KINEMATIC EVOLUTION OF SIMULATED STAR-FORMING GALAXIES

SUSAN A. KASSIN,1 ALYSON BROOKS,2 FABIO GOVERNATO,3 BENJAMIN J. WEINER,4 AND JONATHAN P. GARDNER5

INTRODUCTION

Over the last \( \sim 8 \) billion years since a redshift of one, the population of star-forming galaxies of \( \sim \) Milky Way mass has settled kinematically into flat, rotationally-supported, disk galaxies (Kassin et al. 2007, 2012). In the past, these galaxies had more disordered motions (as measured via an integrated gas velocity dispersion, \( \sigma_g \)) and less ordered rotation (\( V_{rot} \)) than they do today (Flores et al. 2006; Kassin et al. 2007; Vergani et al. 2012; Kassin et al. 2012). Over \( 0.1 < z < 1.2 \), the median \( \sigma_g \) of star-forming galaxies of \( \sim \) Milky Way mass has progressively decreased while \( V_{rot} \) has increased (Kassin et al. 2012). Observations at even higher redshifts (\( z \sim 1.5 - 3 \)), albeit where galaxy samples are much less representative, also find star-forming galaxies with large amounts of disordered motions, as measured through \( \sigma_g \) (e.g., Förster-Schreiber et al. 2009; Law et al. 2009; Wright et al. 2009; Lemoine-Busserolle & Lamareille 2010; Lemoine-Busserolle et al. 2010; Gnerucci et al. 2011).

These findings are an important benchmark for any theory or simulation of disk galaxy formation. Constraints on the internal kinematics of the galaxies are significantly more stringent than constraints on e.g., luminosity, stellar mass, or star formation rate. Internal kinematics directly dictate how the gas in galaxies is arranged, which is heavily influenced by the physical processes involved in galaxy evolution. Furthermore, if theory is able to successfully reproduce observations of kinematic evolution, then it becomes a useful tool to help interpret the observations. In particular, we would like to know the physical processes behind disk settling.

Until now, robust measurements of the internal kinematics of simulated galaxies were lacking as the simulations suffered from low resolution, overproduction of stars, and overly massive bulges. These problems were ameliorated by increased resolution (e.g., Mayer et al. 2001), better treatment of feedback (Stinson et al. 2006; Hopkins et al. 2012; Wise et al. 2012), and modeling of the ultraviolet background (Quim, Katz, & Efstathiou 1996). The current generation of galaxy simulations is able to match the rotation velocities, sizes, stellar masses, and baryon fractions of local disk galaxies (e.g., Governato et al. 2007; Brooks et al. 2011; Brook et al. 2012; Munshi et al. 2013; Christensen et al. 2013; Vogelsberger et al. 2013), as well as some properties of higher redshift galaxies (e.g., Hirschmann et al. 2013; Zemp et al. 2013; Hopkins et al. 2013). They are the first generation of simulations which are able to make quantitative predictions for the internal kinematics of galaxies.

However, most simulations have concentrated on reproducing only the rotation velocities of local disk galaxies (e.g., Guedes et al. 2011; Stinson et al. 2013; McCarthy et al. 2012; Brook et al. 2012). A few have measured \( \sigma_g \), but only for \( z = 0 \) (e.g., Rößkar et al. 2013; Agertz et al. 2013) or \( z = 2 \) (e.g., Ceverino, Dekel, & Bournaud 2010; Anglés-Alcázar et al. 2013). Croft et al. (2009) measured \( V_{rot} \) and \( \sigma_g \) at \( z = 0 \) and \( z = 1 \) for galaxies in their simulations, and made comparisons to the observed \( V_{rot} \) and S0.5 \( \equiv 0.5V_{rot}^{2} + \sigma_g^{2} \) Tully-Fisher relations from Kassin et al. (2007). No studies have yet compared simulated galaxies to the progressive disk settling found at \( 0.1 < z < 1.2 \) by Kassin et al. (2012).
In this paper, for the first time, we determine whether fully cosmological simulations of star-forming galaxies undergo the kinematic disk settling found in observations of real galaxies.

2. HYDRO_DYNAMIC SIMULATIONS

The kinematics of star-forming galaxies in the real universe are measured from nebular emission lines which trace gas heated in star-forming regions. In order to compare hydrodynamic simulations of galaxies most directly with observations, the simulations need to make predictions for the gas in galaxies. Treatment of the interstellar medium is crucial for this. Therefore, we look to simulations of four star-forming galaxies run with the N-Body + smooth particle hydrodynamic code GASOLINE (Wadsley, Stadel, & Quinn 2004; Stinson et al. 2006) which are described in detail in Christensen et al. (2012, 2013) and Munshi et al. (2013). They are able to match the sizes, stellar masses, bulge masses, and baryon fractions of local star-forming galaxies (Governato et al. 2007; Brook et al. 2012; Munshi et al. 2013; Christensen et al. 2013), and the size evolution of star-forming galaxies since $z = 1$ (Brooks et al. 2011). The simulated galaxies have $z = 0$ stellar masses which range 4.2 - 4.5 x 10$^{10}$ M$_{\odot}$, for a Kroupa, Tout, & Gilmore (1993) initial mass function (IMF). They are referred to as galaxies h239, h277, h258, and h285 in the references above.

These simulations resolve high density peaks comparable in size to giant molecular clouds. In addition, they follow the non-equilibrium formation and destruction of H$_2$, using a gas-phase and a dust- (and hence metallicity-) dependent scheme that traces the Lyman-Werner radiation field and allows for self-shielding by H$_2$ gas (Gnedin, Tassis, & Kravtsov 2009; Christensen et al. 2013). Therefore, the simulations are able to tie star formation to the presence of molecular gas, as is indicated by observations (e.g., Leroy et al. 2008; Bigiel et al. 2008; Blanc et al. 2009; Bigiel et al. 2010; Schruba et al. 2011). The efficiency of star formation is tied to the H$_2$ fraction, as described in Christensen et al. (2012). With the inclusion of H$_2$-based star formation, stars predominantly form at high densities and low temperatures (T < 1000 K; see also Krumholz, Klein, & McKee 2011; Kuhlen et al. 2012). Finally, to take into account the effects of the reionization of the universe, an ultraviolet background is implemented at $z = 9$, following a modified version of the formulation by Haardt & Madau (2001).

Our simulated galaxies were chosen from lower resolution simulations to be re-simulated at high resolution based on their $z = 0$ virial masses and because they span a representative range of halo spin values and accretion histories. The re-simulations follow a 50 Mpc co-moving box around the galaxies at lower resolution than the galaxy itself. In this manner, cosmological effects are fully implemented. The re-simulations are run from $z = 150$ to $z = 0$.

The spline force softening in the high resolution region is 174 parsecs, and is kept fixed in physical parsecs since $z = 10$. In the high resolution region, dark matter particles have masses of 1.3 x 10$^{5}$ M$_{\odot}$, gas particles start at 2.7 x 10$^{4}$ M$_{\odot}$, and star particles are born with 30% of the mass of their parent gas particle, which corresponds to a maximum initial mass of 8100 M$_{\odot}$. Each simulated galaxy has $\sim$ 5 million dark matter particles

within its virial radius at $z = 0$ and more than 14 million total particles (dark matter, gas, and stars). Our simulations have the same mass resolution as the Eris simulation (Guedes et al. 2011), but include metal line cooling (Shen, Wadsley, & Stinson 2010) and the physics of molecular hydrogen (Christensen et al. 2012). The simulations are run for a WMAP 3 Year Cosmology: $\Omega_m = 0.24, \Lambda = 0.76, H_0 = 73$ km s$^{-1}$, $\sigma_8 = 0.77$ (Spergel et al. 2007).

2.1. Warm & Cold Gas in the Simulations

The nebular emission lines in real galaxies, from which internal kinematics are measured, largely come from H II regions, with a small contribution from diffuse ionized gas. Gas in H II regions has been ionized by young stars after the stars and gas emerge from their dusty birth environments inside dense regions of molecular clouds. We investigate two types of star forming gas in the simulations which should bracket the kinematic behavior of H II regions: (1) cold gas in the galaxy disks which we refer to as “cold gas”, and (2) dense gas in the galaxy disks which has been heated by supernovae and feedback and which we refer to as “warm gas.” Cold gas is defined as having temperatures $T < 1000 K$. It has typical densities of $> 1$ amu cm$^{-3}$ and traces both neutral gas in the disk and molecular clouds at $\rho > 100$ amu cm$^{-3}$ (Christensen et al. 2013). Warm gas is defined as having $\rho > 0.001$ amu cm$^{-3}$; it has temperatures in excess of 20,000K due to heating by feedback. Star-forming regions in observed galaxies likely contain ionized gas from both the cold and warm components because they are being observed after the young stars are visible and some feedback has had a chance to occur. Therefore, we expect the behavior of the cold and warm gas in the simulations to bracket that of H II regions.

3. KINEMATIC EVOLUTION OF SIMULATED GALAXIES

For each of the 4 simulated galaxies, we measure $\sigma_g$ and $V_{rot}$ at discrete redshifts sampling the range of observations in Kassin et al. (2012). We measure the intrinsic values of these quantities which are unaffected by observational effects such as seeing, slit width, and pixel scale. The quantity $\sigma_g$ is measured as the average integrated velocity dispersion of the gas in the direction perpendicular to the disk, similar to observations. The rotation velocity $V_{rot}$ is measured as the maximum line-of-sight velocity of the gas, also similar to the observations which use the rotation velocity on the flat part of the rotation curve. We use the actual gas particle velocities rather than circular velocities since this provides the most direct comparison to observations. Rotation velocities are all corrected for inclination.

Median values of $\sigma_g$ and $V_{rot}$ at discrete redshifts for the warm and cold gas in our 4 simulated galaxies are shown in the top panels of Figure 1. Values of these quantities for the individual simulated galaxies are shown in the bottom panels. In the top panels, the median values are compared to those for an observed mass-limited sample of 270 star-forming galaxies from Kassin et al. (2012). Qualitatively, the simulated galaxies follow the same trends as the observations: they increase in $\sigma_g$ and decrease in $V_{rot}$ with increasing redshift over 0.1 $< z < 1.2$. In other words, both the simulations and the observations decrease in $\sigma_g$ and increase in $V_{rot}$ with
3.1. Quantitative Trends of $\sigma_g$ and $V_{rot}$ with Redshift

Linear relations are fit to the median points in Figure 1 by performing least-squares fits which take into account the errors in $\sigma_g$ and $V_{rot}$ (errors in redshift are negligible). When fitting, to avoid covariances, we zero-point the medians near the middle of the samples such that they vary around $\sim$zero. We obtain the following fits for $\sigma_g$ for the warm gas, cold gas, and observations, respectively:

$$\log \sigma_g - 50 = (19.3 \pm 6.2)(z - 0.6) - (4.2 \pm 1.8), \quad (1)$$
$$\log \sigma_g - 20 = (6.4 \pm 6.8)(z - 0.6) - (2.3 \pm 1.8), \quad (2)$$
$$\log \sigma_g - 35 = (26.0 \pm 5.7)(z - 0.6) - (3.1 \pm 1.4). \quad (3)$$

These fits have $\chi^2$ values of 1.9, 2.5, and 4.7, respectively. As for the observations, the median $\sigma_g$ of both the warm and cold gas grows with increasing redshift to $z = 1.2$ (i.e., decreases with time), although the relation for the cold gas is consistent with no evolution. The slopes of the relations for the warm gas and observations are consistent within uncertainties. As mentioned above, the normalization of the relations for the warm and cold gas are higher and lower than the observations, respectively.
We obtain the following fits for $V_{\text{rot}}$ for the warm gas, cold gas, and observations, respectively:

$$\log V_{\text{rot}} - 175 = (-84.7 \pm 11.4)(z - 0.6) - (12.0 \pm 5.5), \quad (4)$$
$$\log V_{\text{rot}} - 200 = (-47.6 \pm 11.5)(z - 0.6) - (0.1 \pm 3.8), \quad (5)$$
$$\log V_{\text{rot}} - 100 = (-48 \pm 11.5)(z - 0.6) - (7.8 \pm 3.0). \quad (6)$$

These fits have $\chi^2$ values of 4.7, 7.4, and 9.2, respectively. As for the observations, the median $V_{\text{rot}}$ of both the warm and cold gas decreases with increasing redshift to $z = 1.2$ (i.e., increases with time). The simulated galaxies have a higher normalization (i.e., have faster median rotation velocities) than the real galaxies, as expected because they are on average more massive than the observed galaxy sample, as discussed above.

### 3.2. Kinematics and Morphology

As is the case for real galaxies over $0.1 < z < 1.2$ (e.g., Flores et al. 2006; Kassin et al. 2007; Yang et al. 2008; Kassin et al. 2012), the kinematics of simulated galaxies are reflected in their morphologies. Images of two of our four simulated galaxies are shown in Figure 2 at discrete redshifts over the redshift range in Figure 1. Both galaxies have more disturbed morphologies at $z = 1.0$, and become progressively less disturbed with decreasing redshift. At $z = 0$ they appear as ordered disk galaxies with little disturbances or peculiarities. This morphological transformation is consistent with the kinematic settling they undergo (i.e, decrease in $\sigma_g$ and increase in $V_{\text{rot}}$ with time).

The images in Figure 2 are produced by taking into account the effects of radiative transfer and dust using a Monte-Carlo ray tracing program designed to pair with hydrodynamic simulations (Sunrise; Jonsson 2006; Jonsson, Groves, & Cox 2010). In short, Sunrise creates a spectral energy distribution for each star particle in the simulation based on its age and metallicity, using the Starburst99 stellar population modeling software (Leitherer et al. 1999). The metallicities of the gas particles determine how light from the galaxy is attenuated by dust, and a constant dust to gas ratio of 0.4 is assumed. The resulting images are then convolved with the SDSS $g$, $r$, and $i$ band filters to produce those in Figure 2.

### 4. Conclusions

For the first time we measure the evolution of the kinematics of simulated star-forming galaxies over the last $\sim 8$ billion years, over nearly half of the age of the universe. Specifically, we measure the evolution of disordered motions ($\sigma_g$) and ordered rotation ($V_{\text{rot}}$) of gas in a suite of four simulated galaxies. Measurements are compared with recent observations which show the progressive settling of gas in disk galaxies over $0.1 < z < 1.2$ from disordered systems into the ordered disk galaxies common today (Kassin et al. 2012). We find that the simulated galaxies follow the same trends as the observations: they progressively decrease in disordered motions ($\sigma_g$) and increase in ordered rotation ($V_{\text{rot}}$) with time. Differences in normalization between the observations and simulations can be attributed to differences in the average stellar mass of the galaxy samples and gas.
temperatures/regions probed. Reproducing these observations is an important benchmark for any theory or simulation of disk galaxy formation. The observations trace the internal kinematics of star-forming galaxies over a significant period of time. Internal kinematics directly dictate how the gas in galaxies is arranged, and are strongly affected by physical processes such as feedback from star-formation, major/minor mergers, and smooth accretion of baryons. Our next step in a future work is to place constraints on the processes which have the most direct effect on disk settling.

FG acknowledges support from NSF grant AST-0607819. Resources supporting this work were provided by the NASA High-End Computing (HEC) Program through the NASA Advanced Supercomputing (NAS) Division at Ames Research Center. AB would like to thank Jay Gallagher for helpful conversations.

REFERENCES

Bigiel, F. et al. 2010, AJ, 140, 1194
Christensen, C., Governato, F., Quinn, T. et al. arXiv:1211.0326
Rózsatorn, Teyssier, Agertz, Wetzstein, & Moore arXiv:1308.6321
Wadsley, J. W., Stadel, J., & Quinn, T. 2004, New Astronomy, 9, 137