A Robust Response of the Hadley Circulation to Global Warming

William K. M. Lau and K. M. Kim

Earth Science Division,

NASA/Goddard Space Flight Center

Greenbelt, MD 20771

January, 2014

Submitted to Nature Geoscience
Abstract

Tropical rainfall is expected to increase in a warmer climate. Yet, recent studies have inferred that the Hadley Circulation (HC), which is primarily driven by latent heating from tropical rainfall, is weakened under global warming. Here, we show evidence of a robust intensification of the HC from analyses of 33 CMIP5 model projections under a scenario of 1% per year CO₂ emission increase. The intensification is manifested in a “deep-tropics squeeze”, characterized by a pronounced increase in the zonal mean ascending motion in the mid and upper troposphere, a deepening and narrowing of the convective zone and enhanced rainfall in the deep tropics. These changes occur in conjunction with a rise in the region of maximum outflow of the HC, with accelerated meridional mass outflow in the uppermost branch of the HC away from the equator, coupled to a weakened inflow in the return branches of the HC in the lower troposphere.
1. Introduction

The Hadley Circulation (HC), the zonally averaged meridional overturning cell connecting the tropics and mid-latitude, is a key component of the global atmospheric general circulation. How the HC has been, or will be changed as a result of global warming has tremendous societal implications on changes in weather and climate patterns, especially the occurrences of severe floods and droughts around the world \(^1-^3\). Recent studies have argued that because of the balance requirement for water vapor and precipitation, the tropical circulation has to be weakened as a result of global warming \(^4-^6\). Numerous authors have cited the weakening of the Walker Circulation in global warming experiments as an evidence of weakening of the tropical circulation \(^5,^6\). Others have emphasized that the weakening of the Walker circulation is due to global warming induced equatorial sea surface temperature east-west gradient, rather than a result of the water vapor-precipitation constraint \(^7,^8\). Analysis of observations of long-term (~30 years) tropical rainfall showed that the Walker Circulation actually has been strengthening in recent decades, suggesting that the tropical circulation may have been more strongly affected by natural variability \(^9-^{11}\). While it is generally agreed that the rate of global precipitation change and water recycling time are strongly controlled by atmospheric radiation balance especially longwave radiative cooling, regional rainfall anomalies are more likely to be controlled by local changes in circulation and surface energy fluxes \(^12-^{14}\). Even though a robust signal in the widening of the subtropics associated with the expansion of the HC under global warming has been found in climate model projections and observations \(^6,^{15-19}\), a weakening of HC has yet to be demonstrated convincingly. Observations based on reanalysis data have shown weak signals of increasing, decreasing or no change in HC strength in recent decades \(^20-^{22}\) depending on the data source and the period of analyses. Particularly, reanalysis wind and moisture data in the
tropical upper atmosphere are subject to large biases, and extreme caution has to be exercised in
the use of these data for trend detection for the HC $^{21,23}$. Previous theoretical studies have found that the HC is very sensitive to heating in the deep
tropics, *i.e.*, a small increase in heating concentrated near the equator can lead to significant
strengthening of the HC $^{24,25}$. One of the major difficulties with the notion of a weakening of
the tropical circulation is that rainfall in the deep tropics have been shown to be increasing due to
global warming in model simulations $^{3,7,26-28}$, and in multi-decadal satellite rainfall observations
$^{29,30}$. Increased rainfall in the deep tropics will be associated with enhanced condensational
heating, and therefore overall strengthening of tropical circulation as represented by the HC.
Hence the paradigm of weakening tropical circulation associated with global warming is
confronted with some perplexing questions. How can a weakened tropical circulation be
compatible with increased tropical rainfall? Why is there no obvious signal of weakening or
strengthening of the HC in observations and in GCM simulations, given that it is the most basic
representation of the tropical circulation? In this paper, we show evidence of an
intensification of the HC under global warming, as manifested in enhanced ascent in the rising
branch of the HC, a deepening of tropical convection, a narrowing of the convective zone in the
deep tropics, and enhanced rainfall in the equatorial central and eastern Pacific.

2. Results

To establish the baseline response of the HC to greenhouse gas (GHG) warming, we used
outputs from a 140-year integration of each of 33 CMIP5 (Coupled Model Intercomparison
Project -5) models forced by 1% increase per year CO$_2$ emission to explore the response of the
HC to global warming (See Data and Method in Supplementary Material for details). Effects
from other greenhouse gases besides CO$_2$ and aerosols are not considered here. The control, also referred to as climatology, is defined as the first 25 years of the 140-year model simulation. By the mid-point of the integration, i.e., 25-years centered at year-70 of the integration, the CO$_2$ level is nearly doubled (DCO$_2$), and by the last 25-year, the CO$_2$ level is nearly tripled (TCO$_2$). In this work, we only focused on the forced response, as represented by the Multi Model Mean (MMM), defined as the average of all 33 models. The uncertainties of the MMM are estimated from the standard deviation between individual models and the MMM. Anomalies are defined as the MMM difference between either DCO$_2$, or TCO$_2$ with respect to the control. Because the conclusions are essentially the same for DCO$_2$ and TCO$_2$ except for higher signal-to-noise ratio in the latter, results shown in this paper are for TCO$_2$, unless otherwise stated.

*Vertical motions*

Consistent with previous studies $^3$-$^6$, we find that in response to a 1% per year CO$_2$ increase, the MMM global temperature and rainfall increases steadily, with an estimated rainfall sensitivity of $1.5 \pm 0.1 \text{ K}^{-1}$ much slower than that for saturated water vapor as governed by the Clausius-Clapeyron relationship ($\sim 7 \text{ K}^{-1}$). The associated changes in the large-scale tropical circulation as reflected in the mid-tropospheric (500hPa) vertical motions averaged over different latitudinal width are shown in Fig. 1. In the near-equatorial regions ($5^\circ$S-$5^\circ$N), there is a robust increasing trend in upward motion as indicated by the near constant positive slope ($\sim 5.2 \pm 1.0 \% \text{ K}^{-1}$) and the small spread among the models. At wider latitude bands ($10^\circ$S-$10^\circ$N and $20^\circ$S-$20^\circ$N), the changes in vertical motions are substantially muted. When the zonal averages are taken over the entire tropics ($30^\circ$S-$30^\circ$N), the vertical motions again show a robust rise, but with much smaller amplitude compared to $5^\circ$S-$5^\circ$N. Based on the similar signs of the control and the trends, these results indicate that global warming induces enhanced mean rising motion
over the entire tropics (30°S-30°N), with the most contributions coming from the near equatorial region (5°S-5°N).

To better understand the response, we examine the relationship between zonally averaged rainfall and vertical motions (Fig. 2). Both the climatological MMM rainfall and 500 hPa pressure velocity show double maxima in the tropics, with a minimum over the equator, consistent with the observed off-equatorial positions of the Inter-Tropical Convergence Zones (ITCZ). The anomalous rainfall profile shows pronounced increase in rainfall between 10°S and 10°N, a widening of the subtropical dry zones, and increase rainfall in the extratropics of both hemispheres (Fig. 2a). The anomalous pressure velocity profile (Fig. 2b) features wavelike perturbations that generally have signs opposite to the climatology, with enhanced anomalous rising motion coinciding with increased rainfall in the deep tropics. Strong compensating anomalous sinking motions are found centered near 10°S and 10°N, which appear to be coupled with anomalous rising motion in the subtropics centered around 25-30° N and S.

Comparing the vertical profiles of the pressure velocity in the control (Fig. 2c) with the anomaly (Fig. 2d), a structural change can be perceived in the form of a narrowing and stronger anomalous ascent throughout the troposphere in the equatorial region, flanked on both sides by equally strong descent centered near 10°S and 10°N. This creates the appearance of a filling-in of the climatological equatorial minimum by a “squeeze” of the ascending branch of the HC toward the equator from both hemispheres. This “deep–tropics squeeze” (DTS) appears to be coupled to positive anomalies, i.e., weakened sinking motions, near the center of the climatological subsiding branches of the HC. A widening of the subtropics is achieved via the DTS together with a poleward extension (marked by zero-wind contours) of the sinking branch of the HC. Associated with structural changes in the vertical motions of the HC are also poleward shifts of
the Ferrel and polar cells in both hemispheres, as indicated by the positions of the anomalous positive and negative centers, and the zero-vertical motion lines. These changes in the HC and related global signals are robust in the sense that more than two-third (25/33) of the models agree on the sign of the anomalies (grid points highlighted by a green dot in Fig. 2d) almost everywhere.

*Tropical Convection*

To understand the nature of the DTS, we examine the changes in tropical convection and the large-scale tropical circulation. Here, as a proxy for tropical convection, monthly outgoing longwave radiation, OLR will be used. Based on a comparison of observations between monthly OLR from NOAA AVHRR, and daily brightness temperature from TRMM (For details see Fig. S1 and discussions in Supplementary Material), a high OLR (>270 Wm\(^{-2}\)) can be identified crudely with the predominance of low level liquid-phase clouds; a moderate OLR (270 -220 Wm\(^{-2}\)) with mid-level mixed phase clouds, and a low OLR (<220 Wm\(^{-2}\)) with deep, ice-phase clouds and deep convection \(^{32-35}\). We have computed the MMM climatological probability distribution functions (pdf) of OLR and their changes due to global warming. The climatological OLR pdf (Fig. 3a, b) indicates a weak bimodal distribution of convection in the deep tropics, with an abundance of low to mid-level liquid clouds and mixed phase clouds, as well as ice-phase clouds (OLR < 220 Wm\(^{-2}\)) associated with deep tropical convection. Near the equator (Fig. 3a), the anomalous OLR profile indicates a shift toward deeper convection, as evident in the pronounced increase in the frequency of lower OLR (colder cloud top) and decrease in higher OLR (warmer cloud top) in the range of 5-15%. At 10\(^{\circ}\)S-10\(^{\circ}\)N, similar shift toward deeper convection can be seen, though the signal is weaker (< 10%) compared to near the equator, due to the anomalous subsidence near 10\(^{\circ}\)S and N. (See also Fig. 2). As more of the subtropics is
included (See Fig. S2 in Supplementary Material), the deeper convection signal is weakened substantially, while a slight increase in the very low and warm (OLR~300 Wm$^{-2}$) clouds begins to emerge $^{33,34}$. The deepening of convection is consistent with the increase in upward velocity in the ascending branch of the HC (Fig. 3c and d). The anomalous vertical motion is characterized by an overall enhanced ascent at all levels, most pronounced (up to $\sim$30-40%) increase) at upper levels, signaling an upward shift of maximum ascent from the lower to mid-troposphere (700-300 hPa) to the upper troposphere (300-150 hPa). Averaged over 10$^\circ$S -10$^\circ$N, the enhanced ascent in the upper troposphere is still strong ($\sim$ 30%), but the anomalous vertical motion below 300 hPa is slightly negative, implying a weakened climatological ascending motion (Fig. 3b) in the lower troposphere. The overall slight weakening in the lower troposphere is due to strong anomalous sinking motions found near 10$^\circ$S and 10$^\circ$N, associated with the DTS.

Meridional outflow and jetstreams

The DTS is closely tied to changes in the HC meridional outflow (Fig. 4). Here, the most prominent feature is a vertical dipole wind anomaly, with opposite signs in each hemisphere, i.e., a quadruple pattern, with enhanced outflow away from the equator in the 200 -100 hPa layer, and increased inflow between 400-200hPa, toward the equator. Comparing to the control, this signals a rise in the region of maximum outflow in the upper branch of the HC from its climatological maximum height near 200 hPa to 150 hPa. An examination of the anomalous meridional wind profiles for each model (Supplementary Material Fig. S3) indicates that the rise of the maximum outflow region of the HC under global warming is very robust, with all 33 models showing the characteristic quadruple pattern, albeit with varying magnitudes. The rise in the region of maximum outflow of the HC is consistent with the increase in tropopause height in the tropics under global warming reported in past studies $^{36-38}$. 


Changes in the HC associated with the DTS and their connection to the global circulations can be clearly seen in the anomalous meridional mass streamfunction and zonal winds (Fig. 5). From the signs and locations of the anomalies compared to the control (Fig. 5a), it is clear that the upper branches (above 250 hPa) of the HC in the deep tropics is strengthened, while the lower portion (1000-300 hPa) is weakened, consistent with an elevation of the climatological region of maximum outflow, i.e., a rise of the center of mass, of the HC. The rise together with deeper convection in the ascending branch of the HC allow stronger poleward outflow in the upper troposphere (see also Fig. 4), thus extending the subsidence branches of the HC in both hemispheres further poleward from their climatological positions. A similar polar extension of the Ferrel cells in both hemispheres, though with much smaller amplitude, can also be discerned. The rise of the center of maximum outflow in the upper branch of the HC is also reflected in changes in the structure of the zonal wind anomaly (Fig. 5b). The most pronounced zonal wind acceleration is found near 100 hPa, above the climatological center at 150-200 hPa in both hemispheres. The subtropical westerly acceleration in both hemispheres is likely to be driven by the deeper convection, and the coriolis force from the stronger outflow in the upper troposphere associated with the meridional wind dipole anomalies noted previously. The extratropical maximum may be related to the enhanced baroclinicity due to increased temperature gradient at the upper troposphere, and polar shift of the wintertime storm tracks\(^{39,40}\). As shown in Supplementary Material (Fig. S4 and S5), the meridional streamfunction and zonal winds exhibit pronounced seasonality with the strongest deepening of the HC and upper troposphere outflow from the summer to the winter hemisphere, with maximum response in the wintertime jetstreams.
The time evolution of the meridional wind dipole anomaly at 10° N and S respectively (Fig. 3) shows an increasingly stronger (weaker) outflow above (below) 200 hPa, in both hemispheres, as the CO2 concentration increases. The near constant positive slopes of the total wind isotachs above 200 hPa reflect a steady rise (~3.5 hPa decade⁻¹) of the region of maximum outflow of the HC. Computations of the meridional mass flux, i.e., mass weighted meridional wind at different cross-sections (See details in discussion of Table S1 in Supplementary Material) show that the mass outflow at the upper portion (200-100 hPa) out of the 10°S-10°N zone is intensifying at a fast rate of +9.8±0.7 % K⁻¹. The rate of increase is even faster at +17.0±1.7%K⁻¹, out of the 5°S-5°N zone which corresponds to the core ascending branch of the HC. The increased meridional mass flux is compensated by strong inflow in the lower portion (400-200 hPa) of the climatological outflow region. Even with the strong compensation, the net anomalous mass flux over the climatological outflow region (400-100 hPa) out of the 5°S-5°N zone is still increasing, albeit at a much reduced net rate of 1.9±0.8% K⁻¹. At 10°S-10°N, the net mass flux in the climatological outflow zone shows a weak decline at 1.2±0.3% K⁻¹, due to the negative mass flux in the lower portion of the outflow region. The weakening may be related to the increased vertical static stability associated with the deepening of tropical convection, and the stronger warming of the upper relative to the lower tropical troposphere under global warming. In contrast to the upper troposphere, changes in the zonal mean meridional wind below 400 hPa are relatively muted, and contribute little to the wind response of the HC. However, because the abundance of water vapor in the lower troposphere, even relatively small changes in meridional winds could induce large changes in moisture transport and convergence, contributing significantly to regional precipitation anomalies including the formation of new dry zones in the
marginal convective regions over tropical land through atmosphere-land feedback processes\textsuperscript{3,26,42}. 

3. Comparison with previous studies

Our findings regarding the DTS and associated deepening and intensifying of the upper branch of the HC induced by increased CO\(_2\) is significantly different from prevailing view of the weakening of the tropical circulation under global warming. We believe that previous studies\textsuperscript{5,6} conflated a global circulation slow down constrained by global water cycle balance requirement, with a tropical circulation change based on the response of the Walker circulation due to changes in tropical east-west sea surface temperature gradient. The HC, which represents the totality of all tropical motions, should be the true measure of tropical circulation change. Many studies\textsuperscript{4-6} used measures of tropical circulation defined by changes in vertical velocity over climatological ascent regions only, ignoring the large increase in latent heating due to increase in heavy precipitation over the central and equatorial Pacific, and the Arabian Sea which are located in climatological descent regions (Supplementary Fig. S6). These precipitation anomalies are likely driven by global warming induced sea surface temperature anomalies\textsuperscript{7}. Focusing only on the climatological ascending regions resulted in an apparent weakening of the climatological vertical motion at all tropical latitudes, even in the deep tropics (Supplementary Fig. S7). However, this apparent weakening of the tropical circulation is associated with the change in the rising branch of the Walker circulation only. It does not take into account the net anomalous heating within the deep tropics, which is contributed strongly from the atmosphere over the equatorial central and eastern Pacific\textsuperscript{3,26,35} (Fig. S6). Previous studies\textsuperscript{21,22} using traditional single metric to define the HC, such as the maximum value at the climatological center of the
meridional mass streamfunction, or at the center of velocity potential at 200hPa also missed the
non-uniform nature of the HC response reported here.

4. Concluding remarks

Based on analyses of outputs of 33 CMIP5 coupled models, we find that a robust
intensification of the HC in response to a prescribed 1% increase per year in CO2 emission. The
intensification is associated with a deep-tropics-squeeze (DTS) anomaly pattern, manifested in
enhanced ascent in the rising branch of the HC, a deepening and narrowing of the convective
zone in the near equatorial regions, and a substantial increase in meridional mass outflow in the
uppermost branch (200-100 hPa). The increase is associated with an upward shift of the region of
maximum outflow of the HC, coupled to a widening of the subtropics, slower return inflow of
the HC in the lower troposphere, as well as poleward migrations of the Ferrel and polar cells in
both hemispheres. These changes in the large-scale circulation are consistent with changes in
global precipitation pattern, satisfying the constraint of global precipitation-water vapor balance,
while dynamically consistent with increased rainfall and latent heat of condensation in the deep
tropics under global warming.


9. Sohn, B. J. & Park, S.-C., Strengthened tropical circulations in past three decades inferred from water vapor transport. J. Geophys. Res. 115, D15112,


Author contributions

WKL & KMK conceived the motivation and analysis methodology of this work. KMK was responsible for processing of the CMIP5 outputs and data analysis. WKL led the writing of this manuscript.

Competing financial interests

The authors declare no competing financial interests.

Figure Captions

Figure 1  Time series of 140 simulated years of MMM 500 hPa vertical motion averaged between a) 5°S-5°N, b)10°S-10°N, c) 20°S-20°N, d) 30°S-30°N, under 1% per year increase CO₂ emission scenario. The MMM is computed from 33 CMIP5 models and the model spread (yellow shading) is the standard errors of the MMM. Unit is negative Pa s⁻¹. The number in the lower right hand corner indicates the MMM vertical velocity in the control.

Figure 2  Latitudinal profile of MMM (a) rainfall, and (b) 500 hPa vertical motion . Climatology is indicated by red line and anomaly by black line. Open circles indicate where more than 75% (25/33) models agree in the sign of the anomalies. Latitude-height profile of MMM 500 hPa vertical motion for (c) climatology and (d) anomaly. Grid points where more than 25 models agree in the sign of the anomaly are indicated by green dots. Rainfall is in unit of mm day⁻¹, and vertical motion is in unit of negative Pa s⁻¹. Different unit scales are used for climatology and anomalies.
Figure 3  Vertical profiles of MMM outgoing longwave radiation (OLR) probability distribution function averaged over (a) 5°S-5°N, and (b) 10°S-10°N. Vertical profile of mean vertical motion averaged over (c) 5°S-5°N, and (d) 10°S-10°N. Climatology is indicated by green line and anomaly by dotted line. The model spread is shown as yellow shading. The magnitudes of the anomalies have been doubled to enhance clarity. Vertical motion is in unit of negative Pa s\(^{-1}\). Unit of OLR is W m\(^{-2}\).

Figure 4  Latitude-height cross-section of MMM meridional winds in the tropics. Climatology is shown in contours, anomaly in color. Unit is in ms\(^{-1}\).

Figure 5  Latitude-height cross-section of MMM for a) meridional mass streamfunction (10\(^{10}\) Kg s\(^{-1}\)), and b) zonal mean wind (ms\(^{-1}\)). MMM climatology is shown in contour, and anomaly in color. For meridional streamfunction, positive (negative) contours indicate clockwise (anticlockwise) circulation around the center of action.

Figure 6  Time-height cross-section of MMM zonally averaged meridional winds (ms\(^{-1}\)) for 140 simulated years, under 1% per year CO\(_2\) increase, across a) 10°N and b) 10°S. Contours denote the total winds, solid (dotted) lines for positive (negative) winds. Wind anomalies are denoted by color shading. In the northern hemisphere (southern hemisphere), outflow away from the equator is denoted by positive (negative) values, and opposite for inflow toward the equator.
Figure 1  Time series of 140 simulated years of MMM 500 hPa vertical motion averaged between a) 5oS-5oN, b) 10oS-10oS, c) 20oS-20oS, d) 30oS-30oS, under 1% per year increase CO₂ emission scenario.

The MMM is computed from 33 CMIP5 models and the model spread (yellow shading) is the standard errors of the mean of the 33 models. Unit is negative Pa s⁻¹. The number in the lower right hand corner indicates the MMM vertical velocity in the control.
Figure 2  Latitudinal profile of MMM rainfall (a), and vertical motion (b). Climatology is indicated by red line and anomaly by black line. Open circles indicate where more than 75% (25/33) models agree in the sign of the anomalies. Latitude-height profile of MMM vertical motion for climatology (c) and anomaly (d). Grid points where more than 25 models agree in the sign of the anomaly are indicated by green dots. Rainfall is in unit of mm day$^{-1}$, and vertical motion is in unit of negative Pa s$^{-1}$. Different unit scales are used for climatology and anomalies.
Figure 3  Vertical profiles of MMM outgoing longwave radiation (OLR) probability distribution function averaged over 5°S-5°N (a), and 10°S-10°N (b). Vertical profile of mean vertical motion averaged over 5°S-5°N (c), and 10°S-10°N (d). Climatology is indicated by green line and anomaly by dotted line. The model spread is shown as yellow shading. The magnitudes of the anomalies have been doubled to enhanced clarity. Vertical motion is in unit of negative Pa s$^{-1}$. Unit of OLR is Wm$^{-2}$. 
Figure 4  Latitude-height cross-section of MMM meridional winds in the tropics. Climatology is shown in contours, anomaly in color. Unit is in ms$^{-1}$.
Figure 5 Latitude-height cross-section of MMM for a) meridional mass streamfunction \((10^{10} \text{ Kg s}^{-1})\), and b) zonal mean wind \((\text{ms}^{-1})\). MMM climatology is shown in contour, and anomaly in color. For meridional streamfunction, positive (negative) contours indicate clockwise (anticlockwise) circulation around center of action.
Figure 6  Time-height cross-section of MMM meridional winds (ms$^{-1}$) for the entire 140 simulated years, under 1% per year CO$_2$ increase, across a) 10ºN and b) 10ºS. Contours denote the total winds, solid (dotted) lines for positive (negative) winds. Wind anomalies are denoted by color shading. In the northern hemisphere (southern hemisphere), outflow away from the equator is denoted by positive (negative) values, and opposite for inflow toward the equator.