported into an automated signal analysis and filtering software package. The data was then filtered to isolate the signal associated with the natural frequency corresponding to the first non-rigid body mode. The log decrement was calculated for each filtered data set. From this calculation, modal parameters of the hybrid specimen and its steel counterpart were estimated and compared. Figure 5 depicts an example of both a raw and a filtered data set.

Additionally, the unfiltered results of each impact were viewed in the frequency domain to compare results within configuration groups. These are depicted in Figure 6. These figures each show the frequency data from four of the ten impacts for each configuration.
Figure 4.—Impact locations shown for hybrid gears (similar for all-steel gear).

Figure 5.—Sample data raw. (a) Time domain signal. (b) Filtered data.

Figure 6.—Frequency domain results, axial location impacts. All steel gear. (b) Hybrid gear.
Using the basic log decrement relationships, modal properties of the gears were estimated. These estimates are presented in Table 3. As expected, the hybrid gear exhibits higher damping properties than its steel counterpart. This has the potential to reduce transmitted vibration as compared to all-steel gears. Note, that the damping properties vary somewhat, depending upon the impact position. The experimentally determined mean and standard deviation of the natural frequency corresponding to the first non-rigid mode are also provided.

**FEA Modal Study—Steel Gear**

A modal analysis was conducted for the 42-tooth steel gear to verify natural frequencies identified in the experiment and to provide information on the associated mode shapes. The solid model of the gear captures the tooth geometry to a reasonable extent, but does not include subtle geometric features such as tip relief. For the purposes of a modal analysis however, the solid model is a close approximation to the test specimens.

The finite element mesh is a solid mesh consisting of 19152 linear tetrahedron elements and having a total of 31002 nodes. The characteristic element size is approximately 0.10 in. The gear specimens are made from AISI 9310 steel, which is represented in the analysis as a linear isotropic material with Young’s modulus of $29 \times 10^6$ psi ($2.0 \times 10^{11}$ Pa), Poisson’s ratio of 0.29, and mass density of $0.284$ lbm/in.$^3$ ($7861$ kg/m$^3$). The analysis is conducted on the unconstrained gear (free-free).

The first six modes identified in the analysis are rigid body translations and rigid body rotations; one mode is associated with each translational or rotational degree of freedom. Therefore starting at mode 7 to 12 the frequencies associated with these modes are shown in Table 4. The mode shape for mode 7 is shown in Figure 7. The mode shapes found illustrated that the modal displacements are primarily in the axial direction for the modes of interest, guiding accelerometer placement.

**FEA Modal Study—Hybrid Gear**

A modal analysis was also conducted for the 42-tooth hybrid gear to verify natural frequencies identified in the experiment and determine the associated mode shapes. As in the case of the steel gear, the tooth geometry is a reasonable representation but does not include all subtle features of the teeth. The deviation of the model geometry from the physical specimens is expected to have a negligible effect on the modal results.

The finite element mesh is a solid mesh consisting of 25672 linear tetrahedron elements and having a total of 39166 nodes. The characteristic element size is approximately 0.10 in. The composite portion of the gear is constructed of prepreg triaxial braided carbon fiber with alternating orientation between adjacent layers, and resin. Due to the anisotropic nature of the material, consideration was given to modeling each individual ply with orthotropic properties. However, due to the large number of plies, it was determined that the composite portion of the gear could be modeled using isotropic properties.

The hub and ring portions of the gear were modeled using properties of AISI 9310 steel, which is represented in the analysis as a linear isotropic material with Young’s modulus of $29 \times 10^6$ psi ($2.0 \times 10^{11}$ Pa), Poisson’s ratio of 0.29, and mass density of $0.284$ lbm/in.$^3$ ($7861$ kg/m$^3$). The composite portion
of the gear is modeled as a linear isotropic material with Young’s modulus of $6.4 \times 10^6$ psi ($4.4 \times 10^{10}$ Pa), Poisson’s ratio of 0.30, and mass density of 0.055 lbm/in.\(^3\) (1522 kg/m\(^3\)). The analysis is conducted on the unconstrained gear (free-free), and the components are treated as welded together (node-to-node constraint at the interfaces). It is notable that the calculated bulk modulus properties for the composite are not linear as the tensile elastic modulus of $6.4 \times 10^6$ psi compares to a compressive elastic modulus of $6.1 \times 10^6$ psi when using bulk properties, a difference of 5 percent. Based on the relatively minor difference and the square root dependence of frequency on stiffness, the bulk tensile modulus was used in this simplified case. Based on these small differences, it was decided to use the bulk properties to simplify the analysis.

Modes 7 to 12, identified in the analysis, are shown in Table 5. The first 6 modes are related to the rigid body translations and rigid body rotations. The mode shape for mode 7 is shown in Figure 8.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode number</th>
<th>Frequency, Hz</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>7780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>7913</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>13745</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>14592</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>15725</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>16483</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comparison of FEA to Experiment—Natural Frequencies**

A comparison between the finite element output and the experimental results was conducted in the first step of validating the FEA model. Figure 9 depicts a comparison between the measured frequencies of the steel spur gear specimen and the predicted frequencies of the finite element model. An exact frequency match falls directly on the diagonal. The result shows good agreement between model predictions and the experimental results.

For the hybrid gear on the other hand, modes identified in the experiment generally shifted to lower frequencies, whereas the model predicted a shift to higher frequencies. In the model, this is an expected result since the composite has a higher ratio of elastic modulus to density than steel, and the area moment of inertia is considerably larger for the cross section of the hybrid gear. However, the FE model assumes adjacent surfaces in components are bonded together.

Based on actual construction methods, the interfaces may have a lower effective stiffness such that the experiment would produce modes at frequencies lower than predicted. Changes to the interfaces can be made in the model to bring the natural frequencies within the ranges of the experiment, but this may not provide additional physical insight to the properties of the interface. However, such an approach may be employed to improve the model for subsequent stress analysis.

Unlike the steel gear, comparison between the hybrid gear finite element results and the experimental results did not produce similar mode frequencies as the all steel gear. From the experiments, the hybrid gear exhibits two significant peaks at approximately 6270 and 9743 Hz. The modes found from finite element analysis did not compare well to the experiments. It is expected that further model development will reduce some of these inconsistencies with the experimental data.

**Dynamic Testing**

Two types of dynamic tests were conducted to determine if gears could be considered as possible composite candidates in future rotorcraft drive systems. The first set of tests measured vibration and noise at four speeds and four levels of torque. The second test was an operational endurance test.
The dynamic tests for noise and vibration were conducted with four different gear arrangements at four different rotational speeds and four different levels of load. The gears were installed in the test rig in the following configurations: (1) all steel both sides, (2) hybrid gear left side, all steel gear right side, (3) all steel gear left side, hybrid gear right side, and (4) hybrid gear both sides. When the facility is operating, the left side gear is the driving gear and the right side is the driven gear. All vibration measurements were made on the driven side support bearing housing as shown in Figure 10.

For the four configurations mentioned above, tests were run at 2500, 5000, 7500, and 10000 rpm and at 133, 238, 448, and 658 in.*lb torque. The vibration level in “g’s” is shown in Figure 11. The noise level was measured via a hand-held sound level meter at a distance of 1 in. from the test gearbox cover. The sound level was recorded on an A-weighted scale. The results of the sound level data are shown in Figure 12. The four test rig configurations are shown at four speed and load conditions.

Figure 10.—Test facility shown with cover removed. Accelerometers are located on the right side driven gear. The hybrid—all steel gear arrangement shown in the photograph.

Figure 11.—Vibration data taken for four speeds and four load levels.
From the vibration data shown in Figure 11, the hybrid gear generally reduced the overall vibration level with a mixed or all hybrid configurations. For the noise data of Figure 12 the mixed hybrid gear arrangement and all hybrid arrangement produced less noise for the two higher speed conditions.

Although some vibration and noise reduction was seen with the hybrid gears, the results were not as dramatic as expected. There are several reasons why noise and vibration had only modest reduction. First, the manufacturing process used to fabricate the hybrid gear did not result in aerospace quality accuracy. The composite curing actually reduced the backlash of the components due to stretching of the metal outside rim. The backlash also was not consistent around the gear. Both of these “manufacturing errors” could be corrected by post-composite-attachment final grinding of the gear teeth. The noise data is related to how well the teeth mesh during operation. In effect the noise measured at a small distance from the cover is a combination of airborne and structure borne from the meshing gear teeth being reradiated from the test facility cover.

## Long-Term Testing

An endurance test was conducted on the hybrid gears in NASA’s Spur Gear Test Facility. The hybrid gear arrangement was run for over $300 \times 10^6$ cycles (gear revolutions) at 10000 rpm, 250 psi torque load (553 in.*lb torque) with an oil inlet temperature of ~120 °F. The hybrid gears operated without any problem during this extended test period. The gears did not show any signs of fatigue during post-test inspection.

## Summary and Conclusions

Based on the results attained in this study the following conclusions can be made:

1. Hybrid gear arrangement shows promise as the gears were operated for an extended period of time at a relatively high speed and torque.
2. Power to weight improvement could be possible – as steel webs could be replaced by lightweight composite material. For the gears tested, a ~20 percent decrease in weight was realized without optimization of the components.
3. Reduced noise and vibration would be expected when manufacturing processing produces aerospace quality gears. The hybrid gears test only show modest improvements in vibration and noise. More significant improvements are possible with improved manufacturing processes and possible material tailoring through the composite structure.
References

Hybrid Gear Preliminary Results—Application of Composites to Dynamic Mechanical Components


Composite spur gears were fabricated and then tested at NASA Glenn Research Center. The composite material served as the web of the gear between the gear teeth and a metallic hub for mounting to the torque-applying shaft. The composite web was bonded only to the inner and outer hexagonal features that were machined from an initially all-metallic aerospace quality spur gear. The Hybrid Gear was tested against an all-steel gear and against a mating Hybrid Gear. As a result of the composite to metal fabrication process used, the concentricity of the gears were reduce from their initial high-precision value. Regardless of the concentricity error, the hybrid gears operated successfully for over 300 million cycles at 10000 rpm and 553 in.*lb torque. Although the design was not optimized for weight, the composite gears were found to be 20 percent lighter than the all-steel gears. Free vibration modes and vibration/noise tests were also conducted to compare the vibration and damping characteristic of the Hybrid Gear to all-steel gears. The initial results indicate that this type of hybrid design may have a dramatic effect on drive system weight without sacrificing strength.