Summary of 2017 NASA Workshop on Assessment of Advanced Battery Technologies for Aerospace Applications

Dr. Ajay Misra
NASA Glenn Research Center

Presentation at 2018 SciTech Forum, Kissimmee, FL, January 11, 2018
Key Objectives of the workshop:
• Assess the battery needs for future aerospace missions
• Assess the state of battery technology and projected technology advances
• Assess the need for additional investments for future aerospace missions.

Participants:
• 109 participants, 85 non-NASA
• Leaders from DOE, DOE labs (ANL, PNNL, ORNL), Aerospace companies (Boeing, Airbus, Bell Helicopters, GE, P&W, Honeywell), Automotive companies (GM, Chrysler), Battery manufacturers (cell and pack manufacturers), academia, small businesses (many funded by venture capitalists)

Sessions:
• First day – 19 short (~20 min) overview presentations
• Second day morning – 3 breakout sessions – (1) requirements, (2) chemistry and materials, (3) packing and integration

Primary focus was on batteries for Electrified Aircraft Applications
What is Included in This Presentation

- Findings from the workshop

- Additional facts gathered from multiple sources after the workshop
  - System analysis
  - Recent reviews of battery technology
State-of-the-art: Li-Ion Battery

SOA:
- Cell: 250 Wh/kg
- Pack: 150 – 170 Wh/kg

Potential:
- Cell: 300 Wh/kg
- Pack: ~200 Wh/kg
Notional Battery Requirements for Different Classes of Aircraft

Cell level

Pack level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Current capability</th>
<th>250 Wh/kg</th>
<th>~400 Wh/kg</th>
<th>~600 Wh/kg</th>
<th>~1000 Wh/kg</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>150 – 170 Wh/kg</td>
<td>300 Wh/kg</td>
<td>400 - 500 Wh/kg</td>
<td>&gt; 750 Wh/kg</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. 2-3 passenger, CTOL, 200 miles, all electric
2. 2 – 3 passenger, VTOL, 40-50 miles, all electric
3. 6 – 10 passenger, CTOL, 300 – 600 miles, all electric
4. 4 – 10 passenger, VTOL, 60 – 200 miles, all electric
5. 30 passenger, CTOL, 300 miles, all electric
6. 50-70 passenger, CTOL, 300 miles, hybrid electric
7. Light utility helicopter, 100 miles, hybrid electric
8. Extended range for everything in Box 1
9. 50 – 70 passenger, CTOL, > 300 miles, all electric ??
10. 100 -150 passenger, CTOL, 300 miles, hybrid electric ??
11. VTOL - Multi-mission helicopter, hybrid electric, 100 miles ?
12. Extended range for everything in Box 2
13. 737 type hybrid electric aircraft with at least 900 mile range, CTOL
14. Extended range for everything in Box 3

Current capability, 150 – 170 Wh/kg

Pack level, 250 Wh/kg

Cell level, 300 Wh/kg

Notional Battery Requirements for Different Classes of Aircraft

Pack level, 400 - 500 Wh/kg

Cell level, > 750 Wh/kg

Notional Battery Requirements for Different Classes of Aircraft

Pack level, ~1000 Wh/kg

Cell level, ~400 Wh/kg

Notional Battery Requirements for Different Classes of Aircraft

Pack level, ~600 Wh/kg

Cell level, ~1000 Wh/kg

Notional Battery Requirements for Different Classes of Aircraft

Pack level, 737 type hybrid electric aircraft with at least 900 mile range, CTOL
Other Requirements in Addition to High Specific Energy

- Specific power (1 kW/kg for most applications, although some applications might require 2-3 kW/kg)
- Cycle life (1000 - 2000 ??)
- Discharge rate (C rating)
- Speed of charging
- Calendar life

System analysis required to identify detailed requirements
Beyond Li - Ion

Theoretical Energy Density (Wh/kg)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Technology</th>
<th>Energy Density (Wh/kg)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Today Li-ion</td>
<td>~300 Wh/kg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li Metal- High voltage cathode</td>
<td>~500 Wh/kg ?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li-S</td>
<td>~600 – 700 Wh/kg ?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li-air</td>
<td>~900 – 1000 Wh/kg ?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Li Metal With Liquid Electrolyte and Conventional cathode

**Conventional Li-Ion**
- Current Collector
- Cathode
- Separator
- C, C-Si Anode
- Current Collector

**Li Metal**
- Current Collector
- Cathode
- Separator
- Li Metal Anode

---

- Claims of 400 – 450 Wh/kg at cell level by startup companies
- Probably low cycle and long-term life (no publicly available data)
- Optimistic claim for commercial introduction in electric vehicles in 2020 (?????) – might need serious interest from a major manufacturer
- Focus of DOE BAT-500 program

**300 Wh/kg achievable at pack level**

---

Excerpt from ANL study: “300 Wh/kg achievable at pack level”
Progress to date:
- 300 – 400 Wh/kg achieved at cell level, low cycle life
- 250 Wh/kg at pack level, low cycle life
- 180 Wh/kg at cell level with high cycle life

Challenges:
- Limited cycle life (< 300 cycles)
- High self discharge rate
- Reactions not well understood

Maximum achievable specific energy at pack level is < 500 Wh/kg
Li – Air Battery

- Limited cycle life
- Complex mechanical system for introduction of oxygen
- Maximum achievable specific energy at pack level no better than Li metal with liquid electrolyte and conventional cathode
Solid State Lithium Metal Battery

Current Status:

- Significant world-wide interest (Strong belief that solid state is the future) - Eliminates safety challenges associated with liquids, provides better packing and stack designs
- Significant progress made in development of solid ceramic electrolytes with high ionic conductivity
- Solid state battery with solid state polymer electrolyte – 250 Wh/kg at cell level, potential for 400 Wh/kg at cell level (required 180°C operating temperature)

Challenges:

- Interfacial instability and lack of understanding of various interfacial phenomena
- Mechanical stability
- Low cycle life contributed by interfacial and mechanical instability
- Commercially scalable process for manufacturing of thin films
- Development of full cell

Significant Promise
Notional Progression of Battery Capability at Cell Level

Li Metal

1. **300 – 400 Wh/kg**
   - Li metal anode, sulfur cathode, liquid or solid electrolyte
   - Li metal anode, advanced cathode (High Ni - NMC or sulfur), Liquid electrolyte
   - Li metal anode + high temperature polymer electrolyte

2. **400 – 500 Wh/kg**
   - Li metal anode, sulfur cathode, liquid or solid electrolyte

3. **300 - >500 Wh/kg**
   - Li metal, all solid state

Li ion

1. **300 Wh/kg**
   - Si anode, advanced cathode (e.g., High Ni), liquid electrolyte

SOA – 250 Wh/kg at cell level
Projected Advances in Battery Technology

Rate of increase in specific energy is typically on the order of 5 – 8% per year
Specific energy loss from cell to pack is typically 50 to 60%

Assuming 8% increase per year at cell level

Innovation required in:
- New chemistries and materials for cells
- Pack design and integration
Key Takeaways

- DOE, battery industry, academia, National Labs will drive to 300 Wh/kg at pack level (~400 Wh/kg at cell level) for automotive and industrial applications, but will not be focused on electric aircraft applications
  - 2022 – 2025 timeframe likely (optimistic ??)
  - Need to demonstrate applicability to aircraft through verification of performance, safety, and integration
- Beyond the 400 Wh/kg capability at cell level, aeronautics community can focus on developing batteries with 600 Wh/kg specific energy at cell level (400 – 500 Wh/kg at pack level), which is achievable and not impossible
  - Not current focus for DOE, battery industry, and national labs
- Specific energy on the order of > 700 Wh/kg at pack level is extremely difficult to achieve with the current knowledge, almost impossible at this time
- Need detailed system level analysis for different classes of aircraft and different missions

Aeronautics community lead is necessary to champion development of aircraft materials, cells and packs
Potential Scenario for Electrified Aircraft

Current capability, 150 – 170 Wh/kg

- 2-3 passenger, CTOL, 200 miles, all electric
- 2 – 3 passenger, VTOL, 40-50 miles, all electric
- 6 – 10 passenger, CTOL, 300 – 600 miles, all electric

- 4 – 10 passenger, VTOL, 60 – 200 miles, all electric
- 30 passenger, CTOL, 300 miles, all electric
- 50-70 passenger, CTOL, 300 miles, hybrid electric
- Light utility helicopter, 100 miles, hybrid electric
- Extended range for everything in Box 1

- 50 – 70 passenger, CTOL, > 300 miles, all electric ??
- 100 -150 passenger, CTOL, 300 miles, hybrid electric ??
- VTOL - Multi-mission helicopter, hybrid electric, 100 miles ?
- Extended range for everything in Box 2

Pack level

- 250 Wh/kg
- Current capability
- 300 Wh/kg
- 400 - 500 Wh/kg
- > 750 Wh/kg

Cell level

- Potentially achievable in 2022-25 timeframe with non-NASA investment
- Need validation for aircraft application
- Challenging, but achievable in 2030 timeframe, will need leadership from aeronautics community
- Extremely challenging, may be impossible with current knowledge

Pack level

- 250 Wh/kg
- Current capability
- 300 Wh/kg
- 400 - 500 Wh/kg
- > 750 Wh/kg

Cell level

- 250 Wh/kg
- Current capability
- 300 Wh/kg
- 400 - 500 Wh/kg
- > 750 Wh/kg

Pack level

- 250 Wh/kg
- Current capability
- 300 Wh/kg
- 400 - 500 Wh/kg
- > 750 Wh/kg

Cell level

- Potentially achievable in 2022-25 timeframe with non-NASA investment
- Need validation for aircraft application
- Challenging, but achievable in 2030 timeframe, will need leadership from aeronautics community
- Extremely challenging, may be impossible with current knowledge

Potential Scenario for Electrified Aircraft

Current capability, 150 – 170 Wh/kg

- 2-3 passenger, CTOL, 200 miles, all electric
- 2 – 3 passenger, VTOL, 40-50 miles, all electric
- 6 – 10 passenger, CTOL, 300 – 600 miles, all electric

- 4 – 10 passenger, VTOL, 60 – 200 miles, all electric
- 30 passenger, CTOL, 300 miles, all electric
- 50-70 passenger, CTOL, 300 miles, hybrid electric
- Light utility helicopter, 100 miles, hybrid electric
- Extended range for everything in Box 1

- 50 – 70 passenger, CTOL, > 300 miles, all electric ??
- 100 -150 passenger, CTOL, 300 miles, hybrid electric ??
- VTOL - Multi-mission helicopter, hybrid electric, 100 miles ?
- Extended range for everything in Box 2

- 737 type hybrid electric aircraft with at least 900 mile range, CTOL
- Extended range for everything in Box 3
Potential for Innovation in Packing and Integration

- Specific energy loss from cell to pack is typically on the order of 30 – 40 %, could be as high as 50% for some applications - opportunity to increase specific energy at pack level through innovation in packing and integration
- Potential concepts:
  - Lightweight container structure (e.g., cellular, lattice block)
  - Multifunctional structures with load carrying capability for packaging materials
  - Advanced thermal management techniques (e.g., phase change materials if cost is not a factor, high conductivity materials)
  - Integrated thermal management – system approach to cool battery packs
  - Polymer heat exchangers
  - Larger cells
- Innovation in battery health management – improved techniques/models (including move to software-based system) for state-of-charge and state-of-health estimation
Non-Li Battery System to Watch

- Al – air
- Mg – air
- Zn-air
- Flow batteries

Schematic of Flow Battery
Role of Aeronautics Community in Battery Development

• Accelerate development of 300 Wh/kg battery pack (400 Wh/kg cell) for electrified aircraft application by
  – Developing innovative packing technologies
  – Studying safety of battery system and optimizing battery system for safety
  – Generating performance data under aircraft operating conditions and optimizing battery system for balancing performance and safety
  – Developing and validating battery performance and durability models

• Provide leadership for development of 400 – 500 Wh/kg battery pack (600 Wh/kg cell) system leveraging resources in Dept. of Energy, National Labs, battery industry, and academia

• Conduct system analysis to identify battery requirements for various classes of aircraft and various missions